

Environment and Transport Committee
Council Chamber, Town Hall, Lerwick
Monday 9 March 2020 at 10.00am

Present:

S Coutts	C Hughson
S Leask	R McGregor
A Priest	D Sandison
G Smith	R Thomson

Apologies:

P Campbell	A Manson	
------------	----------	--

In Attendance (Officers):

J Smith, Director of Infrastructure Services
D Coupe, Executive Manager – Roads
M Craigie, Executive Manager – Transport Planning
J Manson, Executive Manager - Finance
N Hutcheson, Team Leader – Roads Asset and Network
P Wishart, Solicitor
B Kerr, Communications Officer
L Malcolmson, Committee Officer

Chair:

Mr Thomson, Chair of the Committee, presided.

Circular:

The circular calling the meeting was held as read.

Declarations of Interests

Mr G Smith declared an interest in item 4 “Reinstatement of Removed Streetlighting”, as a resident in an area considered in the report. He advised he would leave the Chamber during consideration of the item.

Minutes

The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting held on 20 November 2019 on the motion of Mr Leask, seconded by Mrs Hughson.

06/20 **Infrastructure Directorate Performance Report**
Environment & Transport Committee Performance Report:
Quarter 3 to 31 December 2019 and Quarter 4 to 31 January 2020

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Infrastructure Services (ISD-06-20-F) that summarised the activity and performance of the Infrastructure Directorate for Quarter 3 and Quarter 4 to 31 January 2020.

The Director of Infrastructure Services introduced the main terms of the report and there followed discussion on the following:

- Climate Change – Partnership Working, Scottish Government Update, reporting, next steps, local and national issues.

- Fuel Pricing – staff will monitor fuel prices before entering into an 18 month fixed offer.

Decision:

The Committee **NOTED** the;

- plans and progress in 2019/20 and
- proposals for 2020/21 activity and priorities.

07/20 **2020/21 Budget and Charging Proposals - Environment & Transport Committee**

The Committee considered a report by the Executive Manager – Finance (F-017-F) that presented the budget and charging proposals for 2020/21.

The Executive Manager – Finance summarised the main terms of the report.

Reference was made to the fair funding for ferries deficit which now showed as an increase. The Executive Manager – Finance explained that a review of ferry costs had been submitted to the Scottish Government, and in doing so, additional factors such as maintenance, better presentation of revenue costs and lifespan and linkspan expansion were included in the figure provided. He explained that some of the costs had previously been held in the Capital Programme but that needed to be included in the overall cost review.

In responding to a question, the Director of Infrastructure Services advised that the increased services to the North Isles related to essential links, therefore here confirmed there would be no change to service levels on other routes.

The Director of Infrastructure Services also confirmed that the recent announcements relating to Scatsta Airport would not impact on the Tingwall Airport as there is no connection between the two airports.

It was noted that some charges had increased more than others and in responding to a question, the Director of Infrastructure Services advised that these increases would bring services in line with the cost of delivery. He confirmed that this had not been the case in previous years.

During debate, the Chair thanked staff across service areas for their work in reaching the current position. He said that the budget would look better if it was not for the lower ferry funding grant income received for the ferry service running costs. He noted that the ferry service was substantially the largest cost for this Council. The Chair made no apology for assuming that the Scottish Government would live up to its obligations but it was now important for Government Ministers to come forward and explain to the Shetland public why their obligations would not be fulfilled. He referred to the Government's statement that fairness was at the heart of the Government's budget, but he said that was not the case for Shetland. The Chair referred to the Council meeting later in the week, where he said difficult decisions would need to be made in terms of the Government settlement that could see a significant reduction to ferry services or across other services unless the Government fulfils its obligations.

Members expressed their disappointment at the Scottish Government's decision not to provide full and fair funding for Shetland's internal ferry service. It was noted that Shetland now had the biggest funding gap in Scotland, where other Island areas had received full funding for their ferry services. Member agreed that Shetland had been treated unfairly. The Chair said that Officers and Members could not have done more

to demonstrate Shetland's position and this had been done clearly, concisely in the evidence provided to the Scottish Government. He added that the next step was to continue to engage, in good faith, with Government Ministers who he again urged to explain to the Shetland public why they had not fulfilled their obligations.

During further discussion Members acknowledged that the Council would be asked to approve a further, unsustainable, draw on reserves to cover the cost of the ferry service.

The Chair, the Leader and Officers were praised for their efforts in the last year and they were thanked for conducting their business in a proper manner when trying to secure fair funding. A request was made however that the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) set out two scenarios going forward, one with no full funding, and the other with full funding, to demonstrate the problems faced by the Council. A further call was made for the new Finance Minister to explain the decision not to provide full and fair funding.

Mrs Hughson moved that the Committee approve the recommendations contained in the report. Mr G Smith seconded.

Decision:

The Committee **RECOMMENDED** to Policy and Resources Committee and the Council to approve the budget proposals for 2020/21 included in this report and set out in detail in the Budget Activity Summary (Appendix 2) and Schedule of Charges (Appendix 3) to be included in the Overall SIC Budget Book.

08/20 **Strategic Outline Case: B9082 Cullivoe Road Update & Strategic Outline Programme Methodology**

The Committee considered a report by the Executive Manager – Roads and Team Leader – Roads Asset and Network (RD-02-20-F) that provided an update on the Cullivoe Road improvements, and sought approval for the ranking process and timeline in relation to the Strategic Outline Programme.

The Executive Manager – Roads introduced the report.

In responding to questions, the Executive Manager – Roads advised that the timelines set for the Cullivoe Road improvements and the other projects listed could not be reduced by much. He explained the process from outline design to construction and explained that the Compulsory Purchase Order for land could not be progressed until the design had been approved. He said that it may be possible to gain time on some sections of a project but that would not be significant.

In terms of staff resources, the Executive Manager – Roads explained that there was currently a shortage of design staff but those in place would look at a number of options for Cullivoe in terms of outline design. In responding to a question regarding Levenwick he confirmed that the outline design work had been done and that had saved some time for that project.

The Executive Manager – Roads was asked if there was sufficient resilience on the Cullivoe Road to reach the 2027 timeline. The Executive Manager – Roads said that the existing road would continue to be closely monitored and repaired as necessary. He said that the repairs would be carried out at whatever level was necessary to keep the road open.

During debate, Members welcomed the prioritisation list and agreed that the programme would help to manage expectations in the wider community. It was also noted that capital programme funding was being reduced and that the progression of projects listed would depend on funding being available. The importance of the design work was acknowledged in order to progress a project when funding becomes available.

Mr Priest moved that the Committee approve the recommendations contained in the report. Mr Sandison seconded.

Decision:

The Committee

- **NOTED** that the Strategic Outline Case (SOC) for the Cullivoe Road has been prepared and was submitted to Assets, Commissioning and Procurement earlier in February and that the Asset Investment Group (AIG) recommendations will be reported to the Policy and Resources Committee; and
- **RECOMMENDED** that the Policy and Resources Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the Council **APPROVES** the ranking process and timeline, as detailed in the report for taking forward the remainder of the strategic road network improvements that are listed in the Strategic Roads Network Outline Programme ("the Programme"); and the inclusion in the 5 Year Asset Investment Plan of a new capital budget of £100k per year to enable advanced design of the schemes in the Programme.

(Mr G Smith left the Chamber)

09/20 **Reinstatement of Removed Streetlighting**

The Committee considered a report by the Executive Manager – Roads and Team Leader – Roads Asset and Network (RD-03-20-F) that sought approval for recommendations to reinstate street lighting, as requested by residents, at Cameron Way, Sandwich; Gutter Street, Baltasound; East Road, Uyeasound; Swinister Cul-de-sac, Sandwich and the Swinister Housing Estate, Sandwich.

The Executive Manager – Roads introduced the report, and advised of amendments required to table 1 of paragraph 4.5, under "Sent" Cameron way should read "8", Swinister Cul-de-sac" should read "8" and "Swinister Housing Estate should read "6". In referring to the comments received in Appendix 1, the Executive Manager – Roads advised that a further comment had been received and should be considered by the Committee. The letter was circulated to Members who were given five minutes to read its content (Annex 1). The Executive Manager – Roads advised that the additional comment did not change the detail presented in the report.

In responding to questions, the Executive Manager – Roads confirmed that this report covered all schemes within the Reduction Policy. He also confirmed that the lighting units use LED down lighters which reduces light pollution and uses only 40% of a normal bulb's energy. In terms of reducing the number of lighting units, the Executive Manager – Roads explained that this would leave dark areas and that there was clear guidance available that had to be followed.

The Chair noted this report followed a request from a Member that streetlighting should be reinstated if that was the overall wish in the community. He said that the

Council had sought responses from the public and the results had been presented in this report.

Mr Thomson moved that the Committee approve the recommendation contained in the report. Mr Leask seconded.

Decision:

The Committee RESOLVED to approve the recommendations, in Section 4.6, that the street lighting at Cameron Way, Sandwich; Gutter Street, Baltasound; East Road, Uyeasound; Swinister Cul-de-sac, Sandwich and the Swinister Housing Estate, Sandwich be reinstated as requested by residents.

The meeting concluded at 11.05am.

.....
Chair