

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option CO1 (Do Minimum): Replace the MV <i>Leirna</i> on a like-for-like basis.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	Any 'like-for-like' vessel would need to be slightly larger in anticipation of the continuing trend of vehicles becoming larger. It is estimated that a like-for-like vessel would be around 35m long and would carry around 130 passengers and 20 PCUs. The vessel would run at 10 knots and would hold an equivalent to the current MCA Class IV certificate. Fitting the vessel with an azimuth propulsion system would allow an element of interchangeability and consistency with other vessels in the fleet. It is assumed that the berthing structure and linkspan (small) at Bressay will be replaced.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £4.50 million.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £804k (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £760k (rounded) per annum.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	The island of Bressay is 7 miles long by 3 miles wide and is separated from Lerwick by the sheltered Bressay Sound.		

	<p>Rough grazing covers most of the island, and the coast is formed of steep cliffs and beaches.</p> <p>In many respects, Bressay benefits significantly from its proximity to Lerwick and the access to services that this provides. However, geographic proximity and good transport links can be something of a double edged sword for the island, with a constant challenge to prevent economic leakage and maintain local services.</p> <p>Transport connectivity is wholly delivered by the frequent ferry service, which links Bressay with Lerwick, the journey time being seven minutes. The MV <i>Leirna</i> currently lies overnight at Bressay.</p>
Social Context:	<p>Despite strong population growth towards the end of the 20th century, Bressay has experienced a recent decline in population, something which the recent closure of the school may accelerate. During our consultation with HIE, they expressed a concern that the island is becoming increasingly fragile.</p> <p>The lack of readily available social housing on Bressay and the relatively static property market suggests that housing could be a constraint to growth on the island and could have been a factor in the decline of its population.</p> <p>Bressay is the only one of the nine islands in this study where on-island nursery and primary school provision is not available. Whilst the rationale underpinning the closure of the school was sound, there is a potentially longer-term impact in terms of the attractiveness of the island for in-migrants.</p> <p>Medical provision for Bressay is provided by Lerwick Health Centre.</p>
Economic Context:	<p>There is limited on-island activity on Bressay, with the majority of residents being geared towards the Lerwick jobs market. The fishmeal factory is likely to be the largest single private sector employer. There has been an overall downturn in services in the island in recent years.</p> <p>Bressay has a very high economic activity rate (akin to that of Shetland as a whole), although the majority of full-time employees are likely to commute to Lerwick.</p>
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>This option would have no impact on capacity.</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive /</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p>

public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting	This option would have no impact on this objective.
TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not relevant for Bressay.
TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the frequency of the service.
TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the timetable.
TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on strategic connectivity.
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	This option will be retained for further consideration. Further more detailed analysis of supply and demand (present and forecast) is required to establish whether 1 * <i>Leirna</i> style vessel could meet the requirements of the route. This option could be combined with revenue options to extend the operating day.
Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	The berthing structure at Bressay would need to be replaced.
Operational:	There are no operational feasibility issues associated with this option.
Financial:	The capital cost would be £4.5 million, with annual revenue support estimated at £760K, a reduction of £44k per annum on the current day figure.
Public:	This option was identified as an acceptable ferry based option.

STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	✓	<p>The replacement of the MV <i>Leirna</i> with a more modern vessel gives rise to a potential reduction in emissions. There would be no other environmental issues associated with this option.</p> <p>Environmental Constraints The environmental constraints for the Bressay route are provided below for information</p> <p>Bressay Ferry Terminal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Residential properties within 150m to the north of the harbour (Maryfield House Hotel (not currently trading) within 180m) and in close proximity to fixed link (if previous line is used at Hogan) Easter Rova Head Geological SSSI approximately 4km north Gardie House Garden and Designed Landscape within 100m (to north) of harbour Listed buildings within 100m of harbour Coastal flooding risk Generally good air quality <p>Lerwick Port (Bressay Service Ferry Terminal)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Residential properties within 50m of the harbour Core path CPPL04 Coastal Walk Easter Rova Head Geological SSSI approximately 4km north Listed buildings within 100m Ferry terminal located in Lerwick Conservation Area
Safety:	Neutral	This option would have no impact on safety.
Economy:	Neutral	This option would have no impact in terms of economy, except in terms of the potential perception benefits from having a new modern vessel.
Integration:	Neutral	This option would have no impact on integration.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓	The replacement of the MV <i>Leirna</i> with a new vessel would deliver a minor benefit in terms of accessibility & social inclusion as a new vessel would meet current disabled access requirements.