

## Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:  (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, <a href="mailto:michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk">michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk</a>  Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO3 – Operate standard weekday timetable seven days per week.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	The current standard weekday timetable (operated Tuesday - Friday) would be operated at the weekends (Monday would remain the scheduled maintenance day).	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.19 million (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £2.73 million (rounded) per annum.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	<p>The islands of Fetlar and Unst are the most northerly inhabited islands within the archipelago. The island of Unst is separated from Yell by the Bluemull Sound, and Fetlar lies to the south of Unst and east of Yell.</p> <p>Unst is by far the larger of the two islands in terms of population, but both islands have close connections with neighbouring Yell and Shetland mainland.</p> <p>Transport connectivity is wholly delivered by a two-vessel triangular ferry service, which links Fetlar and Unst to each other and to neighbouring Yell. The ferry from Unst – Yell takes 10 minutes; from Fetlar – Yell takes 25 minutes; and from Unst – Fetlar 25 minutes.</p> <p>The ferry terminal on Unst is located at Belmont in the south-west of the island, some way south of the main settlement of Baltasound. Fetlar ferry terminal, Hamars Ness, hich has recently benefitted significant investment in a breakwater, is in</p>		

	<p>the north-west of the island. The Yell landfall is at Gutcher, which is in the north-east of the island and around 25 minutes' drive to Ulsta, where the ferry can be caught to Shetland mainland.</p> <p>The MV <i>Bigga</i> currently lies overnight at Gutcher, with her first service of the day being to Belmont. The MV <i>Geira</i> lies overnight at Hamars Ness, with her first service of the day being to Gutcher.</p>
Social Context:	<p>Population in <b>Unst</b> declined following the closure of RAF Saxa Vord in 2006 but is now relatively stable at the 600-650 mark. The availability of housing on Unst is reasonably good (although there are some local issues) but there are concerns that housing is of the 'wrong type' for retaining and attracting families. Healthcare in Unst is seen to be of a high standard, although there is a community concern about the lack of some resident specialist services. The school roll in Unst declined sharply with the closure of RAF Saxa Vord, but has recovered slightly since 2006.</p> <p><b>Fetlar</b> has experienced a significant recent decline in population (81 residents in 2013, down to 59 in August 2015) and the community is now very fragile. Limited on-island economic opportunities, a lack of appropriate housing and the closure of the island shop are amongst a number of factors cited as an issue. The lack of appropriate housing is deemed to be a problem on Fetlar. The island continues to have an on-island primary school and nursery, which is critical, but the roll in each is very low.</p>
Economic Context:	<p>The economic activity rate in <b>Unst</b> also declined with the closure of RAF Saxa Vord and the out-migration of a number of young and economically active families from the island. Whilst the standard of living remains good, the community highlighted the significant economic challenges faced by the island in the longer term.</p> <p>Unst has had its economic challenges in recent years but has now stabilised to some extent, albeit with a much smaller population. It was noted by HIE that there are some promising signs of growth in the local economy, with tourism and food &amp; drink being key growth industries, although the community note that this is small scale in nature.</p> <p><b>Fetlar</b> currently has a shortage of viable economic development opportunities, an issue the Fetlar Development Plan is seeking to address. The island has limited economic opportunities, with the bulk of employment concentrated in agriculture, small scale tourism and the public sector – travel to neighbouring islands and mainland is therefore essential. Overall, the Fetlar community explained that the reinstatement of fares on the Bluemull Sound coupled with the reduction in service provision as part of the 2013 budget cuts is seriously undermining the sustainability of the island.</p>
<b>Planning Objectives</b>	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive</b></p> <p>This option would significantly enhance the available capacity on the Bluemull Sound route at the weekend. The carryings analysis identified capacity issues on the 1550 ex Gutcher (summer and winter) on a Saturday and the 1205 (winter) and 1630 (summer) ex Belmont on a Sunday which this option would alleviate.</p>

TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting	<b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b> This option is not relevant for Bluemull Sound
TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.	<b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b> The level of service set out by this objective is already achieved on a Sunday, although there is significant dead time between connections.
TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.	<b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive</b> The option of running the weekday timetable seven days a week would make a moderate contribution to this objective by increasing the weekend service frequency to a level commensurate with weekdays.
TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.	<b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive</b> This option would equalise the level of connectivity across every day of the week, providing consistency on Bluemull Sound services.
TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.	<b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> This option would enhance the weekend service frequency, facilitating generally better connectivity with strategic transport connections.
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	This option is retained for further consideration. However, this option would see a major ramp up in weekend services and the potential implications for the timetable and crewing resources should be examined in more detail.
<b>Implementability Appraisal</b>	
Technical:	There is no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.

Operational:	There would be no operational issues associated with this option, although additional crew and fuel would be required (see below).	
Financial:	£537k increment to annual operating costs of £2.19m based on Option CO1.	
Public:	There was very little engagement from the Unst public with respect to ferry revenue options. Some support for this option from Fetlar residents.	
STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	x	There is likely to be a very minor negative impact associated with the increased emissions from operating extra sailings.
Safety:	x	The increase in service frequency at weekends is likely to generate additional vehicle kilometres, which would have a negative safety impact. However, any impact would be very minor.
Economy:	✓	There would be relatively minor benefits associated with this option. Whilst the length of the operating day would remain the same, the increased number of connections could have benefits for residents, tourists and locally traded services. Tourism in particular is a key growth area for Unst and facilitating weekend connectivity would add value.  A 7 day a week, (approximately) 17 hours operating day would also reduce the economic disadvantage of living on an island and could promote population retention and growth.
Integration:	✓	The increased frequency at the weekend would support improved transport connectivity through offering improved connections throughout the day.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓✓	The operation of the weekday timetable at the weekend would significantly enhance community accessibility, providing numerous additional connections to both Yell and Shetland mainland on a Saturday and Sunday.  It would also improve the comparative accessibility of the islands, bringing them closer into line with communities on Shetland Mainland.