Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee 2 May 2006

From: Head of Legal and Administration

Nominations to Scottish Liaison Group on Radioactive Waste Management

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is for Members to submit nominations for appointment of a substantive and substitute Member to the newly created Scottish Liaison Group on Radioactive Waste Management. The Group was created at the March meeting of the COSLA Leader's meeting.
- 1.2 A copy of the Terms of Reference of the Group and the covering letter from Dundee City Council (who are providing the secretariat for the Group) are attached as Appendix 1.
- 1.3 Although the request is for the nomination of one Member, I propose it would be useful if a substitute Member was also nominated.

2.0 Links to Corporate Priorities

2.1 This report delivers the Corporate Plan Priority: Managing Waste Effectively.

3.0 Background

3.1 Appendix 1 summarises the purpose of the Group, its Remit and Terms of Reference and Aims. As advised in section 1.1 above, the Group has only recently been formed. It is intended that meetings will be held as appropriate.

4.0 Financial Implications

4.1 Nominations and subsequent appointments to the Group will be deemed to be an approved duty of the Council. Expenses in relation to attending meetings will be met from the Members' Travel Budget.

5.0 Policy and Delegated Authority

- 5.1 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.
- 5.2 Expenses incurred by Members in attending meetings etc. are only recoverable if they form part of an approved duty. An approved duty arises from an appointment by, or decision of, the Council.

6.0 Recommendation

- 6.1 I recommend that the Committee:
 - 6.1.1 nominate one substantive and one substitute Member for appointment to the Scottish Liaison Group on Radioactive Waste Management and recommend to the Council that the appointments should be deemed an approved duty of the Council.

10 April 2006 DH Report No. LA-20-F



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

2 May 2006

From: Service Manager – Trading Standards

Environmental Services

Infrastructure Services Department

Report No: ES-11-06-F

Enforcement of legislation controlling the supply of tobacco and other agerestricted products

1 Introduction

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to inform Members of the Trading Standards Service's plans to participate in a national Scottish project to test the compliance of retailers with the law prohibiting the sale of cigarettes (and other age-restricted products) to young people under the age of sixteen.
- 1.2 Section 6 of the **Children and Young Persons** (**Protection from Tobacco**) **Act 1991** places a duty on each local authority in Scotland to consider, at least once in every period of twelve months, the extent to which it is appropriate for them to carry out in their area a programme of enforcement action relating to section 18 of the Children and Young Persons (Scotland) Act 1937 (sale of tobacco, etc to persons under 16), and sections 3 (sale of unpackaged cigarettes) and 4 (display of warning statements in retail premises and on vending machines) of the 1991 Act.
- 1.3 The programme of enforcement action is prescribed by the 1991 Act, and may include all or any of the following:
 - 1.3.1 the investigation of complaints in respect of alleged offences;
 - 1.3.2 the taking of other measures intended to reduce the incidence of offences; and
 - 1.3.3 the monitoring of vending machines for the sale of tobacco.
- 1.4 The Trading Standards Service also reports annually, to the Scottish Executive, on the Council's activities under this legislation.

2. Link to Council Priorities

2.1 The Trading Standards Service's activities in relation to the law prohibiting the sale of cigarettes (and other age-restricted products) to young people under the age of sixteen support the Corporate Plan priorities of Improving Health and Active Citizenship.

3 Background

- 3.1 As part of their routine inspections of businesses selling tobacco products, enforcement officers of the Trading Standards Service ensure that traders in Shetland are complying with their legal duty to display warning notices in retail premises and on vending machines.
- 3.2 The Council, through the Dialogue Youth initiative, offers a Young Scot card to all young people in Shetland between the ages of 13 to 18. Each card bears the holder's date of birth and can, among its many benefits, be used as an accredited proof of age. As part of this initiative, the Trading Standards Service supplied all relevant Shetland traders with a pack containing support materials and guidance to encourage, advise and assist them to ask purchasers for some proof of age (such as a passport, driving licence or Young Scot card) before supplying certain products (such as cigarettes) to people who appear to be below the appropriate age, in order to help them to comply with their legal obligations in relation to the supply of age-restricted products. Officers also use their routine inspections of such businesses to discuss with retailers their experience of the practicalities of complying with this legislation, and to offer further encouragement, advice and assistance to support compliance.
- 3.3 Following a successful pilot project in four Scottish local authorities, the Lord Advocate has given permission for all Scottish Trading Standards Services to use young people to undertake test purchasing of tobacco, fireworks and other age-restricted products. (Members should note, however, that this permission does not extend to allowing young people to undertake test purchasing of alcohol). The nationally agreed protocol (see Appendix A) for this work contains a number of safeguards to ensure that the safety and welfare of the young volunteers involved is accorded the highest priority throughout the exercise. These safeguards include following the requirements of the Regulation of Investigatory Powers (Juveniles) (Scotland) Order 2002, which are designed to ensure that:
 - the safety and welfare of the child is fully considered;
 - the officer is satisfied that any risk is properly explained to, and understood by, the child; and
 - a risk assessment is undertaken, covering the physical dangers and the moral and psychological aspects of the child's deployment.

3.4 Through the summer of 2006, Trading Standards Services in local authorities across Scotland will be participating in a national Scottish project to test the compliance of retailers with the law prohibiting the sale of cigarettes (and other age-restricted products) to young people under the age of sixteen. The project will involve publicity to remind retailers of their responsibilities, and will then use young volunteers to attempt to make such purchases.

4 Proposal

4.1 It is proposed that the Trading Standards Service participates in this summer's national Scottish project to test the compliance of retailers with the law prohibiting the sale of cigarettes (and other age-restricted products) to young people under the age of sixteen.

5 Financial Implications

5.1 There are no direct financial implications arising from this report, as the work can be carried out within the Trading Standards Service's existing resources.

6 Policy and Delegated Authority

- 6.1 The Council delegated its responsibility under section 6 of the Children and Young Persons (Protection from Tobacco) Act 1991 to the Environmental Services Committee (Min Ref SIC 158/97).
- 6.2 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit, which includes matters relating to Consumer Protection, (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.
- 6.3 The Services Committee has approved the Council's participation in the Dialogue Youth initiative (Min Ref SIC 54/03).

7 Conclusion

- 7.1 The consideration of this report will discharge the Council's duty imposed by section 6 of the Children and Young Persons (Protection from Tobacco) Act 1991.
- 7.2 Participation by the Trading Standards Service in this summer's national Scottish project to test the compliance of retailers with the law prohibiting the sale of cigarettes (and other age-restricted products) to young people under the age of sixteen will support the Corporate Plan priorities of Improving Health and Active Citizenship.

8 Recommendations

8.1 I recommend that the Infrastructure Committee notes the contents of this report.

Report Number: ES-11-06-F

SCOTTISH TEST PURCHASING PROTOCOL FOR AGE RESTRICTED PRODUCTS.

Introduction

This document sets out the operating protocol to be adopted by those Authorities which intend to pursue criminal proceedings based on evidence obtained through the use of children (or young people) to test purchase age restricted goods.

This protocol draws heavily on the Code of Best Practice on the involvement of children and young people in the enforcement of legislation concerning the sale of age-restricted goods which was prepared for use in England and Wales (where test purchasing is permitted) by LACORS/TSI. It has been prepared in consultation with the Society of Chief Officers of Trading Standards in Scotland, CoSLA, LACORS, the Scottish Executive, Crown Office, industry representatives, health interest agencies and groups under the auspices of the Tobacco Control White Paper Enforcement Protocol Sub-Group.

1. Context

- 1.1 Local authorities throughout the UK have the responsibility for the enforcement of legislation relating to the sale of age-restricted products such as cigarettes, gas lighter refills, alcohol and fireworks.
- 1.2 The Code takes account of the Human Rights Act 1998, the Regulation of Investigatory Powers (Scotland) Act 2000 and will be subject to periodic review to take account of legal and case law precedents and practice by local authorities. This code takes account of the differing legal framework in which test purchasing will operate in Scotland.

2.0 General

- 2.1 Local authorities have adopted a number of strategies to assess compliance with the legislation. These have included:
 - Carrying out a programme of education by means of publicity, letters to retailers etc:
 - Implementing Proof of Age Schemes;
 - Carrying out test purchasing exercises and taking appropriate enforcement action in case of infringements.
- 2.2 Decisions on enforcement policy and action may need to reflect local needs and circumstances. This guidance is intended as a 'best practice' guide and does not preclude variation or adaptation by Local Authorities when appropriate. However, variation should not be considered beyond the substantive protective measures designed to ensure fairness to the accused and especially those which ensure the welfare of test purchase volunteers (particularly those under 16 years of age).

A summary of the main pieces of legislation which impose restrictions on products is shown below:

PRODUCT	AGE	LEGISLATION	
Videos	12, 15, 18	certificate.	
Cigarettes	16	Children and Young Persons (Scotland) Act 1937– It is an offence to sell any tobacco or cigarette papers to a person under the age of 16. This Act also covers the sale of cigarettes from vending machines. Children and Young Persons (Protection from Tobacco) Act 1991 – It is an offence to fail to display the statutory notice at a premise where cigarettes are sold by retail.	
National Lottery	16	National Lottery etc Act 1993 - National Lottery Regulations 1994 – It is an offence for a National Lottery ticket to be sold by or to a person who has not attained the age of 16.	
Offensive Weapons	16	Criminal Justice Act 1988 (as amended by the Offensive Weapons Act 1996) – It is an offence to sell knives, razor blades and other bladed articles to any person under the age of 16. (Exemptions include folding pocketknives if the cutting edge is less than 7.62 centimeters long and razor blades that are permanently enclosed in a cartridge or housing).	
Fireworks 16		Explosives Act 1875 – It is an offence to sell the following to any person under 16: caps, cracker snaps, novelty matches, party poppers, serpents and throwdowns.	
	18	Consumer Protection Act 1987 Fireworks (Safety) Regulations 1997 – It is an offence to supply any firework to any person under the age of 18.	
Spray Paints	16	Section 122 of the Antisocial Behaviour etc (Scotland) Act 2004 introduced a ban on the sale of spray paint to under 16s in Scotland.	
Solvents	18	It is a criminal offence under common law to indulge in willful or reckless actions, which cause real injury to another person, hence it is an offence to willfully or recklessly supply dangerous volatile substances.	
Petroleum	16	Petroleum (Consolidation) Act 1928 - It is an offence to sell or dispense petrol to a person under the age of 16.	
Cigarette Lighter Refills	18	Consumer Protection Act 1987 Cigarette Lighter Refill (Safety) Regulations 1999 – It is an offence to supply a cigarette lighter refill canister containing butane or a substance with butane as a constituent part to any person under the age of 18	
Alcohol	18	Licensing (Scotland) Act 1976 – It is an offence to sell intoxicating liquor to a person under the age of 18. Also it is an offence to buy alcohol whilst under 18, therefore for test purchasing purposes it is illegal for authorities to seek the assistance of children for this purpose as the test purchasers will themselves be committing an offence. (This principle is true also for the test purchasing of Crossbows – below.)	
Crossbows	17	Crossbows Act 1987; It is an offence for a person to sell, or let or hire a crossbow or part of a crossbow to a person under 17. (Or for a person under 17 to buy a crossbow)	

4.0 Test Purchase Exercises

4.1 The guidance set out below is regarded as best practice in relation to the use of children/young persons utilised by Local Authorities for the test purchasing of age restricted products. Paramount consideration MUST be given to the health and welfare of any children/young persons involved - PARTICULARLY child volunteers under 16. Volunteers over 16 may not require the same strict amount of supervision and protective measures, however officers should not assume a degree of maturity and experience based on age alone. A risk assessment should be made of the volunteer prior to test purchasing in order to inform the officers about the degree of care and supervision required. Local authorities should have close regard for the detailed guidance set out in the remaining paragraphs. They should also take into account that decisions about particular test purchasing exercises will need to reflect local needs and circumstances.

Selection of children/young persons.

- 4.2 Local authorities should ensure that there is full consultation with the child/young person and the child/young person's parent(s)/guardian(s) on all the issues involved.
 - a) Participation must be entirely voluntary and have the consent of the child/young person and his/her parent(s) or guardian(s).
 - b) The child/young person's parent/guardian must fully understand the nature of the task involved and give written consent. In particular it is prudent to mention there exists a slight risk that the child/young volunteer may ultimately have to give evidence in court and that the operation will be conducted in such a manner as to avoid this happening wherever possible. The protections offered to child witnesses under the law when giving evidence, e.g. Vulnerable Witnesses (Scotland) Act 2004, could perhaps be discussed with the parents where appropriate.
 - c) Children or young persons who are relatives of local authority staff may assist, but volunteers from other sources should normally be given preference.
 - d) Any child/young person who appears to be over-eager to obtain a purchase should not be selected. Whilst at the discretion of individual Local Authorities, it is recommended that children should be at least 18 months younger than the legal minimum age for the purchase of the product in question. Therefore, for tobacco, petroleum, lottery tickets, etc., it is recommended that the child volunteer should be 14 ½ years or younger. The assistance of children under the age of thirteen years of age should not be sought for any test purchase. This age has been chosen as this would be the age at which a person could legally be employed. Although test purchasing is not considered to be employment in that no remuneration is provided, the above age reflects the legal minimum and represents good practice which has been exercised by many authorities. (See 4.4 below)

- e) Consequently, where the legal purchase age of the product is 18, i.e. butane gas refills, fireworks and '18' classified videos, the young volunteer should be no older than 16 ½ years.
- f) Consideration should be given to the clothing and make up (if appropriate) worn by the test purchaser as this may affect the determination of the age of the purchaser.
- g) If the test purchase is for the purpose of obtaining evidence for possible prosecution, then before a decision is made officers should ensure that a witness statement has been obtained to prove the child/young person's date of birth. A copy of the birth certificate should be supplied by the young person or a parent/guardian. A child cannot prove his/her own date of birth.

Welfare of Children/Young Persons

- 4.3 In carrying out test purchasing exercises, local authorities will ensure that the welfare considerations of the child are paramount.
 - a) A child/young person engaged in a test purchase exercise on behalf of a local authority on the basis set out above would not be deemed to be "employed" by virtue of Section 28(1) of the Children and Young Persons (Scotland) Act 1937. However, any restrictions on hours of working or other conditions imposed by any relevant legislation or child employment bylaws should be considered during the planning stage of an exercise. The actual duration will depend on the age of the child/young person, his/her wishes and parental/guardian consent. The local authority should not provide any monetary remuneration, payment in kind or other reward to the child/young person, parents, school, or organisation to avoid any allegations or suggestions of inducement or entrapment. However, meals and travelling expenses should be provided where appropriate and local authorities should only consider the use of paid child actors in exceptional circumstances
 - b) The anonymity of the child/young person is an important consideration during test purchases. They should not be asked to make test purchases in an area where they are likely to be recognised, such as near their home, school, club, etc.
 - c) Colour photographs may be used in legal proceedings showing the appearance of the child/young person. Such photographs should be taken to clearly illustrate the height of the child or young person, perhaps against a height chart. Photos should be taken on the day of the proposed transaction and as near to the transaction/activity time as possible, given operational considerations. Officers may wish to consider requesting a copy of the retailer's CCTV tape with the relevant purchase on it in addition to any other evidence, although depending on the legislation being enforced the retailer may refuse such a request.

- d) The child/young person should be supervised at all times. A minimum of two officers should accompany the child during the exercise although this may not be such a strict requirement for young people older than 16 One officer, ideally of the same sex as the child/young person, should be responsible for the child/young person's safety and welfare for the duration of the exercise.
- e) The seller should not be approached by an officer until the child/young person has left the premises, unless the seller acts in any way which the officer believes may be prejudicial to the volunteer's welfare. In these circumstances the officer should declare themselves, ask the young person to leave the premises to a safe place and then explain the situation to the trader.
- f) Officers should consider the age and maturity of the child/young person during the test purchase exercise and ensure that any hazards or risks are assessed and minimised in that context. For example where a child has to cross a busy road then the officer should escort him/her to within a safe distance of the premises.
- g) If at any time during the exercise the child/young person indicates that he/she does not wish to continue, or he/she shows signs of distress, the exercise with that volunteer must stop.
- h) If, whilst in the care of the officer the child/young person is injured or suffers loss or damage to his/her property, the incident must be reported to the parent/guardian and the appropriate Head of Service officer without delay.
- i) The officer's decision on any matter relating to the volunteer's welfare should be final.

Role of officers and children/young persons.

- 4.4 Officers and children/young persons should ensure that any test purchase is made in the same manner as a member of the public may have done in the normal course of events.
 - a) If the exercise is likely to result in prosecution it should be organised in such a way as to minimise the risk of a volunteer being called as a witness. As a precautionary measure however a witness statement should be taken from the child/young person after each test purchase attempt where a sale is made and the reason for doing so fully explained. These statements may prove valuable in any subsequent re-visits or for evaluation purposes. However in exceptional cases a child/young person may be asked to attend court as a witness. Officers who accompany the volunteer whilst he/she attempts to make a purchase will provide the evidence of any sale.
 - b) The child/young person must be made fully aware of the purpose of the exercise and given appropriate training. He/she must be told exactly what to say and what not to say. He/she should also be photographed on the day of the transaction/activity and as near to the transaction activity time as possible, given operational considerations.

- c) The child/young person should be asked to confirm that they do not have any money or target product on their person before a purchase is attempted. This should be confirmed by asking him/her to turn out their pockets in front of both officers. The officers should then give the test purchaser a specific amount of money to be used for the test transaction.
- d) The child/young person must be told to answer all questions, which may be asked by the seller, truthfully. In particular he/she must give their correct age, if challenged. In addition, if asked whether there is anyone with them, the child/young person must be told to identify the officer present.
- e) If the child/young person's initial request is refused, he/she must be told not to attempt to persuade or coerce the seller to make a sale.
- f) If the child/young person's initial request is refused, he/she must be told to leave the premises and return to a predetermined location.
- g) If possible two officers should observe the transaction (e.g. in a supermarket). Operational considerations mean that it will not always be possible to have two officers present. In circumstances where there is only one person in the premises capable of selling to the young person, one officer present will be sufficient. Where there is more than one person present selling the product consideration should be given to filming the transaction by the officer present. Where appropriate one officer should enter the premises before the child/young person. The officer should locate him/herself in a position where he/she can clearly observe and hear the attempted purchase. The test purchase volunteer should not appear to be with the officer.
- h) Local Authorities must carry out Disclosure Scotland 'enhanced disclosure' checks to confirm the suitability of all officers involved in test purchasing exercises that involve children.
- i) The above protocol represents best practice which participating authorities will comply with where possible. Where this is not possible authorities will gather whatever evidence is possible and submit this to their Procurator Fiscal.

5.0 Human Rights/Exclusion of Evidence

5.1 Prior to the Human Rights Act 1998 (HRA) and the Regulation of Investigatory Powers (Scotland) 2000 (RIPSA) coming into force the use of undercover officers by the police and other enforcement agencies, for test purchasing or other functions, was not regulated by statute.

In Scotland, the position on exclusion of evidence is governed by the general common law rules on the admissibility of evidence in criminal proceedings which require there to be an assessment on whether the admission of the evidence will be fair to the accused. In the context of test purchasing, Scots law recognises that certain evidence of the commission of a crime is inadmissible where it has been obtained by entrapment e.g. a police officer disguising him or herself and inciting the accused to commit a crime. Such an argument is likely to succeed only where it can be said that the accused would not have committed the offence but for the inducement and was not already predisposed or willing to commit crimes of the kind involved.

Appeal cases in which children have been used to make test purchases include:

- Tesco Stores Limited v Brent LBC [1993] 2 All ER 718
- Hereford and Worcester County Council v T & S Stores Plc (1994) 93 LGR 98
- LB of Ealing v Woolworths Plc [1995] Crim LR 58

The judgment in R v Looseley and Attorney General's Reference (No. 3 of 2000) [2001] UKHL 53, provides authority for test purchasing in regulatory matters to be conducted on a random basis, i.e. without prior suspicion of offence(s) having been committed.

- 5.3 Part II RIPSA provides a statutory basis to safeguard against challenges under Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). They create a system of authorisations for various types of surveillance and the conduct and use of covert human intelligence sources (CHIS).
- 5.4 A child/young person will be acting as a CHIS or 'source' under section 1(7) of RIPSA if he/she:
 - a) Establishes or maintains a personal or other relationship with a person for the covert purpose of facilitating the doing of anything falling within paragraph (b) or (c);
 - b) Covertly uses such a relationship to obtain information or to provide access to any information to another person;
 - c) Covertly discloses information obtained by the use of such a relationship or as a consequence of the existence of such a relationship.
- 5.5 There is unlikely to be RIPSA implications where a child/young person is used to carry out a test purchase from retail premises, as the he/she does not establish or maintain any relationship with the retailer

- 5.6 However, even where a child volunteer is not deemed to be a CHIS, it may still be considered good practice to follow the requirements of the Regulation of Investigatory Powers (Juveniles) (Scotland) Order 2002 (SSI 2002/206) i.e. to ensure that -
 - The safety and welfare of the child has been fully considered;
 - The officer is satisfied that any risk has been properly explained to, and understood by the child; and
 - A risk assessment has been undertaken, covering the physical dangers and the moral and psychological aspect of the child's deployment.
 - A record is kept

In the vast majority of test purchase exercises, it is likely that there will be minimal risk to the child/young volunteer involved.

- 5.7 In the light of the ECHR, HRA and RIPSA together with the general common law rules on the admissibility of evidence in criminal proceedings in Scotland those involved in the planning and conducting of test purchasing exercises will need to have regard to:
 - a) The avoidance of inciting, instigating, persuading, pressurising or wheedling a
 person into committing an offence that, otherwise, would not have been
 committed and the particular need for a child/young person test purchaser to
 behave as 'an ordinary member of the public' in such circumstances;
 - b) The requirements for gathering/retaining relevant, admissible and sufficient evidence an "unassailable" record of events in order to prove the commission of an offence and to ensure that a fair trial takes place;
 - c) The necessity of ensuring that any interference with the right to privacy, of any person affected by the activity, is lawful; in particular the need for public authorities to consider whether it is conduct which could be authorised under RIPSA:
 - d) Other specific issues, such as legislative provisions.

Protocol Version 1 - Last Amended 29th July 2005.



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

02 May 2006

From: Head of Environmental Services

Infrastructure Services Department

PROVISION OF NEW TOILETS FOR THE ESPLANADE, LERWICK – PROGRESS REPORT

1 Introduction

- 1.1 On 29 November 2005 (Minute Reference 68/05) the Infrastructure Committee agreed to proceed with the provision of new toilets for The Esplanade as part of the redevelopment of Harbour House in partnership with the Lerwick Port Authority (LPA).
- 1.2 At this time delegated authority was given to the Executive Director Infrastructure Services (or his nominee) to negotiate with the LPA and to conclude a lease based on a suitable rental and/or payment of a capital sum for the facility not exceeding £422,000.
- 1.3 This report provides a progress update on the matter following a new proposal from the LPA.

2 Links to Council Priorities

2.1 The provision of public toilet facilities delivers the Corporate Plan priority of benefiting people and communities.

3 Lerwick Port Authority Proposal

- 3.1 The LPA Board considered the redevelopment of Harbour House at its meeting in March 2006. The estimated costs of the development were higher than originally projected and the development was regarded to be financially unviable to the LPA. As indicated in their letter of the 23 March 2006, see Appendix 1.
- 3.2 The LPA now propose that:
- 3.2.1 the LPA is prepared to make available the yard site to the north side of Harbour House to the Council for building new toilets;

- 3.2.2 the LPA is interested in acquiring the site of the present toilets in order to develop a reception pavilion for cruise ship passengers.
- 3.3 The LPA are now seeking a response from the Council to this new proposal.
- 3.4 Members may recall that at the meeting of Infrastructure Committee on 29 November 2005 it was regarded preferable that new toilets be built on the west side of The Esplanade, rather than build a new facility on the site of the existing toilets.
- 3.5 A preliminary inspection of the Harbour House yard site indicates that the area of land is large enough to build new toilets, especially if the extension attached to the north side of the building is removed, as proposed by the LPA.
- 3.6 It is considered by the LPA if this option is to be pursued that "acquisition of the sites is completed in an acceptable manner, sympathetic to both organisations overall aspirations"
- 3.7 Should the Infrastructure Committee agree to consider the LPA proposal then :
 - 3.7.1 discussions can take place on land acquisition; and
 - 3.7.2 plans in consultation with the Council's Planning Services and provisional costs can be developed by the Council's Capital Programme Service on the design of a new toilet.
- 3.8 The option still remains for the Council to pursue a rebuild on the existing site at an estimated cost of £308,000.

4 Financial Implications

4.1 On 29 November 2005 the Infrastructure Committee agreed to the provision of new toilets to the value of £422,000 capital expenditure. The costs for this alternative proposal will still have to be assessed.

5 Policy and Delegated Authority

- The Infrastructure Committee has delegated authority to implement decisions relating to matters within its remit (SIC Minute Reference 19/03 and 70/03) for which overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.
- 5.2 However, matters relating to the Capital Programme stand addressed to the Council (Minute Reference 122/03).

6 Conclusion

6.1 The LPA's proposal meets the Council's preferred option to build a new toilet on the west side of The Esplanade. Further work is required to determine if this can be built within the existing agreed budget.

7 Recommendation

- 7.1 I recommend that the Infrastructure Committee
 - 7.1.1 gives delegated authority to the Executive Director Infrastructure Services (or his nominee), in consultation with the Asset and Properties Manager to pursue the proposal from the Lerwick Port Authority as outlined in paragraph 3.2 subject to costs being within the existing agreed budget of £422,000. (Any increase in costs over budget will be referred back to this Committee); or
 - 7.1.2 develops a new build on the site of the existing toilets.

Report Number: ES-12-06-F



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

02 May 2006

From: Waste Services Manger

Environmental Services

Infrastructure Services Department

ROVA HEAD LANDFILL CLOSURE

1 Introduction

1.1 With the closure of Rova Head Landfill there is a requirement for the Council to complete restoration works to cap the site to prevent water ingress, production of Leachate and to stabilise the Landfill. This report identifies the costs associated with this restoration and seeks approval to proceed with the works.

2 Links with Corporate Plan

2.1 Looking after where we live- Protects the environment through proper management and control of old landfill

3 Background

- 3.1 Following approval from SEPA of our initial proposals for restoration of Rova Head, survey work has been carried out to determine the optimum solutions for capping the site and ensuring site stability. Analysis of the waste across the site and Leachate has taken place and final plans are being developed which will require further approval from SEPA.
- 3.2 There is a legal requirement for the Council to complete this work, failure to do so within the next 2 years could lead to prosecution and jeopardise service provision. Options for restoration are being investigated and the final proposal will seek to utilise the best available techniques to provide the required environmental protection at minimum cost.
- 3.3 Due to the nature of the site and steepness of some slopes current estimated costs for restoration vary between £2,450,000 and £3,350,000 depending on the type of capping material we are required to use.

- 3.4 These cost exclude a Leachate treatment plant on the site as we are currently negotiating with SEPA to utilise the new plant on the Gremista Landfill site.
- 3.5 Rova Head will not be allowed to accept waste for disposal beyond August 2006 and all materials for restoration works must on site by August 2007.
- 3.6 The final profiles are shown in Appendix 1. The site after capping with an impermeable membrane will be covered with a layer of peat and reseeded. The site will continue to be maintained and monitored over the next twenty years.

4 Financial Implications

- 4.1 It is estimated that £850,000 will be required in 2006/7 and £2,500,000 in 2007/8 assuming the most expensive restoration system is required. There may be significant savings on this should we be able to minimise the use of bentonite in favour of HDPE lining.
- 4.2 The project has been recommended by CPMT on 24th April 2006.

5 Policy and Delegated authority

5.1 All matters relating to waste Management are delegated to Infrastructure services (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03).

6 Recommendations

- 6.1 I recommend Infrastructure Committee approve
 - i) The works required for restoration of Rova Head Landfill.

Report No: ES-10-06-F



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

2 May 2006

From: Network Manager, Roads

SIC (Meadowbank Road, Burravoe, Yell) (Prohibition of Waiting) Order 2006

1. Introduction

1.1 This report considers the background to the above proposed traffic order (see Appendix 1). It describes the consultation process and includes letters of objection from members of the public and Yell Community Council. A recommendation is made that a less extensive version of the original proposal be approved.

2. Links to Council Priorities

- 2.1 Key Aims of the Council's Local Transport Strategy include:
 - Reduction of social exclusion.
 - Improved safety for all road users, and
 - Promotion of better health and fitness.

2.2 Objectives include:

- improve environmental conditions by promoting traffic calming ensures an increase in the safety of all road users.
- make improvements to the road network in order to support gains in safety, environmental, accessibility, integration or economic terms.
- maximise facilities for walking and cycling as an alternative means of transport.

3. Background

3.1 The traffic order was promoted following a request from a resident of 11 Meadowbank Road. This request was made to the SIC Roads Service via the community occupational therapist employed by SIC, Social Work. The occupational therapist has visited the resident and made the assessment that

> due to her disability there is a need for "no parking signs or markings along the narrow stretch of road between the two sets of parking (along the fence by the drying green)". The length of road in question is shown on the attached plans.

4. Consultation

- 4.1 Traffic orders associated with disabled access are generally uncontroversial but often required urgently. Therefore, with orders of this type, it is normal to undertake only the minimum level of consultation required by the legislation. This involves sending letters, seeking comments, to the following parties:
 - Emergency services
 - Haulage company representatives
 - Local Council Member
 - Yell Community Council
- 4.2 There were only two responses at this stage. The first was from the Northern Constabulary who had no objections to the proposal. The second was from Yell Community Council who suggested a compromise whereby the yellow lines would only be introduced on the south side of the road. Copies of the letters are enclosed in Appendix 1 together with my reply.
- 4.3 The notice of proposal for the order was also advertised in the Shetland Times, on 17 February 2006, to give the general public an opportunity to object. This resulted in two further letters of objection from residents. Yell Community Council also altered their opinion at this time and formally objected to the introduction of any yellow lines in Meadowbank Road. Copies of these letters together with my replies are also enclosed in Appendix 2.
- 4.4 Since this proposed order has become more controversial than expected I decided to consult every household in the Meadowbank Road cul-de-sac. The residents were asked to express their preference for one of four options. A copy of the questionnaire and covering letter descriptions of each option are enclosed in Appendix 3. The date given for receipt of replies was prior to 1 May 2006 so the results will be available on the day of this meeting. The results to date (mid April 2006) are 3 responses out of 11 representing a 27% return. There is a total of 2 replies for Option A, 0 replies for Option B, 0 replies for Option C and 1 reply for Option D.

5. Conclusion

- 5.1 The grounds on which the residents made their objections are listed below:
 - (a) no other resident has had a problem with parking;
 - (b) yellow lines would "off-look the neighbourhood;"

- (c) a "Disabled Access Keep Clear" sign would be more appropriate and yellow lines are unlikely to be enforced regularly;
- (d) there has been no consultation with residents.
- 5.2 The Roads Service responses to these points are listed in turn below:
 - (a) the occupational therapist considers that, due to her disability, the resident would be disadvantaged if she does not have access to a parking space close to her home. This access has on occasion, been blocked by inconsiderate parking so yellow lines have been requested;
 - (b) the yellow lines that would be used in this situation are 50mm, wide rather than the usual 100mm, to have less visual impact;
 - (c) it is my opinion that yellow lines would be the most effective method of preventing inconsiderate parking on the length of road in question. There is no disputing their meaning or the length of road they relate to and even if seldom enforced I think they are a better option than a sign. Signs with "Disabled Access Keep Clear" have been tried elsewhere with mixed results;
 - (d) the residents were not consulted directly for the reasons mentioned in paragraph 4.1 above. However, objections were received from 2 residents following advertisement of the notice of proposal in the Shetland Times and the 11 directly affected households were subsequently consulted when it became apparent that this proposal was being disputed.
- 5.3 The conclusion I have reached is that the most appropriate solution is to prohibit parking on the south side of the cul-de-sac and at the junction with the Burravoe village road. This meets the resident's needs and the requirements of the Highway Code (i.e. vehicles should not be parked within 10 metres of a junction). A space should also be removed from the parking area to make it easier for vehicles to manoeuvre. These measures would result in the loss of only one legitimate parking space. This is because the yellow lines, with the exception of one space, would only be marked on lengths of road where parked vehicles would cause an obstruction anyway.

6. Financial Implications

6.1 The funds required for the yellow lines and associated signs would be met from the Traffic Management Capital Rolling Programme. The estimated cost of providing these road markings and signs would be less than £500.

7. Policy and Delegated Authority

- 7.1 The Executive Director of Infrastructure Services has delegated authority to promote Traffic Orders and traffic calming measures. The Executive Director also has delegated authority to make Orders and install traffic calming where no objections have been received to the proposals at public consultation stage (Min Ref 04/198). However, in this instance there are objections to the proposals so the decision has to be referred to the Infrastructure Committee which has delegated authority in this situation (Min Ref 199/99).
- 7.2 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.

8. Recommendations

8.1 I recommend that the committee approve the making of an amended version of the originally proposed order that would result in the loss of only one legitimate parking space in the cul-de-sac. This amendment is described in paragraph 5.3 above and is shown by the plan titled Option B in Appendix 3.

NH/SMG

RD-04-06-F



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee 02 May 2006

From: Head of Roads

Infrastructure Services Department

CAPITAL ROLLING PROGRAMMES, ROADS AND TRANSPORT SCHEMES AND PURCHASES, 2006/2007

1 Introduction

- 1.1 In this report, I seek approval for the updated list of schemes to be constructed this year under the Roads and Transport Capital Rolling Programmes, and other programmes of roads improvements.
- 1.2 I also give Members a report on works carried out under these programmes in 2005/2006, see Appendix 1.

2 Roads and Transport Capital Rolling Programmes etc.

- 2.1 In December 2003, Committee approved the Review of the Action Plan for Maintenance, Improvement and Use of the Road Network and another review is now due to take place shortly. (Ref 40/03) However, since then significant changes have proved necessary to the list of schemes approved for 2006/2007, due to early starts on some schemes, delays to others, and technical and other needs changing. The updated list of schemes for approval is presented in Appendix 2.
- 2.2 In addition, the Council has been given the following three grants from Government which have been used to fund roads improvements of various kinds.
 - 2.2.1 "Quality of Life". This is a Council-wide Revenue grant, and the Roads element was described as covering "Traffic calming, village footways and street lighting, and other minor improvements". There is no Roads related element in 2006/2007.
 - 2.2.2 "20 Mph Limits, Safe Routes to School, and Home Zones". Appendix 3 includes my recommendations for spending the 2006/2007 Capital grant of £49,000. Please note that this Committee approved in March 2006 a policy on prioritisation, etc. of school schemes.

2.2.3 "Cycling, Walking and Safer Streets" My recommendations for spending this Capital grant this year (£39,000) are in Appendix 3.

3 Financial Implications

3.1 There are no financial implications arising directly out of this report, other than the allocation of actual schemes and purchases to budgets which have already been set.

4 Policy and Delegated Authority

- 4.1 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.
- 4.2 Roads and Transport Capital Rolling Programme policy was approved in November 1996, and authority was delegated at that time to Committee to decide upon individual schemes and purchases (Ref 94/96).

5 Recommendations

5.1 I recommend that Committee approve the lists of Roads and Transport schemes and purchases for 2006/2007 in Appendices 2 and 3.

Report Number RD-05-06-F

DJM/SMG

Appendix 1 Roads & Transport Capital Rolling Programmes, Completed Schemes - 05/06

Accident Investigations (AIP)				
Accident inv				
	Burra, Brake Brae Drainage including Brough Blind Summit			
Duidens C.C.	Weisdale, A971/Strom Park Access Road			
Bridges & S				
	Unst, Skaw Road Culvert			
_	Collafirth Northmavine, Barnafield Brig Replacement			
Footways &	Streetlighting			
	Veensgarth Link Road and Footways			
	Brae hardshoulder upgrade			
	Union Street, Footway Renewal			
	Lerwick, Gilbertson Road, Kerb Buildouts			
	Lerwick, Hillcrest Footway			
	Aith Village Footways			
Minor Wor	ks - Roads			
	Trondra - Old Schoolhouse Road			
	Burra, Meal - Bridge End passing place improvements (BT)			
	Burra, Duncansclett, Visitor Parking Area			
	Lerwick, Staney Hill Road, Carriageway Widening			
	Levenwick village general amenity improvements (DN)			
	Vementry Road, Passing Places & Visibility Improvements			
	Leans Junction - Sand			
	Sandwick, Oakdeane Cottage Turning Head and Drainage Improvement			
	Shurton, Drainage Improvements			
	Whalsay, Skaw Airstrip/Golf Club Turning Head			
Road Recon	structions			
	Lerwick, Bells Road Reconstruction (Phase 2)			
Streetlightin	ng Renewals			
	Lerwick, Greenfield Place/Greenrigg O/H cable removal			
	Burra, Hamnavoe, Glen Road Lighting Renewals			
	Lerwick, Clickimin Remote Footpath, Lighting Renewals			
	Scalloway, O/H cable removals Berry Road/Ingaville Rd. /Sycamore Ave (S).			
Traffic Management				
	Levenwick 30mph Speed Limit			
	1 1			

Quality of Life - Scottish Executive Grant Funded Schemes			
	Weisdale, South Whiteness Junction Improvements		
	Whiteness & Weisdale School, Installation of Bicycle Storage		
	Sandside, Midlea - Traffic Calming		

Weisdale, Kalliness Environmental Improvements
Lerwick, Leog Lane Turning Head and Parking Area
Lerwick, Mansefield, Lighting Renewals and re-surfacing etc.
Fetlar, Funzie - Bus Lay-by etc

Appendix 2	Roads & Transpo	rt Capital Rolling Programmes 06/07

Appendix 2	Roads & Transport Capital Rolling Programmes 06/07			
Minor Works		Status		
	Symbister to Marrister	Land		
	Catfirth Park & Ride (STP Funding)	Design		
	A971, Bixter Bus Marshalling - Park & Ride	Design/Land		
	Skerries, Minor Works	Ready		
	Ollaberry, Eastness Road - Turning Head Improvement	Ready		
	Lerwick, Parkfield Drainage Scheme	Design		
	Veensgarth House, Kerbing & Drainage Works	Ready		
	Burra, Duncansclett, Bus Turning Head	Design		
	A970, Channerwick, Landslide Preventative Measures	Ongoing		
Development F	Related Roads			
	Lerwick, Knab Road to AHS	Design		
Bridge Replace	ements			
	(Schemes will be assessed on technical grounds)			
Footways & St	reet Lighting			
	Whalsay, Surgery Footway, North Voe	Tender		
	Nesting School to Stendaal	Land		
	Lerwick, Market Street Footway Renewal	Ready		
	Mossbank, Upgrade Hard Verge to Footway, 175m	Design		
	Brae - Burravoe Footway & Camp Shop Junction	Land		
	Yell, Burravoe Footway	Land		
Street Lighting	Replacements			
	Mossbank, Maidenfield (X0406-100)	Ready		
	Scalloway, Westshore (X0200-180)	Ready		
	Scatness, Colonial Place (X0202-017)	Ready		
	Firth to Mossbank (X0406-030)	Ready		
	Scalloway, East Voe B9074-045	Ready		
Plant Purchas	es			
	Yell, Ice-Cast Station (replacement)			
Traffic Manage	ement			
	Lerwick, South Lochside	Design		
	Implementation of Traffic Orders	Ongoing		
Accident Infor	mation and Prevention			
	Trondra, Cauldhame Junction	Survey		
	Route Action Studies	Assessment		
	A970, Scalloway, Scord Bends Safety Improvements	Assessment		
Minor Works a	nd Purchases, Airstrips			
	(Schemes will be assessed on technical grounds)			

Minor Works and Purchases, Bus Services (Some Projects are Part Funded from the Transport Partnership)			
	General, Bus Shelter Provision/Replacement Ongoing		
Road Reconstruction			
	Lerwick, Bells Road	Ready	
Bressay, Heogan Road Land			
	Lerwick, Gilbertson Road, North	Design	

Appendix 3 Scottish Executive Grants and Additional Funding 2006/07

20mph Speed Limits, Safe Routes To School, and Home Zones		Status	
	Whiteness School Variable Speed Limit	Underway	
	Sound School	Implementation 2006/07	
	Scalloway School & Surrounds	Implementation 2006/07	
	Ollaberry	Consultation/Assessment	
	Urafirth	Consultation/Assessment	
	Brae	Consultation/Assessment	
	Nesting	Consultation/Assessment	
	Cunningsburgh	Consultation/Assessment	
	Anderson High School	Consultation/Assessment	
Cycling	, Walking & Safer Streets		
	Easterhoull to Blydoit Steps	Underway	
	Dunrossness, Turniebrae Remote Footpath	Implementation 2006/07	
	Secure Cycle Storage - Lerwick	Implementation 2006/07	
	Lerwick, Lanes Area Hand Rails	Assessment	



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

02 May 2006

From: Acting Head of Transport

Infrastructure Services Department

PROGRESS REPORT ON DEVELOPMENT OF SHETLAND TRANSPORT STRATEGY

1. Introduction

1.1. The purpose of this report is to inform members of the progress of the Shetland Transport Strategy.

2 Link to Council Priorities

2.1 This report meets the objectives of the corporate plan by contributing to the aim of sustainability and easy to use systems for transporting freight and people.

3. Background

- 3.1 Shetland Transport Partnership was established on the 1 December 2005 and has a statutory duty to deliver a transport strategy by the 31 March 2007. The Council had begun work to develop a transport strategy and it is proposed that Shetland Transport Partnership will adopt the work commissioned to date by the Council.
- 3.2 It is the intention that the Member Officer Working Group will continue to oversee the development of the Transport Strategy and report to the Shetland Transport Partnership.
- 3.3 The Shetland Transport Partnership has a duty to consult with the Council on the Strategy and it is therefore the intention that progress will be reported to Infrastructure Committee (which has delegated authority on transport matters) on the development of the Strategy.

4. Progress

4.1 FaberMaunsell have completed the first 2 phases of the process and a summary of the findings to date is included in Appendix 1.

4.2 The Member Officer Working Group on Transport Strategy on the 19 April 2006 considered a presentation by Paul Finch of FaberMaunsell on the main findings, the issues emerging and the programme for moving the strategy forward.

5. Financial Implications

5.1 There are no financial implications associated with this report. Costs for the consultation exercise are within budget

6. Policy and Delegated Authority

6.1 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.

7. Recommendation

7.1 I recommend that Infrastructure Committee note the contents of this report.

Report Number: TR-10-06-F

Infrastructure Committee - Tuesday 02 May 2006 Agenda Item No. 07 - Public Appendix Shetland Regional Transport Strategy

Issues, Objectives and Options Paper

Issued to Member Officers Working Group, 19 April 2006

1.1 Introduction

This paper presents and overview of the Key Issues, proposed Vision and Objectives, and range of options to be considered for the Transport Strategy.

The work collates the main findings from the consultation process, the background research and analysis, along with the work that has gone into developing the vision, objectives and options through the OWG workshops held in March 2006.

The paper will be finalised into the "Issues, Objectives and Options Paper" will be ultimately presented to the Scottish Executive as part of their "Assurance" process.

It also considers a set of "ground rules" or "principles" that the RTP should consider adopting, alongside the proposed vision and objectives.

1.2 Outline

This report contains six outline chapters, as follows:

- Chapter 2 Summary of consultation findings
- Chapter 3 Summary of drivers, constraints and uncertainties
- Chapter 4 Summary of current and future problems and opportunities
- Chapter 5 Sets the wider context for the RTP's Vision and Objectives
- Chapter 6 Proposed Vision and Principles
- Chapter 7 Shetland's Transport Objectives
- Chapter 8 External Objectives
- Chapter 9 Option Development

2. Consultation Findings

A consultation exercise was undertaken between October and January 2006.

The findings provide a "snapshot" during the period of consultation, and focus on community and stakeholder views and perceptions. They are presented below in a broad order of priority.

For external links, key findings were:

- High cost of services both for the provider, and the user (or those paying subsidies)
- Specific capacity issues most notably cabin space on the NorthLink service, and some reported peak period private vehicle constraint
- Accessibility issues to port and airport public transport access/integration and car parking
- Further consideration of contingencies required
- Keenness to see air and sea route development to grow the travelling market, but also provide improved accessibility / supply chain efficiencies

For inter-island links, key findings were:

- Desire for responsive, reliable, and "island-centred" services most acutely expressed on the smaller islands
- Desire for specific infrastructure investment at Skerries (dredging), and Fetlar (breakwater).
- Willingness to pursue Unst-Yell fixed link
- Concern over future replacement plans for vessels, and costs, leading to a broad desire for fixed links
- High level of service, and low cost to user widely recognised
- Positive impact of new Yell Sound service appreciated
- Some vehicle deck capacity issues raised, particularly Whalsay and Bluemull Sound
- Recognition of essential role played by both inter-island air and ferry services for fragile island communities
- Contribution of inter-islands air service particularly highlighted

For internal transport, key findings were:

- Communities have a desire for "safe walking routes" to key facilities despite low traffic volumes safe refuges on verges was commonly discussed
- High level of public transport provision recognised, and low fares welcomed
- Some sectors of the community looking for a public transport model which goes beyond current provision e.g. youths, convenient links to health centres etc.
- Road safety concerns, especially speeding, dangerous driving, and drink driving
- Some support for road improvements on West Side

In addition, some wider issues related to transport were raised during consultation, including the:

- Future cost and supply of fuel
- Importance of links to economic, planning, community and social agendas

3. Drivers, Constraints and Uncertainties

Key drivers influencing the shape of the RTS have been identified as follows.

- Economic development growth could be centred on fish processing, potential oil platform decommissioning, ICT, renewable energy, added value in food and drink, and manufacture and crafts. A potential reduction in public sector employment, and at SVT.
- Current economic trends tend to focus economic development in and around central Shetland, with the exception of initiatives fixed in location quarries, aquaculture, tourism.
- Specific future developments could include oil platform decommissioning, quarries, and fish processing facilities.
- General trend of population growth around the centre of Shetland (accessible rural areas), decline within Lerwick, decline in remote rural areas, and decline on the most fragile islands.
- Growth in tourism from Scandinavia, potential new markets from new air route from England. Potential growth in some niche markets eco-tourism, luxury breaks etc.
- Lower air fares for islands is likely to generate additional demand at Sumburgh
- National concessionary fares for may increase demand on the public transport service
- Future rises in fuel prices may being to reduce growth in car use in the future
- Increased use of ICT may increase home and flexi working opportunities
- Few constraints at present on physical capacity of the road network

There are a number of constraints that impact upon the development of the RTS. The most important, identified to date are:

- Physical environment of Shetland topography, severe weather, spatial distribution of population
- High costs of providing and maintaining the existing transport system
- Limited market size both for passengers, and for freight
- Limited revenue availability, and limited external capital funding availability
- Cultural high expectations for improvement challenge may be in the maintenance of the existing system more than improvements
- Reliance on lifeline links constrains choice, imposes timetable constraint, introduces vulnerability to transport connection and accessibility, can deter investment. This affects both external links and inter-island links
- External links experience high degree of seasonality in demand
- An ageing and declining population
- Opportunities to control the pattern of land use (especially housing) can reduce opportunities to improve accessibility, and reliance on the private car.
- Constraints on ability to directly influence provision of external links

Some uncertainties also impact on the strategy, including:

- Future cost and supply of fossil fuels
- Future social and economic trends within and affecting Shetland age structure, job opportunities, income, lifestyle choices and aspirations
- Changing legislative and regulatory environment

4. Problems and Opportunities

Problems and opportunities have been identified through background research into relevant transport and socio-economic data, and further informed through the findings from consultation. They have been listed under each of the five national transport objectives – Economy, Environment, Integration, Accessibility and Safety, as well as a series of External Elements.

Economy - Barriers to an efficient transport system

- High dependence on lifeline external and inter-island lifeline links requires that these are provided in a reliable manner as practically possible.
- High cost of freight and passenger access to and from Shetland opportunity to explore means to reduce overall costs, yet maintain levels of accessibility. Recent announcements of subsidies for passengers (islanders only), and for freight may go some way to address this issue.
- Capacity constraint for passenger accommodation on NorthLink ferry
- Some peak period vehicle deck capacity constraint on Whalsay and Bluemull Sound ferry routes
- High cost of developing, operating, maintaining (and for inter-island ferry network replacing vessels) the internal and inter-island transport network means that value for money must be a key criteria for future development.
- There are opportunities for market and route development of external links freight and passenger.

Environment - Impacts between Transport System and Environment

- Future impacts of climate change more severe storms, sea level increases.
- Continued protection and enhancement of Shetland's unique environmental qualities a key future asset.
- Global, European and national pressure to tackle rising greenhouse gas emissions from transport.
- Scheme design and construction, and roadside maintenance can have significant local impacts on local environment and biodiversity.
- Opportunities for education in relation to the Eco-Schools initiative.

Integration – Barriers to efficient integration of different elements of transport network – timetables, ticketing, facilities

- Potential scope for innovative schemes to improve resource utilisation between different transport sectors conventional PT; Demand Responsive; Various community, health and social provision.
- Widespread *perception* that service buses do not integrate with flight arrivals/departures at Sumburgh / issue that service buses cannot wait on delayed flights.
- Forthcoming opportunities arising from integrated ticketing initiative.
- Necessity to ensure continuation of public transport integration opportunities (services plus facilities) at ferry terminals and Tingwall.

Accessibility and Social Inclusion – Principally concerned with where vulnerable people cannot get to key services

- Those without a car in rural areas are particularly vulnerable to social exclusion. The number of people without cars may fall due to increasing car ownership trends, but those left behind may become smaller in number, and more vulnerable. Other influencing factors include changing expectations of the level of accessibility to be provided in rural areas, an ageing population, and also trends towards care in the community for aged persons.
- Previously highlighted timetable constraint and capacity constraint on internal and external links restricts accessibility.
- The lack of "safe" pedestrian links within settlements rarely causes severance, but can contribute to reduced pedestrian amenity in some instances. Issue again may arise from changing expectations, although will also be influenced by rising traffic volumes and speeds.
- Weather related reliability issues perceived vulnerability arsing from reliance on ferries, and air links can curtail, restrict or adversely impact upon journey making decisions.

• There is an over-riding requirement to provide adequate accessibility to key services and opportunities (jobs, health, education, shopping) for island and remote rural communities. This implies necessary contingencies to deal with planned and unplanned maintenance, contingencies if any tendered services are disrupted by operator default, and also longer term planning to deal with vessel replacement / fixed links.

Safety

- Challenge of improving road safety particularly the Shetland trend of single vehicle incidents with "Killed or Seriously Injured" casualties.
- Effective enforcement of driving behaviour can be challenging in Shetland.
- There is not perceived to be any security problems for Shetland transport users.
- Opportunities for education, and provision for facilities outside schools, through the Safer Routes to School initiative.
- Community safety can be improved by fixed links, in terms of evacuation to hospital.

Economic Development Issues

- The right transport links can help get tourists to Shetland one part of the mix for this sector.
- Specific transport related investment can assist in enabling or encouraging specific economic development opportunities, and this may go beyond what is required of an "economically efficient transport system". There needs to be early consideration of the transport issues arising from any particular development opportunities.
- Ferry jobs can be a significant factor in sustaining remote island communities.
- Improvements in transport links tend to have the impact of "centralising" economic activity, but can disperse residential location.
- There are opportunities presented by Eco-Tourism, which imply opportunities to promote and enhance Shetland's environment, and promote local access to opportunities to enjoy the environment.
- In the longer term, there are some opportunities presented by local renewable energy initiatives to provide a diversified energy mix for Shetland.

Planning Issues

- Development plans are supportive of national transport objectives
- Development control can assist in preventing, and overcoming transport related problems such as maximising local accessibility to services for those without access to a car, footpath development, ensuring the location of future economic development opportunities corresponds with the infrastructure required to enable it. It can also provide a framework for attracting developer contributions. It is understood that the current development control practices adopted by the Council are not enabling such opportunities to be realised. It is recognised that this is constrained by the historic pattern of single plot land release.

Health and Social Issues

- Access for those without access to a car to health facilities, and child care opportunities.
- This relates to the specific location of health and social facilities, and the range of access opportunities to these facilities.
- Requirement to encourage more physical exercise, and the current transport network may work against this opportunity.

Service Delivery

- Decentralisation policies do not necessarily appear to have been implemented, and must be considered very carefully to ensure that they achieve the aims of improving efficiency and bringing services closer to their client. The policy has the risk of worsening accessibility overall to services and jobs if not carefully pursued. Opportunities arise from the consideration of "back room" services, and improved ICT facilities.
- Fixed links can provide opportunities to pursue service rationalisation.
- Possible future tendering of inter-island ferry links could lead to a range of different impacts, particularly in terms of service delivery, crewing strategy, and the influence of SIC over the delivery wider economic / social objectives through the ferry service.

5. Wider Context for RTP and RTS

Prior to developing a vision and objectives for the RTS, it is essential to understand the broader vision and objectives that Shetland is working towards, and the framework within which the RTS will be set. Two aspects are considered – both the vision/objectives, but also the key decision making processes.

5.1 Scottish Executive Transport Policy

It is essential that the RTP and RTS can demonstrate compliance with the established Scottish Executive policy context, and also identify opportunities to achieve their aims, in order to maximise opportunities to funding.

Vision:

An accessible Scotland with safe, integrated and reliable transport that supports economic growth, provides opportunities for all, and is easy to use; a transport system that meets everyone's needs, respects our environment, and contributes to health; services recognised internationally for quality, technology and innovation, and for effective and well-maintained networks; a culture where fewer short journeys are made by car, where we favour public transport, walking and cycling because they are safe and sustainable, where transport providers and planners respond to the changing needs of businesses, communities and users, and where on ticket will get you anywhere.

Overall Aim:

To promote economic growth, social inclusion, health and protection of the environment through a safe, integrated, effective and efficient transport system

Objectives:

- Promote economic growth by building, enhancing, managing and maintaining transport services, infrastructure and networks to maximise their efficiency
- Promote social inclusion by connecting remote and disadvantaged communities and increasing the accessibility of the transport network
- Protect our environment and improve health by building and investing in public transport and other types of efficient and sustainable transport which minimise emissions and consumption of resources and energy
- Improve safety of journeys by reducing accidents and enhancing the personal safety of pedestrians, drivers, passengers and staff
- Improve integration by making journey planning and ticking easier and working to ensure smooth connection between different forms of transport.

Principles:

The Transport White Paper places an emphasis on "putting in place the right governance arrangements to improve strategic planning and the focus on delivery, and secure Best Value in transport expenditure."

It also states, "There is a duty, as well as a challenge, to ensure that resources made available by the tax-payer are *spent in line with strategic objectives*, sit *within legislative provision and competence*, and are used within audit requirements, and *deliver value for money*. Tools which are being used to meet the challenge include *sound procurement procedures*, *performance audit processes*, the development of *asset management plans*, and *Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG)*".

All projects which require Scottish Executive support or approval require to be appraised in accordance with the STAG. This appraisal framework considers not only financial aspects, but also fit with scheme objectives, implementability, as well performance against environment, safety, economic, accessibility and integration criteria.

The over-riding principles of STAG (which is in accordance with HM Treasury Green Book guidance on Appraisal) are that the decision making process is:

Objective – led: All activities and decisions should arise from established aims of the planning organisation with respect to transport and associated policy areas;

Open – minded: The guidance suggests working up possible projects or policies on the basis of defined objectives supported by a thorough understanding of the problems and opportunities of the area, rather than seeking to fit an existing proposal retrospectively to planning objectives;

Pragmatic: Work done should reflect the relative need for accuracy, the scale and expected impacts of proposals and their costs;

Auditable: It must be possible to see how planners have got from objectives to their final conclusion; and

Inclusive : Effective involvement of stakeholders is not presented as a chore but as a crucial required input to arriving at a final proposal which meets expectations and which can be delivered.

5.2 Shetland Community Planning Framework

The Shetland community planning board provides a useful and relevant framework within which to place the RTP, as it contains the major stakeholders – Shetland Enterprise, NHS Shetland, Association of Shetland Community Councils, Northern Constabulary, and Shetland Islands Council. Indeed, LTS and RTS guidance stresses the relationship with community plans.

Vision:

To be a sustainable and self sufficient community where everyone works together towards the same goals. Together we wish to ensure the long term vitality and well-being of Shetland, a place where:

- *Our economy is prosperous, competitive and diverse;*
- Our society is vibrant, healthy and safe, and one in which everyone is able to take part;
- Our outstanding environment is conserved and enhanced; and
- *Our unique cultural identity and sprit is celebrated and promoted.*

A key approach is to maintain and strengthen the population of Shetland, particularly in rural areas.

Elements:

- Economic: To maintain and improve the prosperity of Shetland, by making sure businesses, communities and individuals reach their full potential; particularly at this time when we cannot be sure of Shetland's future economy
- Social: To make sure all individuals, groups and communities have equal access and opportunity to a health, safe, active and vibrant society
- Environment: To ensure Shetland's environment remains of high quality, with its distinctive landscapes, habitats and species conserved and enhanced, and the community's environmental footprint reduced.
- Cultural: To make sure Shetland keeps its distinctive character and works for excellence in everything it does.

Principles:

It is also believed that the RTS could benefit from recognition of **the principles** from the Together Shetland Framework. This states:

As agencies in Shetland we provide a variety of public services. We will work together to make these services better, and more suited to the needs of the people of Shetland. Therefore, at all times, we will:

Work Together

- To ensure we are accountable in the tasks we set ourselves;
- In an open way;
- Within a joined-up framework for drawing together all our different initiatives;
- To remove any overlap in our services; and
- To achieve more than the sum of our parts.

Talk and Listen to Communities

- By making sure local communities and groups all have an equal voice
- Making sure Children and young people are included, the future of Shetland is dependent upon them;
- In order to learn more about the needs and desires of Shetland, so that we can adapt our services to meet these;
- In a way that which will make clear how we intend to engage with communities; and
- Encourage people to take part in this debate

Work to make sure that Services give value for money, and are appropriate to Shetland circumstances

- *Not compromising the future for the sake of the present;*
- Making sure that services are designed for and centred on the people who are using them;
- Continuing to improve;
- Learning from past experience; and
- Being clear about how we will achieve our work from the start, and open about our plans.

5.3 Other "Context Setting" Strategies

Within the national and Shetland context sit the RTP/RTS, interlinking with other key partnerships/strategies, including:

- Shetland development plans;
- Economic development strategy
- Social, Housing, Education plans; and
- Healthcare strategy.

6. Proposed RTP Vision and Principles

The following sections propose a draft vision and set of principles for the RTP / RTS.

RTS guidance suggests that the vision "should be a general and aspirational statement that is focussed more on the future than the current situation. To have value the vision must be owned by members of the partnership. To be useful – and memorable – the vision should not be too long and should not try to cover every concern, focusing instead on those concerns of most relevance to the partnership."

6.1 Vision

The vision of the partnership is to develop an effective, efficient, safe and reliable transport system for Shetland. The transport system will comprise of an integrated network of accessible, and affordable internal, inter-island and external links, which will contribute to the development of a safe, healthy, vibrant and inclusive society, a diverse, successful and self-sufficient economy, and enhanced environmental quality.

6.2 Principles

The following principles are suggested for the purposes of the RTS. This explains the way that the RTP will work and the values that will be considered in the decision making process for transport related investments.

- **sustainability** We will work to ensure that our actions are sustainable and meet the needs of the current generation of Shetland's people without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs
- accessibility and inclusion We will ensure that our actions improve Shetland citizens'
 ability to access services and will take account of all factors that create a barrier to this. We
 will encourage equal opportunities for all.
- **accountability** We will make ourselves answerable to the communities and people of Shetland and keep them informed of, and seek their views on, what we are doing.
- partnership We will work together with our partners and Shetland's people to achieve our vision and will encourage communities to realise their important role in development of the transport system
- **evidence-based** We will ensure that our actions are based on clear evidence and information and are derived from what the community wants, with investment decisions based on an objective appraisal process.
- **efficiency** We will aim to be as efficient as possible with resources and use them to provide as effective services as possible, maximising opportunity for external support.
- **compliance** It is necessary to ensure that all RTP actions comply with legislative and regulative provision and competence.

7. Shetland's Transport Objectives

7.1 Introduction

A series of draft objectives have been proposed taking into account consultation, problems and opportunities, constraints and uncertainties.

They have been developed with cognisance given to guidance provided within STAG, and RTS guidance, which highlights the following aspects:

- Objectives will steer the appraisal and prioritisation of projects and initiatives for transport in the region.
- Objectives should be SMART Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant and Timed. They should also be challenging.
- They should be written in a way that it will be clear when they are achieved and that progress can be measured along the way.
- They may be presented as broad themes supported by a number of more precise objectives.
- They can be supported by lower-level targets and performance indicators for particular programmes or services.
- Objectives should focus on the key ambitions of the RTP, informed by the RTP's vision, problems identified and prioritised through the work on scoping, and by the 5 key objectives and National transport objectives of the Scottish Ministers.

7.2 Approach

We have developed sets of objectives to nest within each of the five national transport objectives. We have grouped these in three groups – external links, inter-island links, and finally internal links. Whilst there is some duplication, we believe that this will have benefits in helping to make each objective more **specific, measurable**, and **relevant.**

Furthermore, it is noted that for external links the RTP does not necessarily control many aspects, its role is to influence and lobby for improvements; this is in contrast to inter-island links, and internal links.

The objectives are expressed as outcomes – i.e. what we ultimately wish to achieve, rather than implying a particular solution at this stage.

We have tried to express them as simply as possible at this stage, relating each to a single concept.

7.3 Economy

National Objective

To promote economic growth by building, enhancing, managing and maintaining transport services, infrastructure and networks to maximise their efficiency.

Shetland Context

In a Shetland context efficiency implies a particular responsibility to ensure the reliability and affordability of services and networks which are uniquely vulnerable to weather and natural forces and often costly to provide. The Partnership will ensure that the level, quality and efficiency of all modes of transport in future is maintained at current standards and improved wherever possible. The partnership will give priority to the maintaining affordable fares on external and internal services.

External Links

- 1. Work to ensure ongoing reliability of external ferry and air links to the Scottish Mainland
- 2. Work to ensure that external ferry and air links to the Scottish Mainland are affordable to all (passengers, livestock and freight)
- 3. Support measures to address current and anticipated capacity constraints on external air and ferry links
- 4. Work to optimise the economic benefits of the external links for Sheltand
- 5. Work to achieve beneficial service development and market growth on external air and ferry links for Shetland

Inter-Island Links

- 6. Ensure continued delivery of reliable inter-island links
- 7. Ensure delivery of inter-island links that are affordable to the user
- 8. Deliver inter-island links that are economically efficient, maximising economic benefit for a given sum of investment
- 9. Work to efficiently address existing and future capacity constraints

- 10. Ensure delivery of economically efficient management, maintenance and development of the road network
- 11. Ensure delivery of economically efficient operation and development of the internal public transport system
- 12. Work to improve the robustness of the internal transport system (public and private) against significant potential increases in fuel price

7.4 Social Inclusion and Accessibility

National Objective

To promote social inclusion by connecting remote and disadvantaged communities and increasing the accessibility of the transport network.

Shetland Context

Social inclusion has a very direct relevance for Shetland in that the provision of reasonably convenient and economical services to small and scattered communities is particularly difficult. The maintenance of transport services are essential to all Shetlanders but are unavoidably more expensive to provide because of remoteness and dispersion and the frequent need for air and ferry crossings. To achieve this shared objective the Partnership will give seek imaginative solutions to the problems associated with serving small populations in remote communities and will consider how the need to travel can be reduced, for example by new forms of service delivery or measures involving decentralisation.

External Links

- 1. Support the retention of measures to ensure continued operation, availability and capacity of external lifeline freight, livestock and passenger services to specified service levels
- 2. Support measures to ensure access for all on external links and terminals
- Seek to ensure that the timings and frequency of external passenger services take account of
 specific requirements of those accessing essential health and welfare services on the Scottish
 Mainland

Inter-Island Links

- 4. Ensure continued operation and availability of lifeline services to specified service levels
- 5. Deliver measures to improve access for all on inter-island links and their terminals
- 6. Maximise accessibility (frequency, operating day, service delivery options) to and from each island within constraints of funding, demand, technical and operational feasibility, and taking account of convenient access to essential services, and the social and economic well-being of the island.

- 7. Ensure continued availability of road and footpath network to provide access across Shetland
- 8. Ensure continued operation of internal public transport services to specified service levels
- 9. Deliver measures to improve access for all on the public transport network
- 10. Maximise accessibility (frequency, operating day, service delivery options) to each community within the constraints of funding, demand, technical and operational feasibility, and taking account of convenient access to essential services, and the social and economic well-being of that community
- 11. Improve accessibility for vulnerable groups to essential services

7.5 Environmental Protection

National Objective

To protect our environment and improve health by building and investing in public transport and other types of efficient and sustainable transport which minimise emissions and consumption of resources and energy.

Shetland Context

In a Shetland context, environmental quality is a particular concern. However, any responsible transport strategy must also address the contribution that local action can make in addressing the global impact of transport. The Partnership will give particular attention to safeguarding the environmental qualities of Shetland in its transport strategies, minimising the potential impacts of projects and services on the landscape, wildlife and archaeology of the islands. In order to address global concerns, the Partnership will seek to promote transport technologies and modes that minimise emissions. This will include encouraging the use of alternative fuels, car sharing, walking and cycling. Such an approach will complement efforts to improve health and to offer 'greener' tourism opportunities.

External Links

1. Encourage reductions in carbon dioxide and greenhouse gas emissions, and the consumption of non-renewable resources arising from external links

Inter-Island Links

- 2. Seek improvements in fuel efficiency, and a reduction in adverse environmental impacts
- 3. Minimise impacts of transport and associated infrastructure on the coastal and marine environments
- 4. Reduce the vulnerability of transport / infrastructure to climate change

- 5. Encourage and facilitate walking and cycling for short trips
- 6. Reduce carbon dioxide and greenhouse gas emissions, and the consumption of non-renewable resources arising from transport, travel and infrastructure in control of the Council and its Partners
- 7. Encourage and facilitate reductions in carbon dioxide and greenhouse gas emissions, and the consumption of non-renewable resources arising from transport and travel in control of private users
- 8. Reduce impacts of transport and transport infrastructure on landscape, the historic environment and biodiversity
- 9. Support species native to Shetland through roadside Biodiversity Action Plan and appropriate management and maintenance of road network
- 10. Encourage design of transport infrastructure that is appropriate to Shetland
- 11. Seek to minimise the adverse affects on natural drainage systems from roads run-off

7.6 Safety

National Objective

To improve safety of journeys by reducing accidents and enhancing the personal safety of pedestrians, drivers, passengers and staff.

Shetland Context

This general Ministerial objective will run through all strategy and operational decisions which the Partnership will make.

External Links

1. Support compliance with external safety and security requirements

Inter-Island Links

2. Ensure compliance with internal and external safety and security requirements

- 3. Implement measures that seek to achieve National Road Safety Targets
- 4. Encourage the elimination of drink driving
- 5. Encourage improvement in seat belt compliance
- 6. Implement measures to reduce fatalities, particularly in single vehicle accidents
- 7. Discourage excessive and inappropriate vehicle speeds.

7.7 Integration

National Objective

To improve integration by making journey planning and ticketing easier and working to ensure smooth connection between different forms of transport.

Shetland Context

Transport integration by the alignment of timetables, ready provision of passenger information and through-ticketing is again of particular importance to Shetland where transitions between road transport, air and ferry services and longer travel distances are – by the nature of the islands - much more frequent than is typically the case throughout Scotland.

External Links

- 1. Deliver effective and integrated public transport links to and from Shetland's principal passenger transport terminals at Sumburgh and Holmsgarth
- 2. Deliver effective transport integration opportunities at Shetland's principal passenger transport terminals at Sumburgh and Holmsgarth
- 3. In partnership with other RTPs, encourage effective transport integration opportunities at Shetland's principal Mainland ferry terminals and airports

Inter-Island Links

- 4. Provide integrated public transport trip opportunities with the inter-island ferry service, and the inter-island air service
- 5. Provide integrated freight facilities at each relevant ferry terminals

- 6. Provide interchange opportunities and facilities at Viking Bus Station, Esplanade
- 7. Deliver integrated and multi-modal ticketing across Shetland's public transport network
- 8. Provide effective journey planning information for visitors and residents for trips within, to and from Shetland

8. External Objectives

In addition to the RTS **transport objectives** outlined above, it is recognised that other relevant policy documents identify improvements in the transportation system as a means to achieve their own objectives. A review has been undertaken of other local strategies, such as the Structure Plan, the Economic Development Strategy, and the NHS Shetland 2020 Vision. The main objectives which it is believed the RTS can assist in delivering are highlighted below.

8.1 Land Use - Structure Plan and Local Plan

The majority of policies in the Structure Plan and Local Plan are relevant to the RTS. The Transport Topic Goal in the Structure Plan is to deliver an integrated transport system that meets the needs of Shetland people and seeks to minimise impact on the Environment., and reflects the transport aims and objectives previously outlined. The following Structure Plan policies appear most relevant to the implementation of the RTS.

General Development Policy - Sustainable Development GDS1

Development will be planned to meet the economic and social needs of Shetland in a manner that does not compromise the ability of future generations to meet their own needs and to enjoy the area's high quality environment. All development must therefore protect environmental assets as defined in the Structure Plan and Local Plan, use and conserve resources wisely, and minimise environmental impacts.

General Development Policy - Existing Settlements GDS3

New residential, cultural, educational and community developments will be encouraged in or adjacent to existing settlements that have basic services in order to enhance their viability and vitality. In consultation with local communities a zoning strategy will be developed which identifies preferred locations for residential development throughout Shetland. Isolated development in the open countryside will be discouraged.

General Development Policy - Social Inclusion GDS5

New Development will be assessed in terms of its accessibility and the positive contribution it makes to the social well-being of the whole community.

Energy - Policy SP ENG5

Proposals which seek to minimise energy consumption by means of location, layout, design, construction and alternative technology will be considered favourably where the proposal does not conflict with other Structure and Local Plan policies

Business and Industry - Policy SP IND1

This policy "accepts the need for locally based employment generating initiatives that can diversify the economic base of the rural areas"

Tourism - Policy SP TOUR1

This policy supports high quality tourism development proposals particularly those which "are accessible by means other than a private car and where possible to the wheelchair bound and disabled"

Commercial Development - Policy SP COM1

The Shetland Local Plan will contain policies that seek to ensure that:

- a) convenient access to shops is available to every inhabitant of Shetland including those without access to a car;
- b) the viability and vitality of Lerwick Town Centre is protected and enhanced;
- developments that are considered to have an adverse impact on the viability of rural shops and post
 offices will be resisted; and
- d) the creation of commercial employment opportunities in existing rural settlements will be encouraged, including home working, where it does not conflict with residential amenity

Housing - Policy SP HOU3

The Council will seek to maintain the viability and vitality of existing settlements. The Shetland Local Plan will establish zones and policy criteria for new housing development which:-

- a) In zone 1 encourage new houses in areas where facilities and services are present, including previously development land within existing settlements;
- b) In zone 2 favourably consider new houses in areas of population decline or instability;
- c) In zone 3 favourably consider new houses which strengthen and reinforce existing building groups in the areas surrounding Lerwick
- d) In zone 4 strictly control new houses in the open countryside

Community Services and Facilities - Policy SP CSF1

To maintain the vitality and viability of the rural areas, the Council will continue to support and invest in the existing network of schools and the communities that they serve.

Community Services and Facilities - Policy SP CSF3

The Council will seek to enhance, support and protect services, especially those which contribute to the social and economic development of communities, in locations which are the most accessible to users unless:

- a) It can be demonstrated that the facility will not be required in the future by the community or;
- b) Provision for replacement facilities is made elsewhere within the locality.

8.2 Economic Development Strategy- Shetland 2012

Key economic development priorities which offer scope for the RTS to help to deliver are outlined below.

Improving Our Communication Links with the Outside World

The task is to ensure that Shetland has access to transport and communication links that are of high quality and support economic and community development.

- Continuing to press for external air and sea services that meet Shetland's business and social needs;
- Encouraging the provision of external transport services that are safe, reliable, economical and of
 good quality and working with other areas across the Highlands and Islands to promote
 measures, including Public Service Obligations, that will recognise the lifeline nature of such
 services'
- Promoting Sumburgh as Shetland's principal airport and supporting proposals for the maintenance
 and development of its facilities, whilst also recognising the valuable role played by Scatsta
 Airport in support of the oil industry and its ability to provide a limited diversionary facility for
 Sumburgh;
- To press for the effective maintenance, development and marketing of external and international air and ferry services;
- To encourage the provision of satisfactory connecting freight and passenger services from Aberdeen to the rest of the UK and abroad;
- To ensure, through survey, investigation, dialogue and consultation, that the Community has an accurate picture of Shetland's external transport needs;
- To press for adequate facilities on external transport services for all who have special needs, including those with a disability; and
- Seeking to ensure that Shetland is connected to the remainder of the UK by high quality electronic communication links capable of supporting the full range of information technology activities.

Diversification

The task is to broaden Shetland's economic base, create quality jobs and allow the population to be much less dependent upon a narrow band of industrial sectors.

• Promoting the development in technology, particularly distance working associated with better communication links; and

• Maximising Shetland's potential at the crossroads of the North Atlantic.

Strengthening Rural Communities in Shetland

The task is to foster sufficient economic activity in the remoter parts of Shetland to ensure that rural communities remain and/or become places where people can live and work with good career prospects.

- Supporting the retention and promoting the sustainable growth of key rural industries including agriculture, aquaculture, tourism, culture and heritage, renewable energy and recycling;
- Decentralising public sector employment; and
- Maintaining local transport provision, infrastructure and essential rural services.

8.3 Economic Development – Shetland Enterprise Business Plan

The business plan is spit into four strands – Growing Business, Global Connections, Skills and Learning, and Strengthening Communities. Relevant strategic priorities include the following.

Growing Businesses

- Provide financial support for research and development into emerging renewable energy technologies.
- Improve the quality and breadth of the tourism product, including the development of niche market tourism.
- Encourage the use of local products by linking producers, hotels and restaurants with external expertise.

Global Connections

- Support the development of broadband infrastructure including roll out to rural areas to enable the 'connecting of communities'.
- To make the most of Broadband opportunities through advice and training in the move towards the knowledge economy.
- Encourage the development of virtual learning to reduce the impact of peripherality constraints.
- Work in partnership with Shetland College to expand the skills base of the renewable energy sector.
- Support the development of a centre of excellence for renewable technologies
- Encourage external transportation link improvement including appropriate route development and affordable transport. Capitalise on Scandinavian links.
- Attract and promote job dispersal and inward investment through financial support and targeted information.
- Advocate population retention and growth as a policy objective, particularly for rural communities.
- Work with Community Planning partners to promote Shetland as an attractive place to live, learn and work.

Strengthening Communities

- Work in partnership to develop creative solutions to the lack of childcare facilities and services in rural areas.
- Encourage the development of activity that opens up income generating streams for community enterprises with targets on approval.
- Increase community capacity through encouraging and supporting schemes and initiatives such as the Initiative at the Edge, Community mentoring and Community agents.
- Provide support for the Initiative at the Edge groups and encourage activities that will develop income generating streams and create employment.
- Target support to projects involving young people, women, and men leaving traditional industries.
- Encourage the development of sustainable community led tourism projects that support tourism at a Shetland wide level, particularly projects that promote the natural environment and innovative approaches to its interpretation.

- Focus on developing social and community enterprise activity to encourage development into sustainable small businesses with global opportunities and potential. This includes the support of community led projects such as music developments, IT, renewable energy and market-led sustainable craft businesses.
- Assist in the promotion and development of Shetland as a green community.

8.4 Corporate Plan 2004-2008

A review of the Council's Corporate Plan has revealed further objectives that the RTS will play a vital role in delivering. These include:

- Improving external communication links with the rest of the world to help competitive ness, through continuing to press for external air and sea services that meet Shetland's business and social needs including Public Service Obligations (PSOs) and seeking to ensure that Shetland is connected to the UK by high quality electronic links to enhance business use of technology.
- Strengthening rural economies, through supporting commercial activities throughout Shetland, with preferential assistance for remote areas and seeking to decentralise some public sector employment away from Lerwick.
- Provi de a sustainable and easy to use internal transport system for transporting freight and people. This will be achieved through continuing to improve roads, improving our systems of public transport, sustaining inter0isalnd communications and seeking improvements with fixed links, where appropriate, starting with the Bressay Bridge.

8.5 NHS Shetland 2020 Vision

The NHS 2020 Vision outlines the strategic approach undertaken by NHS Shetland to healthcare provision on the island.

By 2020, NHS Shetland's vision for healthcare transport involves:

- Integrated Community Transport System, comprising a flexible range of transport to link sea, air and land travel. This vision includes buses or community cars linking to ferries and planes, bookable and regular, at reasonable cost/subsidised. The vision also recognises that these transport services need to accommodate various working patterns and be suited to the needs of individual areas of Shetland.
- Improved Transport Options for Older People and Those with Disabilities, in order to provide higher levels of accessibility to key services and amenities for these groups. It is proposed that this could be achieved through the introduction of a reduced rate taxi card scheme for individuals with long term health conditions or disabilities and through encouraging local supermarkets/shops to provide home delivery services.
- External Links that are Quicker, Cheaper and Not Weather Dependant, through for example, encouraging other European of UK companies that currently provides services to Mainland Scotland to break the current monopoly, or to look for national policy to reduce costs. Cheaper air and ferry services will be essential if Shetland's economy is to place a stronger reliance on tourism. More efficient external links can also help in recruitment and retention of staff for health services and other essential service areas.
- Better transport infrastructure within Shetland, including fixed links (bridges or tunnels) to some of the outer isles, for instance to connect Unst and Yell, Yell to the Mainland, or Bressay to Mainland are possibilities for future that NHS Shetland envisage could deliver better transport infrastructure. Fixed links would be beneficial in providing road ambulance services across Shetland, removing the need to rely on ferry services that can be heavily disrupted by weather. In this way, improved infrastructure within Shetland would help in the delivery of health services in these more remote areas.
- Redesign and Share Current Resources. It is recognised that there are a range of local transport initiatives already in place in Shetland, including school transport, local community and commercial transport. NHS Shetland have identified some very innovative schemes to link transport in the rural areas to services and community needs, such as drive-home schemes from alcohol related social activities and subsidised transport for youth and leisure activities. The challenge for the future will be to redesign current local systems, to find opportunities for collaboration and joint ventures that can contribute towards an integrated community transport scheme for Shetland.

9. Option Development

This chapter outlines the development of scenarios, and the long list of options considered for inclusion in this RTS.

9.1 Scenario Identification

We have identified five broad possible scenarios as a tool to assist in the generation of long-lists of options, and to assist in the "packaging" of these alternative options. It is anticipated that following the appraisal and prioritisation process, that the final preferred strategy will mix and match the best performing, and most appropriate elements from each of the five scenarios.

The five scenarios have been defined as follows:

Scenario A – Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through the broad continuation of policies and approaches contained in the current LTS, with the current levels of public transport provision, and broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure as at present.

Scenario B – Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased facilitation of personal mobility, reduced levels of publicly provided transport, and broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure as at present. This is likely to lead to a greater reliance on car and roads based access, with more reliance on personal and voluntary services, and less on publicly funded services. A particular feature is service optimisation and efficiencies.

Scenario C – Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased facilitation of personal mobility, reduced levels of publicly provided transport, but increased amounts of capital expenditure – perhaps "one off expenditure" that could result in savings.

Scenario D – Seeks to achieve the vision and objective through increased provision of public transport services, an emphasis on social inclusion, but with broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure. This scenario responds best to the social inclusion and accessibility agenda.

Scenario E – Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased provision of public transport services, an emphasis on social inclusion, but with increased amounts of capital expenditure.

A more detailed explanation of the scenarios and some example options are presented in Table 9.1.

9.2 Option Development

Based on discussions with SIC officers, research into rural transport best practice, and the outcomes of the consultation process, long lists of different measures have been developed under each of the scenarios for different elements of the RTS. These are presented as follows:

- Table 9.2 External Links
- Table 9.3 Inter-Island Links, and
- Table 9.4 Internal Links

9.3 Appraisal

The appraisal process will seek to consider the overall impacts of each of the alternative packages of measures, and advise on the most suitable mix of measures to be progressed within the draft RTS. The appraisal process will consider:-

- Fit with vision and objectives
- Affordability
- Technical Feasibility
- Operational Feasibility
- Public Support
- Environmental Impacts
- Safety and Security
- Economic Impacts (both in terms of transport efficiency and wider economic impacts)
- Accessibility and Social Inclusion
- Integration in terms of transport, but also other policies.

The process fits with the STAG Part 1 appraisal process, and features an early sift of measures to discard those lease likely to contribute to the strategy's objectives, followed by appraisal against the criteria highlighted above.

A pragmatic approach will be taken to the appraisal, focussing effort on where key choices have to be made.

Table 9.1: Summary of Scenarios developed for Appraisal

Scenario A

This is the 'Do-Minimum' approach involving a general continuation of policies and strategies set out in the previous Local Transport Strategy (LTS) in addition to some of the more recent measures that SIC are implementing since the production of the previous LTS in 2000. This scenario would involve a continuation of historic spending patterns, and prioritisation practices.

In terms of **external links**, the RTP's influence is limited mainly to lobbying for improvements. Therefore, as part of this scenario, the RTP would continue to press for accessible, affordable and reliable external transport services that meet the needs of both passengers and freight service providers. The importance of retaining direct links into Europe would also be emphasised within this scenario. A notable action included in this scenario would be the initiation of a detailed origin-destination study (looking at locals, tourists, and business visitor trips etc) as part of an examination of the most efficient and effective delivery of the Shetland to UK Mainland ferry link.

With regards to **inter-island** links, a continuation of existing policies would include maintaining the current levels of air and ferry services afforded to Shetland's outer isles. In order to do this, Shetland's existing ferry fleet would be replaced at the end of their lifetimes, with corresponding terminal improvements. Service optimisation and improvement options would be appraised and prioritised, including attention placed on the service to Whalsay, Skerries, Fetlar and Unst, along with associated infrastructure. The development of fixed links is seen as desirable, but is constrained by funding availability.

At the **internal level**, the RTP would continue to promote measures that encourage walking and cycling. The current extensive levels of bus service that are provided throughout Shetland would be maintained, along with the network of more flexible buses such as shopper, community and dial-a-ride buses. Measures to increase travel awareness, promote the use of environmentally friendly fuels, and to generally reduce the need to travel, would also be promoted within this scenario. The RTP would also continue the current policy of roads maintenance and improvement, with priority centred on the spine road network.

Scenario B

This scenario would be based on the premise that the RTP seeks to achieve its objectives through an increasing reliance on private and voluntary means of transport, assuming limited additional capital investment. (i.e. SIC Scottish Executive, European funding). Accordingly, the options below are those that seek service optimisation and efficiencies.

There is relatively little scope to deliver specific changes to the **external** transport network since these are operated by external operators, and policy approach set out for Scenario A would be continued.

On the other hand, the **inter-island** ferry and, to a lesser extent, air services provide scope to secure efficiencies. This scenario could entail, for example, the rationalisation of ferry and air services. For the ferry service this could be achieved through reducing the hours of operation, and fewer vessels. The use of Mainland crews rather than small-island based crews could also result in cost savings. This scenario is obliged to continue with the vessel and terminal replacement programme.

With regards to the **internal** transport service, the public transport service presents the greatest opportunity to reduce costs, such as through the removal of buses to outlying rural areas as well as through reductions in service frequency.

Table 9.1: Summary	of Scenarios	developed for	Appraisal (Continued)

Scenario C	The options or strategies advocated in this scenario would include those may incur a high capital cost in the short term, but which could have significant cost savings over time.
	Again, with regards to external transport services, there is relatively little scope to alter the approach advocated in Scenario A.
	The inter-island links provides an opportunity invest, particularly through the development of fixed links. For example, whilst the development of tunnels (or bridges) would incur a high capital cost from the outset, over time savings could be made through the removal of ferry services, and rationalisation of other services. Alternatively, the use of larger vessels with reduced frequencies provides an alternative approach. This scenario is obliged to continue with the vessel and terminal replacement programme, undertaken with respect to fixed link proposals.
	In reference to internal transport services and specifically public transport, establishing a transport brokerage scheme could help to save costs in the long term by replacing conventional timetabled bus services with a variety of existing community services etc managed through a shared database.
Scenario D	This scenario seeks to achieve an improvement of current levels of service and accessibility. Accordingly, it is believed that this scenario would enable options to be implemented that would tend to improve/sustain rural accessibility. This scenario is built on the premise that the RTP would receive more revenue, but no extra capital.
	With regards to the external transport network, since the external services are operated by external operators there is little opportunity to influence change on these service, and the approach would in line with that advocated in Scenario A.
	With reference to the inter-islands services, this scenario could be used to provide a 24 hour ferry service, some extra sailings, and additional flights. This scenario is obliged to continue with the vessel and terminal replacement programme.
	For internal transport The provision of more DRT subsidised services, and shuttle services to key destinations such as health centres and Sumburgh Airport could be measures developed under this scenario, supplemented by targeted road improvements on the spine network.
Scenario E:	This scenario includes a wider range of potential strategies and options that the RTP may want to implement, given the benefit of additional revenue and capital funding, aiming to improve accessibility and substantial improvements to the public transport network.
	Again, with regards to external transport services, there is relatively little scope to spend to save since these services are managed by external operators. However, from an aspirational viewpoint, it could be said that the RTP would have a greater

influence over these services and therefore could deliver faster ferries with greater capacity and cheaper prices for the user, and provide specific subsidy for all year round passenger and freight links to Scandinavia.

With regards to **inter-island** transport, aspirational options could include the implementation of fixed links, fast ferries to outer islands, and an enhanced inter-islands air service (larger planes, improved air strips).

Options for the **internal** transport network could include the provision of more frequent public transport throughout Shetland, including the most remote rural areas and the removal of fares. The implementation of alternative transport systems (mono-rail, bus-way, tram) scheme would also fit into this scenario. Improved road links throughout Shetland.

Table 9.2: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (External Links)

External Links Air (Passenger) - Continue to press for accessible, affordable and relable air services that meet Shetland's social and economic needs Initiate a detailed origin-destination study (looking at locals, tourist, and business visitor trips (c) - Promose Sumburgh as Shetland's principal uirport and support proposals for the maintenance and development of its facilities Press for adequate facilities on external transport services for all who have special needs, including those with a disability Encourage the provision of satisfactory connecting passenger services from Scotland Maintand to the rest of the UK and abroad Press for the effective maintenance, development and marketing of external and international ferry services, including flexible telecting initiatives Press for improvements in integration opportunities from Aberdeen Airport Lobby for PSOs at Sumburgh Airport.
Air (Passenger) • Continue to press for accessible, affordable and reliable air services that meer Shetland's social and economic needs. • Initiate a detailed origin-destination study (fooking at locals, tourists, and business visitor trips etc) • Promote Sumburgh as Shetland's principal airport and support proposals for the maintenance and development of its facilities. • Press for adequate facilities on external transport services for all who have special needs, including those with a disability. • Encourage the provision of satisfactory connecting passenger services from Scolland Mainland to the rest of the UK and abroad. • Press for the effective maintenance, development and marketing of external and international ferry services, including flexible ticketing initiatives. • Press for improvements in integration opportunities from Aberdeen Airport • Lobby for extended opening hours at Sumburgh in Journal of Ass scenario A • As scenar
 Lobby for increased frequency of flights to and from Sumburgh Airport. Lobby for an increased range of destinations from Sumburgh Airport. Continue to lobby for reduced

	during the peak periods. • More promotional material about transport links needs at Sumburgh Airport and Holmsgarth Ferry Terminal				
Air (Freight)	Continue to press for external air services that meet Shetland's business needs.	As scenario A	As scenario A	As scenario A	Provision of a dedicated air freight service (subsidised?).

Table 9.2: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (External Links) - Continued

Element	Scenario A	Scenario B	Scenario C	Scenario D	Scenario E
External Links	500	200111110	300	200.00.20	2001W230 <u>2</u>
Ferries (Passenger)	 Continue to press for accessible, affordable and reliable ferry services that meet Shetland's social needs. Initiate an extensive origindestination study (looking at locals, tourists, and business visitor trips etc) to examine views on the ferry and air services, to investigate if the range of destinations are correct, and to establish the reasons why people travel to and from 	As scenario A	• As scenario A	As scenario A	 Lobby for more Shetland only sailings (i.e. fewer Orkney callings). Lobby for reduced fares on ferries.
	 Shetland. Explore options for an external link that fully meets Shetland's social and economic requirements. 				
	 Press for adequate facilities on external transport services for all who have special needs, including those with a disability. Encourage the provision of 				
	satisfactory connecting passenger services from Aberdeen to the rest of the UK and abroad.				
	 Press for the effective maintenance, development and marketing of external and international ferry services, including flexible ticketing initiatives. 				
	 Press for improvements in integration opportunities from Aberdeen Harbour to the Guild Street bus and rail stations. Lobby for more cabins. 				
Ferries (Freight)	Continue to press for external ferry services that meet Shetland's business needs.	As scenario A	As scenario A	As scenario A	
	Encourage the provision of satisfactory connecting freight services from Aberdeen to the				

rest of the UK and abroad.				
Ferries (to Europe) Continue to recognise the importance of direct links with Scandinavian neighbours and protect these links. Lobby for all round passenger and freight links to Scandinavia, supported by market development initiatives.	• As scenario A	As scenario A	• As scenario A	Subsidise the development of all year freight and passenger routes from Lerwick to a wider range of European destinations.

Table 9.3: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (Inter-Island Links)

	likely to occur under different policy				
Element	Scenario A	Scenario B	Scenario C	Scenario D	Scenario E
Inter-Island Links					
Ferries	 Continue existing levels of ferry service to the outer isles Continue to replace ferry and terminals at the end of their lifespans. Continue to implement short-term cost interventions to economically fragile areas (i.e. Unst). Tender services for outer islands which wish to pursue this route (i.e. Foula). Continue to update the electronic ticketing system operated on the ferry services to ensure integration with other public transport services Continue to implement VMS to improve information on ferry services. Continue to comply with DDA regulations through staff training initiatives Continue to consider schemes at Whalsay, Skerries and Fetlar Encourage the development of ferry transport groups (i.e. like the Yell Commuters group) as a forum to report transport issues through the respective Community Councils. 	 Reduced frequency of service Reduction of operating day Mainland/Island crewing based on service optimisation Consider introduction of split shifts Reduced vessel numbers / shared use of vessels for small isles Consider alternative means of providing links – helicopter charter Differential fares policy 	Use of larger vessels but with reduced frequency Introduce more fuel-efficient vessels.	Increased operational day Increased frequency of ferry services	 Introduction of larger, faster and more efficient vessels on all routes (i.e. provision of Yell Ferries on all routes). Island based crewing policy with supporting infrastructure Increased frequency and operating day of ferry services Removal of fares on all ferry services.
Air	Continue existing levels of air	Rationalised level of air service	Purchase of RTP aircraft.	Increase frequency of air service interiologida	
	 service to the outer isles. Continue to offer lower air fares for island residents on inter- 	to islandsRemoval of air service from some islands		to inter-islands	 to inter-islands Introduce services to Orkney from Fair Isle
	island flights.Continue to provide grant funding for Airstrip Trusts to	Replacement of inter-islands air and ferry service with helicopters			Removal of fares on all air services.Improved air strips (i.e. Fair
	 maintain island air strips. Review booking and information regime with operator 	 Shared use of aircraft fleet with Orkney Islands Close Tingwall Airport and use 			Isle)Consider options for the future use of Unst Airport
	 Consider air fare incentives to encourage tourists to stay 	Sumburgh only			

	overnight on the small isles.				
Fixed Links	 Development of Bressay Bridge Establish a consortium or fixed links forum with other island LAs in order to share knowledge and resources. This could have equipment mobilisation benefits, and enhanced lobbying influence. 	As scenario A	 Implementation of fixed links Yell to Mainland Yell to Unst Whalsay to Mainland 	As scenario A	 Implementation of fixed links Yell to Mainland Yell to Unst Whalsay to Mainland

Table 9.4: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (Internal Links)

Element	Scenario A	Scenario B	Scenario C	Scenario D	Scenario E
Internal Links					
Walking and Cycling	 Continue to promote walking and cycling through improvements in infrastructure provision (i.e. cycle storage), route development (i.e. targeted provision of rural footways and cycle paths), and information. Implement traffic management and calming techniques to improve the safety of pedestrians and cyclists. Undertake social crossing assessments. 	Where new development is built, ensure that developers are responsible for the implementation of appropriate walking, cycling and traffic calming facilities.	Significantly increase the rural footpath network, particularly for access to key services in rural settlements i.e. schools, health and leisure centres, shops etc (i.e. improved local access could reduce the need to provide public transport services).	 Increase the rural footpath network, particularly for access to key services in rural settlements i.e. schools, health and leisure centres, shops etc. Increase programme of traffic calming. 	 Increase the rural footpath network, particularly for access to key services in rural settlements i.e. schools, health and leisure centres, shops etc. Increase provision for cyclists, such as through dedicated cycle lanes in Lerwick and alongside the spine route Wide spread implementation of basic hard surfaces or 'French drains' in rural areas (rather than full concrete footpaths) so to provide walkers with a safe pedestrian refuge on a surface that retains the rural feel of the area. Speed limits? i.e. reduce speed limit to 30mph on single track roads / Quiet Lanes
Travel Awareness	 As the major employer in Shetland, examine and implement a travel plan. Target other major employers (Health Board and Sullom Voe) for travel awareness campaigns and Travel Plans. Investigate the possibility of a Shetland wide car sharing club. Promote green travel plans. Reduce the need to travel through location of development, and employment centres Support and promote safer routes to schools campaigns and other healthy living campaigns. Promote the use of greener fuels, such as LPG and assist in the introduction of LPG related supplies and services. 	• As Scenario A	 Establish a discounted-parking scheme for environmentally friendly vehicles, with discounts dependent on vehicles VED (Vehicle Excise Duty) classification. Promote car-sharing/van-pooling (market car-sharing on the economic savings) and provide dedicated car-parking spaces for car-sharers. Establish 'borrow-a-bike' schemes available to all Council employees. 	• As Scenario A	 Establish hot-desking space in communities where there is potential for decentralised working (more ICT). Develop a programme of speed awareness courses, used as alternatives to prosecution and based on referrals from Northern Constabulary. Offer assistance for petrol stations offering bio-fuels. Introduction of mobile facilities to reduce the need to travel for those in rural areas (i.e. continue to offer mobile library services). Convert all Council vehicles to LPG fuels

Table 9.4: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (Internal Links) - Continued

Element	Scenario A	Scenario B	Scenario C	Scenario D	Scenario E
Internal Links					
Roads	 In the Council's programme of road improvement and rebuilding, prioritise the maintenance of the spine road network and the provision of links to ferry terminals. Actively encourage the use of appropriately sized vehicles in remote and sensitive locations. Continue to monitor road traffic volumes by way of continuous loop sites on the approaches to Lerwick and throughout Shetland. Continue to develop, where appropriate, the use of community piers. Continue to operate the part-time pedestrianisation of Commercial Street, to allow for deliveries and collections at certain times of the day only. Continue to provide new footways, lighting and other minor improvements in Shetland's network of small villages. Continue to licence taxi and private hire vehicles to meet local needs. Investigate the provision of taxi stances within the town cent re. Lobby for reduced fuel costs. 	 Further prioritise roads maintenance programme. Further prioritise winter maintenance programme. 	 Charges for car parking in Lerwick Bans for bigger vehicles on certain roads (i.e. save money on repairs) or impose fines/charges to companies whose vehicles are responsible for road damage. Establish freight consolidation centres where small retailers collect their mail from a freight consolidation centre in an accessible location Promote collection points, whereby undeliverable bulky mail can be left at a local store, PO, banks etc for collection at a later date (i.e. to reduce need for return travel). 	Road Improvements – surface and expansion works	 Provision of high quality, 2 lane roads to all areas throughout Shetland. Introduce Intelligent Transport Systems, such as intelligent road studs and more VMS signs. Promote the adoption of Hydrogen based fuel systems for transport Motion sensitive lighting Target some of the harder to reach markets by commissioning a 'dual fuel' network, which involves providing advice and guidance on the conversion process to LPG to taxis, the general public and small businesses in the area. Establish freight consolidation centres where small retailers collect their mail from a freight consolidation centre in an accessible location Promote collection points, whereby undeliverable bulky mail can be left at a local store, PO, banks etc for collection at a later date (i.e. to reduce need for return travel).

Table 9.4: Elements likely to occur under different policy scenarios (Internal Links) - Continued

Element	Scenario A	scenarios (Internal Links) - Continuo Scenario B	Scenario C	Scenario D	Scenario E
Internal Links	Scenario A	Scenario B	Scenario C	Section to D	Section E
Public Transport	 Continue to provide an extensive level of bus service provision meeting as far as can be afforded, the needs and aspirations of each rural area. Improve access to Lerwick and key settlements through public transport improvements and provision of car parking. Continue to provide services for commuters, shoppers, elderly, and those with a disability to travel to and from Lerwick. Provide "community transport" services as required in each area and continue to work closely with the Community Transport Association to provide advice and assistance to local voluntary groups with regards to transport projects. Provide new bus shelters and timetable cases in line with expected regular passenger usage. Support innovative and flexible public transport usage with community planning partners. Implement through ticketing initiatives Continue to produce public transport timetables each year, and distribute these at bus stops with high local/tourist usage and via the Council website. Continue to contribute to the development of the annual 'Guide to Concessions'. Encourage the development of informal park and ride sites near rural road junctions. Continue to comply with DDA regulations through staff training initiatives and low floor buses 	 Prioritise public transport provision (reduced network operating hours; reduced coverage; and reduced frequency). Use smaller buses to operate rural services. provide timetables via the website or local press. School transport savings through establishing joint catchments. (Footpath improvements could possibly also reduce school transport costs). Review fares policy 	 Replace timetabled services with more flexi forms of transport such as Demand Responsive Transport (DRT) services Introduce a transport brokerage scheme (i.e. community/dial-aride scheme, making best use of existing resources through a shared database. Introduce fuel efficient buses. Promote more mobile services through partners (i.e. NHS Shetland) Promote the multi-utilisation of Council vehicles. Introduce accessibility planning projects to identify areas where public transport should be targeted. 	 Increase public transport provision (increased network operating hours; increased coverage; and increased frequency) Introduce more late night and weekend bus services. Implement more DRT flexible transport services Introduce more feeder services and shopper services Introduce shuttle bus services to key services i.e. health centres. Provide dedicated express service from Sumburgh Airport to Lerwick (i.e. in form of Tingwall dial-a-ride). Introduce concessionary fares for youths and other socially excluded groups (i.e. those on benefits). Introduction of a reduced rate taxi card scheme for individuals with long term health conditions or disabilities Increase distribution of transport timetables. 	 Remove bus fares. Brokerage schemes (i.e. use of other service vehicles) Implement integrated ticketing initiatives (i.e. between bus and ferry trips, smartcard compatible, and enabling conc essionary and school passenger usage on local bus services). Introduction of monorail system. Implement more DRT flexible transport services Introduce more feeder services and shopper services Provide dedicated executive coach service from Sumburgh Airport to Lerwick (i.e. in form of Tingwall dial-a-ride). Establish more park and ride sites across the area Implementation of real time bus information such as text messaging information at bus stops. Implementation of bus timetables and maps at all bus stops throughout Shetland. Introduce flexi-tickets (particularly aimed at SIC workers) Allow for school bus passes to be used on service buses when pupils are attending after-school clubs. Offer free buses for travel to new jobs or interviews, with tickets issued to jobseekers directly through the Jobcentre Production of art exhibitions at transport waiting facilities i.e. Viking Station, Tingwall Airport, Sumburgh Airport, and on Ferries. Use of bus stops to display other information (i.e.

Appendix A

Progress Report on the Development of Shetland Transport Strategy – April 2006

1. Introduction

This note updates the Transport Strategy Member Officer Working Group of progress made since the last meeting of the group on 02 March 2006. The main areas of progress have been on:

- Completion of Final Consultation Reports;
- Strategic Environmental Appraisal Scoping Report;
- Confirmation of Key Issues with Officer Working Group;
- Confirmation of Vision and Objectives with Officer Working Group; and
- Confirmation of Options for Appraisal.

2. Consultation Reports

Following officer review of the draft consultation reports (Summary Report, Community Consultation Report, Stakeholder Consultation Report), each has now been finalised. A copy of each report will be available in the Members' Lounge following the meeting.

3. Strategic Environmental Appraisal

The Transport Strategy is being accompanied by a Strategic Environmental Appraisal (SEA), as required by European and Scottish legislation. The process is being undertaken in parallel with the development of the Transport Strategy. The first draft of the SEA Scoping Report has been prepared, and is currently subject to officer review. Following this review, it is due to be submitted to the Scottish Executive's SEA Gateway. This allows for the first stage of statutory consultation with Historic Scotland, Scottish Natural Heritage and Scottish Environmental Protection Agency. Outcomes from this consultation will be used to inform the draft Environmental Report, which will be issued at the same time as the draft Transport Strategy.

4. Issues, Objectives and Options

The attached document provides a draft of the Issues, Objectives and Options report, which is also being finalised prior to submission to the Scottish Executive.

- Chapter 2 of the report provides an overview of the key consultation outcomes, previously reported to the MOWG;
- Chapter 3 of the report provides a summary of the key drivers, constraints, and uncertainties that need to be considered in relation to the Transport Strategy;
- Chapter 4 of the report provides confirmation of the key problems and opportunities to be tackled by the Transport Strategy;
- Chapter 5 confirms the wider policy context for the Transport Strategy;
- Chapter 6 sets out a Vision for the Partnership, and a proposed set of guiding principles;

- Chapter 7 provides a set of Transport Objectives for the Transport Strategy;
- Chapter 8 outlines the External Objectives to which the strategy will also contribute; and
- Chapter 9 details the range of Options to be appraised during the next stage of Strategy development.

The following sections highlight particularly important aspects for Members' consideration.

4.1 Vision

Attention is drawn to the proposed Vision for the Partnership.

The vision for the partnership is to develop an effective, efficient, safe and reliable transport system for Shetland. The transport system will comprise of an integrated network of accessible, and affordable internal, inter-island and external links, which will contribute to the development of a safe, healthy, vibrant and inclusive society, a diverse, successful and self-sufficient economy, and enhanced environmental quality.

4.2 Principles

A draft set of principles is also proposed to accompany the vision, intended to outline the core values of the partnership in relation to its operation and decision making process.

- sustainability We will work to ensure that our actions are sustainable and meet the needs of the current generation of Shetland's people without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs
- accessibility and inclusion We will ensure that our actions improve Shetland citizens' ability to access services and will take account of all factors that create a barrier to this. We will encourage equal opportunities for all.
- **accountability** We will make ourselves answerable to the communities and people of Shetland and keep them informed of, and seek their views on, what we are doing.
- **partnership** We will work together with our partners and Shetland's people to achieve our vision and will encourage communities to realise their important role in development of the transport system
- evidence-based We will ensure that our actions are based on clear evidence and information and are derived from what the community wants, with investment decisions based on an objective appraisal process.
- *efficiency* We will aim to be as efficient as possible with resources and use them to provide as effective services as possible, maximising opportunity for external support.
- **compliance** It is necessary to ensure that all RTP actions comply with legislative and regulative provision and competence.

4.3 Objectives

Chapter 7 of the attached report presents a series of draft objectives which have been proposed taking into account consultation, problems and opportunities, constraints and uncertainties. They have been developed in line with RTS guidance, which highlights the following aspects:

- Objectives will steer the appraisal and prioritisation of projects and initiatives for transport in the region.
- Objectives should be SMART Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant and Timed. They should also be challenging.
- They should be written in a way that it will be clear when they are achieved and that progress can be measured along the way.

- They may be presented as broad themes supported by a number of more precise objectives.
- They can be supported by lower-level targets and performance indicators for particular programmes or services.
- Objectives should focus on the key ambitions of the RTP, informed by the RTP's vision, problems identified and prioritised through the work on scoping, and by the 5 key objectives and National transport objectives of the Scottish Ministers.
- They should express what the ultimate outcome should be, rather than specifying a particular solution.

The objectives are grouped under each of the five national transport objectives, and are split into the three main themes of the RTS – external links, inter-island links and internal links.

4.4 Options

The final strategy will be made up of a whole series of measures relating to external links, inter-island links, and internal links. It is noted that within each of these categories there will be measures that are non-discretionary. The measures related to external links are largely confined to the RTP seeking to influence the actions of others.

We have sought to generate five alternative packages of measures that can be used within the appraisal process, as follows:

- Scenario A Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through the broad continuation of policies and approaches contained in the current LTS, the current levels of public transport provision, and broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure
- Scenario B Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased facilitation of personal mobility, reduced levels of publicly provided transport, and broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure.
- Scenario C Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased facilitation of personal mobility, reduced levels of publicly provided transport, but increased amounts of capital expenditure.
- Scenario D Seeks to achieve the vision and objective through increased provision of public transport services, an emphasis on social inclusion, and broadly similar amounts of capital expenditure.
- Scenario E Seeks to achieve the vision and objectives through increased provision of public transport services, an emphasis on social inclusion, but increased amounts of capital expenditure.

Alternative sets of measures that could fall into each of these scenarios are provided within Tables 9.2, 9.3 and 9.4 at the rear of the attached report.

5. Appraisal

The appraisal process will seek to consider the overall impacts of each of the alternative packages of measures, and advise on the most suitable range of measures to be progressed within the draft RTS. The appraisal process will consider:-

- Fit with vision and objectives
- Affordability
- Technical Feasibility
- Operational Feasibility
- Public Support
- Environmental Impacts
- Safety and Security
- Economic Impacts (both in terms of transport efficiency and wider economic impacts)
- Accessibility and Social Inclusion
- Integration in terms of transport, but also other policies.

Outcomes from the appraisal process will continue to be refined within the production of a 5 year implementation plan.



Shetland Islands Council

REPORT

To: Infrastructure Committee

02 May 2006

From: Network Manager

Roads

Infrastructure Services Department

TRAFFIC REGULATION ORDERS, ETC. PROGRESS REPORT

1. Introduction

1.1 The purpose of this report is to inform the Infrastructure Committee of the Traffic Orders etc. made in 2005/06 and to provide an overview of the progress of those that are currently being promoted.

2. Links to Council Priorities

- 2.1 Key Aims of the Council's Local Transport Strategy include:
 - Reduction of social exclusion,
 - Improved safety for all road users, and
 - Promotion of better health and fitness.

2.2 Objectives include:

- improve environmental conditions by promoting traffic calming ensures that increase the safety of all road users.
- make improvements to the road network in order to support gains in safety, environmental, accessibility, integration or economic terms.
- maximise facilities for walking and cycling as an alternative means of transport.

3. Completed Permanent Traffic Orders etc. (By Council Ward in Lerwick and Community Council Area)

3.1 The following Orders have been made and/or introduced since February 2005:

Lerwick North Central

SIC (Cheyne Crescent, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

SIC (Burgh Road, Lerwick) (Parking Places for Disabled Person's Vehicles) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

SIC (Gilbertson Road, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

SIC (Bruce Crescent, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

SIC (Haldane Burgess Crescent, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

Lerwick South Central

SIC (Bells Road Etc) (20 Mph Speed Limit) Order 2004:

Made in 2004. Signs on Bells Road were in place shortly thereafter. Signs on Gilbertson Road were erected recently following construction of build-outs at the junctions with South Road and Hayfield Lane.

Bells Road Traffic Calming:

This Order was made in January 2005 following a report to this committee. It will introduce a road hump on the top section of Bells Road opposite the bus layby The road hump is due to be constructed this summer.

SIC (St Olaf Street, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by staff at King Erik House for use by residents.

Lerwick North

SIC (Norstane, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle)
Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area, also revoked the Order for an existing space in Norstane that was no longer needed.

SIC (Voderview, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area. Recently made so road markings are not yet in place.

Lerwick Breiwick

SIC (Various Roads, Lerwick) (Prohibition and Restriction of Waiting) (Variation No 3) Order 2004:

Varied the existing town wide parking Order to allow the introduction of yellow lines on Lovers Loan. These have yet to be marked on site.

SIC (Stouts Court, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

Lerwick Harbour and Bressay

SIC (Queens Lane, Lerwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

Upper Sound, Gulberwick and Quarff

SIC (Gulberwick) (30 Mph Speed Limit) Order 2005:

Promoted following the publication of new guidelines, by the Scottish Executive, that aims to achieve a standard speed limit of 30 mph in villages and settlements.

Sandsting, Aithsting and Weisdale

SIC (Sandsound) (Stopping Up) Order 2005:

The Order was referred to the Scottish Ministers for their determination on 26 June 2002. Following consideration of objections the Ministers decided to confirm the order on 15 March 2005.

Cunningsburgh and Sandwick

SIC (Veester Hill, Sandwick) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Requested by a disabled person resident in the area.

Nesting, Whiteness, Girlsta and Gott

SIC (A971 Etc at School, Whiteness) (Variable 20 Mph Speed Limit) Order 2004:

The Order was made in September 2004. The electricity connections, provided by Scottish and Southern Energy, are now in place. The signs have recently been erected on site.

Whalsay

SIC (Symbister, Whalsay) (30 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2005:

Extended the existing 30 mph speed limit to take account of recent housing developments and new guidelines for the introduction of speed limits. The limit was also extended into the harbour area

following a request from the community council and the Northern Constabulary. The signs have recently been installed.

SIC (Isbister, Whalsay) (30 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2005: Introduced a new 30 mph speed limit on the roads running through Isbister and on the way to Nisthouse. Requested by the community council and the Northern Constabulary. The signs have recently been installed.

SIC (Brough, Whalsay) (30 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2005: Introduced a new 30 mph speed limit on the roads running through Brough, again following a request from the community council and the Northern Constabulary. The signs have recently been installed.

4. Permanent Traffic Orders etc. in Progress (By Council Ward in Lerwick and Community Council areas elsewhere)

4.1 The following Orders are currently being promoted. The procedures for making most of the permanent Orders are enclosed in Appendix 1.

Lerwick North

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista to Heogan) Road Scheme 2005: This Order, along with various other "consents", would permit the construction of a bridge across the navigable waters of Bressay Sound. Consultation continues with a number of objections received.

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista) (Stopping Up) Order 2005:

This Order would remove the "public right of passage" over sections of existing road. Consultation continues with a number of objections received.

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista to Heogan) (40 MPH Speed Limit) Order

Would extend the existing 40 Mph Speed Limit on the Upper Gremista to Greenhead Road along the Bressay Bridge and on to the end of the Heogan Road. The draft is prepared and the Order will be promoted when the bridge is nearing completion.

SIC (Bressay Bridge) (Clearway) Order 2005:

Would prohibit vehicles from stopping on the Bressay Bridge. The draft is prepared and the Order will be promoted when the bridge is nearing completion.

Old North Road Speed Cushion:

This traffic-calming scheme would introduce an additional speed cushion at the north end of the Old North Road. This is being proposed following a request from residents of Staneyhill to address the "rat-running" problem on their street. The situation is

being assessed following the recent widening of the Staneyhill road.

Lerwick Harbour and Bressay

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista to Heogan) Road Scheme 2005: See above for comments.

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista) (Stopping Up) Order 2005:

The final version of this Order did not include any sections of road on the Bressay side of the bridge.

SIC (Bressay Bridge, Gremista to Heogan) (40 Mph Speed Limit) Order 2005:

See above for comments.

SIC (Bressay Bridge) (Clearway) Order 2005: See above for comments.

Lerwick Sound

SIC (Oversund Road, Etc., Sound, Lerwick) (20 MPH Zone) Order 2006:

The promotion of this order, which would introduce a permanent 20 mph speed limit on Oversund Road as it passes the school grounds, was approved at the previous meeting of this committee on 18 October 2005. It is now at the final consultation stage with one objection received during initial consultation.

Oversund Road, Sound: Traffic Calming:

The promotion of this traffic-calming scheme, which is associated with the 20 mph zone, was also approved at the meeting of this committee on 18 October 2005. It is also at the final consultation stage with one objection received during initial consultation.

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Sumburgh Road at Sound Primary School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the A970 between Nederdale and the Upper Baila junction.

Upper Sound, Gulberwick and Quarff

SIC (Oversund Road, Etc., Sound, Lerwick) (20 MPH Zone) Order 2006:

See above for comments.

Oversund Road, Sound: Traffic Calming:

See above for comments.

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Sumburgh Road at Sound Primary School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006: See above for comments.

SIC (Tarland, Upper Sound) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Promoted to ensure a disabled resident has access to his off-street parking space which he claims is frequently blocked by inconsiderate parking. The final stage of consultation is complete with 3 letters of objection received. The provision of this disabled space is being reconsidered along with alternative solutions to the problem.

Cunningsburgh

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Sumburgh Road, Etc., at Cunningsburgh School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the A970 as it passes the school grounds.

Scalloway

SIC (Scalloway) (20 MPH Zone) Order 2006 and Craigpark Rd & Lover's Lane, Scalloway – Proposed Road Humps: A total of 225 questionnaires were sent out to each household in Scalloway that would be directly affected by the proposals. The return was 51% with 67% in favour of the 20 mph zone with traffic-calming on Craigpark Road/Lover's Lane and 32% against the proposals. However, a public meeting held earlier this month found that the majority of those in attendance were against the proposals. It was agreed at this meeting that the next step would be to measure vehicle speeds on Meadowfield Road and on Craigpark Road for a second time.

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Scalloway Road, Etc., at Scalloway Junior High School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. It has already received the approval of those attending the public meeting referred to above. The order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the A970 as it passes the school grounds.

Burra and Trondra

SIC (Old School Road, Trondra) (Stopping Up) Order 2006:

This Order would remove the "public right of passage" on a length of this road that is no longer required due to improvements to its north section. The adjacent landowners and community council were consulted initially. The community council may wish the "public right of passage" for pedestrians to be reserved. However, the

formal consultation process will proceed with the order as drafted. This means that following consultation Shetland Islands Council still has the option of relaxing the order to retain pedestrian rights.

Sandsting, Aithsting and Weisdale

SIC (Haggersta to Cova) (Stopping Up) Order 2006:

The Order was referred to the Scottish Ministers for their determination on 21 February 2003. The Scottish Executive requested additional information in August and September 2003. The last of the information was sent in mid-December 2003 and we are awaiting their response.

SIC (A971 Hellister, Weisdale) (Stopping Up) Order 2006:

The Order has been drafted and is awaiting approval from landowners before the consultation process begins. The Order would stop up an old unused section of the A971, at the Loch of Hellister, thereby allowing the solum of the old road to revert to the control of the landowners.

Nesting, Whiteness, Girlsta and Gott

SIC (South Nesting Loop Road, Etc. at Nesting Primary School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the roads past the school grounds and public hall.

Delting East and Lunnasting

SIC (Upper Lea, Firth) (Stopping Up) Order 2006:

The Order would stop up a number of old unused roads that are no longer a necessary part of the road network. The formal consultation process is almost complete. No objections have been received to date.

Delting West

SIC (Sullom Voe) (Stopping Up) Order 2005:

This was promoted, at the request of the terminal operators, to allow a gate to be erected thereby preventing access for the general public. The consultation process is complete but The Order cannot be made until SIC, Marine Operations have finalised the means of accessing the Construction jetty.

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Northmavine Road, Etc., at Brae Junior High School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the A970 as it passes the school grounds.

SIC (Gossaford, Brae) (Parking Place for Disabled Persons Vehicle) Order 2005:

Application form recently received from a disabled person resident in the area. Site visit will be arranged shortly to determine best location etc.

Northmavine, Muckle Roe and Busta

SIC (B9079 Eela Water to Ollaberry Road at Ollaberry School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the Order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The Order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the B9079 as it passes the school grounds.

SIC (A970 Lerwick to Northmavine Road at Urafirth Primary School) (Variable 20 MPH Speed Limit) Order 2006:

The initial draft of the Order has been prepared and will shortly be sent to the school board for their comments. The Order, as drafted, would introduce a part-time 20 mph speed limit on the A970 as it passes the school grounds.

Yell

SIC (Meadowbank Road, Burravoe, Yell) (Prohibition of Waiting) Order 2006:

See separate report on this agenda.

No Orders are being made in a particular ward if it is omitted from the above list.

5. Temporary Traffic Orders, etc.

5.1 During the course of 2004-05 a total of 45 Temporary Orders were made for road closures, speed limits, etc These were to allow works to be carried out safely by ourselves, utilities and others, and to allow various events to take place.

6. Financial Implications

6.1 There are no financial implications arising from this report.

7. Policy and Delegated Authority

- 7.1 The Infrastructure Committee has full delegated authority to act on all matters within its remit (Min Refs SIC 19/03 and 70/03) and for which the overall objectives have been approved by the Council, in addition to appropriate budget provision.
- 7.2 Delegated Authority was previously provided to the Executive Director, Infrastructure Services to promote permanent Traffic Orders,

etc. The Executive Director also has delegated authority to make Traffic Orders and to provide traffic calming measures when no objections have been received at public consultation stage (min ref 04/98). The Executive Director is however required to report to Committee any Orders made. When there are objections the matter must be referred to the Committee which has delegated authority in this situation.

7.3 Authority is delegated to the Executive Director of Infrastructure Services or his nominee to make temporary Orders, etc. (ref 78/92)

8. Recommendation

8.1 I recommend that the Committee note the contents of this report.

NH/SMG

Report Number: RD-03-06-F

APPENDIX 1

Procedures for the making of Permanent Traffic Orders As at January 2006

The procedures are governed by the 'Local Authorities Traffic Orders (Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 1999'

- 1.Draft Order, notice and advertisement prepared by Roads Service
- 2.Draft Order, notice and advertisement are checked and revised by Legal Services.
- 3.Roads Service write to interested parties, organisations, and statutory consultees enclosing a copy of the proposed Order stating that any comments must be received within [28] days
- 4.Roads Service write in reply to any comments in an attempt to have any concerns allayed. This letter is copied to Legal Services.
- 5.The Order is advertised in the Shetland Times [and the notice is posted on site]. The advert is undersigned by the Executive Director of Infrastructure Services. Formal notice is also sent to those previously consulted under 3 above, not later than the date of the newspaper advert. The period specified for objections to be lodged must be not less than 28 days after the date of the advert.
- 6.Roads Service write in reply to any objections in an attempt to have them withdrawn. This letter is copied to Legal Services.
- 7. Should there be any formal objections a draft report to the [Infrastructure] Committee is prepared by Roads Service.
- 8.Draft report is checked and revised by Legal Services.
- 9. Report presented to [Infrastructure] Committee.

- 10. Certain Orders need to be referred to the Scottish Executive for the consent of the Scottish Ministers. The letter to the Scottish Executive would be written by Roads Service following a "resolution" by Committee but checked and revised by Legal Services. A public hearing may require to be held. Should the Scottish Executive confirm the proposal the Order will proceed.
- 11. Final copy of Order prepared for signing by Legal Services if the Committee decide to make the Order.
- 12. Order signed by Executive Director of Infrastructure Services.
- 13. Endorsed Order returned to Legal Services.
- 14. Roads Service send copies of Order to emergency services, etc., and advertise notice of making the Order in the Shetland Times.



Shetland Islands

Council

NOTE

Special Environment & Transport Forum North Atlantic Fisheries College, Scalloway Thursday 9 March 2006 at 10.30 a.m.

Councillors:

J A Inkster	I J Hawkins	J G Simpson	F Robertson
J H Henry	W Tait	L Angus	F Grains
G G Mitchell	J C Irvine	B J Cheyne	J P Nicolson
B Gregson	E J Knight	R G Feather	

In Attendance (Officers):

S Cooper, Acting Head of Transport K Duerden, Ferry Operations Manager Jennifer Anderson, Strategy Officer Michael Craigie, Capital Projects Unit Manager Anne Cogle, Service Manager - Administration Carol Manson, Committee Officer

Apologies:

Alastair Carmichael, MSP Catherine Hughson, Shetland Council of Social Service Peter Cockhead, NESTRANS

Invited to Attend:

Dominique Rommel, NHS Shetland
Donald Robertson, ASCC
David Paul, JBT Transport
Neil Leslie, Northwards
John Abernethy, NFUS
David Williamson, Shetland Line (1984) Ltd
Alan Wishart, LPA
David Watson, Shetland Enterprise
Paul Finch, Faber Maunsell
David Sandison, Shetland Aquaculture
Ruth Henderson, Seafood Shetland
Andy Steven, Visit Shetland
Bill Davidson, NorthLink Ferries

Also:

J White, White's Coaches Roberto Prever, NAOS/VISENTINI (Italy) Richie Fraser, Faber Maunsell Sandra Laurenson, Lerwick Port Authority Bill Main, BM Consulting Jim Budge, SLMG
Peter Dryburgh, NAFC Marine Centre
Laurence Marr
F D Marr
David Grant, NAFC
Eddie Barclay, NorthLink Ferries

Chairperson:

Mr J A Inkster, Chairperson of the Forum, presided.

Circular

The circular calling the meeting was held as read.

9/06 <u>Future Research Group – "Future Options for Northern Isles Ferry Services"</u>

Mr A Inkster welcomed everyone to the meeting, and began by outlining the remit and purpose of the Council's Forum meetings. He emphasised that the meeting was not decision-making, but was intended to aid the formulation and development of Council policy. Mr Inkster said that the meeting was intended to be fairly informal in its deliberations, and debate and participation was encouraged.

Mr Inkster went on to state that the purpose of the meeting today was to open the debate on establishing ways of improving the existing North Isles ferry service between Aberdeen and Orkney/Shetland which was prompted by the publication of Dr Alf Baird's report. A copy of the report is attached as Appendix 1.

Mr Inkster introduced the speakers to the meeting: Dr Alf Baird, head of the Maritime Research Group at Napier University; Mr Alan Burns, Director – Scottish Ports; Mr. Stephen Paterson, Chief Financial Officer Peterhead Port Authority; and, Mr Barclay Braithwaite, Chief Executive, Aberdeen Harbour.

Dr Baird gave a Powerpoint presentation of his report [Appendix 2], outlining the benefits and drawbacks of replacing the current four NorthLink vessels with two larger vessels. He presented his conclusions, taking account of statistics regarding the development of traffic flows and ship efficiency ratings. Dr Baird emphasised that his conclusions were based upon statistics relating to environmental and economic efficiency, and did not take into account the specifications required for the North Isles route. Dr Baird concluded with details regarding the possible use of alternative ports, opening up areas for potential market development, as well as reducing overall transport costs.

The Chairman thanked Dr Baird for his interesting presentation.

The port representatives from Rosyth, Peterhead and Aberdeen gave their views of the report on their respective ports position. All the port representatives said their ports would welcome any new business. Afterwards,

representatives of the port authorities answered questions put to them by Members and the public. A summary of the discussion is as follows.

It was recognised that there had been no consultation with ports during the production of Dr Baird's report, although it was noted that the report was intended only to start the debate of this issue, and a commitment was made by all parties to ensure wider consultation as the matter progresses.

With regard to the expansion and further development of the existing Northern Isles ferry service, it was suggested this could be achieved by replacing the existing four vessels with two larger vessels with a length of 186 metres. There were two options regarding the replacement of the existing vessels that requires further investigation, and that is whether to trade-in the current NorthLink ships and buy new vessels or charter vessels for the term of the contract. The use of larger vessels would have implications for Aberdeen harbour.

It was noted there were various concerns regarding Aberdeen harbour. One of the main issues was the lack of dredging to the harbour over the years, which had resulted in passengers having to wait outside the harbour in times of bad weather. It was suggested that further dredging might alleviate this problem. Mr Braithwaite said the harbour currently undertakes dredging exercises twice a year. He further advised the only vessels that were currently delayed from entering the harbour during bad weather were the NorthLink passenger ferries. Cargo vessels were not affected. He pointed out that in the 3½ years that NorthLink had serviced the route there had only been one occasion where the vessel had been diverted to an alternative port at Rosyth.

Mr Braithwaite went on to advise that Aberdeen harbour authority was currently undergoing a navigation study which would also identify future harbour users' needs. He confirmed that Shetland residents would be consulted in their capacity as harbour users, but he was unable to say at this stage whether there would be additional funding to improve the harbour in order to accommodate larger vessels. He said the harbour had the ability to take ships up to 160 metres in length, which is bigger than the current NorthLink vessels, but there were issues regarding passenger facilities being available only at the present terminal.

Mr L Angus congratulated Dr Baird for his report. He said this was the first time Shetland had been provided with an independent and objective report that has sparked debate. He said the Scottish Executive had failed to consult with the Shetland community prior to the North Isles Ferry Contract being awarded in 2002 and this had continued to be an unpopular experience. He welcomed the opportunity for Shetland residents to form part of Aberdeen harbour authority's survey.

After further discussion, the Acting Head of Transport summarised the points of discussion and added that he would arrange a meeting between Shetland Islands Council, Orkney Islands Council, Scottish Executive, port representatives and Dr Baird to address the issues raised today and for a

Shetland-wide consultation exercise to commence to determine issues such as:

- o Passenger destination preference.
- End destination of travel.
- o Lack of cabin space. Consider single person cabins.
- o The number of flight delays where air passengers have to use the boat as an alternative mode of travel to and from Shetland.
- o The survey be extended to mainland residents.

It was agreed that consultation would be held with stakeholders regarding the detailed scope of the study.

The Chairperson said that the views expressed today regarding reliability, convenience, comfort and value for money were the views that were of Shetland-wide concern. He thanked everyone for attending the meeting today.

The meeting concluded at 1 p.m.

A Inkster Chairperson

- 91 -



Shetland Islands Council

NOTE

Environment & Transport Forum Council Chamber, Town Hall, Lerwick Tuesday 18 April 2006 at 10.30 a.m.

Councillors:

J A Inkster J H Henry Capt G G Mitchell W Tait

In Attendance (Officers):

V Hawthorne, Development Plans Manager S Shearer, Planning Officer C Smith, Roads Engineer L Adamson, Committee Officer

Apologies:

B P Gregson
I J Hawkins
J Uttley, SNH
NHS Shetland
Shetland Council of Social Services

Invited to Attend:

F B Grains W Fraser, ASCC P Dinsdale, SEPA

Chairperson:

Mr J A Inkster, Chairperson of the Forum, presided.

Circular

The circular calling the meeting was held as read.

10/06 <u>Community Planning Board Update - Chairperson</u>

There were no updates to report to this meeting.

11/06 Flooding and Coast Protection Policy

The Forum considered a Discussion Document by the Head of Planning (Appendix 1).

The Development Plans Manager explained the background to this report, in that a Biennial Flood Report (which lists all the incidents of flooding in Shetland during the preceding two years) had been presented to Infrastructure Committee in November 2003. At that meeting, Members requested that work be undertaken to ascertain whether instances of coastal flooding were increasing in Shetland and to look into climate change and the Council's Flood and Coast Protection Scheme.

The Development Plans Manager advised that the Council was in a unique position in that all instances of flooding, including land and coastal inundations are reported to the Scottish Executive. The SIC is the only Council to report coastal flooding.

The Development Plans Manager summarised the issues with the operation of the SIC's current Flooding and Coast Protection Policy, as set out in Section 3.1 of the report. He advised that most applications received for works to protect properties were in excess of the £6,000, the maximum cost of a project to receive grant aid from the SIC, therefore the assistance available from the Council was often insufficient to support larger projects. The current grant scheme has a budget of £30,000 and cannot cope with the number of applications received. There are currently 12 applications on the books at an average cost of £100,000. He advised that the Coast Protection Act does not require the Council to provide grant assistance to undertake work associated with coastal protection, and the responsibility for protection against flooding rests with the property owner and not with the Council. He added that national government policy is moving towards adapting properties to withstand flooding, rather than mitigating against flooding.

The Development Plans Manager referred to the lack of staff resources in the Planning Service to undertake the various statutory works relating to planning legislation. He added the Service was under-resourced to do the increased amount of work that is now required relating to coastal protection and flooding. Due to the shortage of staff and lack of engineering expertise with the team, external consultants have to be routinely employed to appraise particular elements of applications for coastal protection works. The Development Plans Manager thanked the SIC's Roads Service for the amount of work they have undertaken over the years associated with flooding.

The Development Plans Manager gave a slide presentation entitled 'Shetland's Coastline" (copy of the slides are attached as Appendix 1A). The presentation included examples of vulnerable properties and steps taken to keep storms at bay, instances of storm damage and flooding in areas of Shetland and evidence of problematic erosion and poor coastal defences. Members of the Forum were then asked for their comments and views on how the Council should move forward with issues relating to coastal protection and flooding.

Mr J H Henry stated that what was being addressed at the Forum was flooding, coastal erosion and the impacts of climate change on Shetland. The Development Plans Manager stated that that was the case as the issues were interrelated in terms of the current Council Policy and the Grants Scheme.

In response to a query from Mr W Tait, the Development Plans Manager advised that information relating to climate change and flood reporting were available on the Council's website and had been presented at the Forum that met at the NAFC in March 2005.

Captain G G Mitchell noted that it may not be cost effective to protect an individual property against coastal erosion, however it would be more reasonable for works to be undertaken to protect a number of properties or a whole settlement. He added that although the Council was currently going through a cost cutting exercise, it appeared that areas of coastal protection and flooding were being neglected. He suggested that the Council be asked to increase the money allocated to coastal protection and flooding to assist the Planning Service to cope with the work involved.

The Development Plans Manager advised that three or four applications are processed annually as they meet all the criteria of the Policy. However, there is also a stockpile of applications, with a number that do not meet the Policy due to the high cost of the works. While it is possible to report these to Committee to seek approval for the extra spending, presently it is felt that to do so would set a dangerous precedent, as further information is required regarding the issue of the level of protection.

In response to a query from the Chairman, the Development Plans Manager confirmed that there was a general awareness of the Council's Flooding and Coast Protection Scheme, however there was frustration with advertising the Policy due to its limited scope, and with the maximum grant level available the Council often cannot assist property owners to the extent that they need the assistance. The Policy and the prospect of the availability of grant assistance raise the expectations of the public.

Captain Mitchell said he was aware of maps showing the predicted areas of Shetland to be affected by the rise in sea level over the next 50 years and said that the properties and settlements in those areas would be those affected unless large amounts of money are spent. The Development Plans Manager advised that the Scottish Environmental Protection Agency (SEPA) were producing maps showing areas in Shetland prone to flooding and areas affected by coastal flooding and thereby erosion.

In response to a query, the Development Plans Manager suggested that a way forward would be for the Council to cease paying Coastal Protection/Flood grants for a number of years and to apply that budget

to commission consultants to carry out work on behalf of the Council on coastal protection and flooding to ensure that the Policy is refreshed and forward looking with priorities for action. The commissioned work would specify the requirements to manage the perceived impacts of climate change, ascertain the sum of money required to deliver the works to make the current protection function properly, indicate an annual figure for repairs and maintenance for the works carried out, and improve the long term approach. The Chairman said that he had concerns with employing consultants to carry out the work and suggested that the work should be carried out in-house.

Captain Mitchell said that more information was required before a viable Policy could be developed for the future. He added that the Council needs to grasp the issues relating to climate change and should be asked for an appropriate amount of money to do the work. Mr W Tait suggested that money should be put into protecting areas where there are housing, rather than protecting the coastline.

The Chairman suggested that the Development Plans Manager prepare a report to Infrastructure Committee outlining proposals for the type of works required, the staffing issues, benefits and costings, without utilising consultants at this stage. Mrs W Fraser suggested that rather than employing a consultant, the work could be carried out by someone employed on a temporary basis. The Development Plans Manager stated that the staffing situation within the Planning Service needs to be addressed. He advised that the Planning Service had historically employed an Engineer but doubted whether it would be possible to employ an Engineer in-house given the present cutbacks. However, it was hoped that the Engineer could be trained and retained as a permanent employee.

Members of the Forum agreed that the Development Plans Manager be asked to prepare a report to Infrastructure Committee.

12/06 <u>Items for Future Discussion</u>

The Chairman advised that there were no particular items for future discussion.

The meeting concluded at 11.35pm

A Inkster				
CHAIRPERSON				