

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option CO4: Supplement options C1 (like-for-like vessel) or C2 (larger vessel) with a passenger only vessel.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	This option includes the provision of a passenger only vessel to supplement any of the single ro-ro options (C1 or C2). It is assumed that this vessel would carry around 50-100 passengers and would travel at 8 knots. The timetable of this vessel would require further analysis but it is possible it would be tied up or used for charters outwith peak hours.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £500k-£1m.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £804k (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> Likely to require a marginal increase in revenue funding.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	<p>The island of Bressay is 7 miles long by 3 miles wide and is separated from Lerwick by the sheltered Bressay Sound. Rough grazing covers most of the island, and the coast is formed of steep cliffs and beaches.</p> <p>In many respects, Bressay benefits significantly from its proximity to Lerwick and the access to services that this provides. However, geographic proximity and good transport links can be something of a double edged sword for the island, with a constant challenge to prevent economic leakage and maintain local services.</p> <p>Transport connectivity is wholly delivered by the frequent ferry service, which links Bressay with Lerwick, the journey time being seven minutes. The MV <i>Leirna</i> currently lies overnight at Bressay.</p>		

Social Context:	<p>Despite strong population growth towards the end of the 20th century, Bressay has experienced a recent decline in population, something which the recent closure of the school may accelerate. During our consultation with HIE, they expressed a concern that the island is becoming increasingly fragile.</p> <p>The lack of readily available social housing on Bressay and the relatively static property market suggests that housing could be a constraint to growth on the island and could have been a factor in the decline of its population.</p> <p>Bressay is the only one of the nine islands in this study where on-island nursery and primary school provision is not available. Whilst the rationale underpinning the closure of the school was perhaps sound, there is a potentially longer-term impact in terms of the attractiveness of the island for in-migrants.</p> <p>Medical provision for Bressay is provided by Lerwick Health Centre.</p>
Economic Context:	<p>There is limited on-island activity on Bressay, with the majority of residents being geared towards the Lerwick jobs market. The fishmeal factory is likely to be the largest single private sector employer. There has been an overall downturn in services in the island in recent years.</p> <p>Bressay has a very high economic activity rate (akin to that of Shetland as a whole), although the majority of full-time employees are likely to commute to Lerwick.</p>
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>Passenger capacity has not been evidenced as a problem on this route. A passenger only vessel would not therefore contribute to this objective.</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</p> <p>A passenger only vessel would provide additional connections at peak times which could support commuters. Any impact is however likely to be relatively minor.</p>
<p><i>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>This objective is not relevant for Bressay.</p>

employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.		
TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive This option would increase the number of connections, with flexibility to offer a 100% increase in connections. However, these sailings would be passenger only.	
TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This Lerwick – Bressay route operates a standard and relatively consistent timetable. Any existing differentials could be addressed by a one vessel solution, so the impact of a two-vessel solution in this context is neutral.	
TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on strategic connectivity unless the passenger vessel started sufficient early in the morning, with a corresponding public transport connection to Sumburgh in Lerwick.	
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	This option is retained for further consideration. This option would provide a low cost means to substantially increase connections between Bressay and Lerwick. Given that the service would operate directly into the town centre, this option is worthy of further consideration. Community feedback is required on whether this option would attract public support.	
Implementability Appraisal		
Technical:	Minor harbour works would be required at Bressay to facilitate a foot passenger service.	
Operational:	Additional crew would be required to operate the passenger vessel.	
Financial:	The capital cost would be £0.5-£1 million, with a marginal increase in annual revenue support.	
Public:	A few comments were on this option at the public engagement but no widespread support was found.	
STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	x	Supplementing the replacement of the MV <i>Leirna</i> with a passenger only vessel would give rise to a minor increase in emissions through an increase in the number of sailings operated.

		<p>Harbour works are likely to be minimal, which would mean that any environmental impact would likewise be minimal.</p> <p>Environmental Constraints The environmental constraints for the Bressay route are provided below for information</p> <p>Bressay Ferry Terminal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential properties within 150m to the north of the harbour (Maryfield House Hotel within 180m) and in close proximity to fixed link (if previous line is used at Hogan) • Easter Rova Head Geological SSSI approximately 4km north • Gardie House Garden and Designed Landscape within 100m (to north) of harbour • Listed buildings within 100m of harbour • Coastal flooding risk • Generally good air quality <p>Lerwick Port (Bressay Service Ferry Terminal)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential properties within 50m of the harbour • Core path CPPL04 Coastal Walk • Easter Rova Head Geological SSSI approximately 4km north • Listed buildings within 100m • Ferry terminal located in Lerwick Conservation Area
Safety:	x	This option would have a minor negative impact on safety due to increased vessel running hours.
Economy:	✓	This option would record a moderate benefit in terms of the Economy criterion. The 50% increase in frequency would provide benefits associated with additional connections over the day. Any such impact is however likely to be very limited given the already high service frequency on the Lerwick – Bressay route.
Integration:	✓	This option would provide Bressay with a significant increase in frequency, supporting enhanced integration with public transport options in Lerwick, whilst also supporting various policies aimed at fostering the economic sustainability of island.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓✓	Supplementing the replacement of the MV <i>Leirma</i> with a passenger only vessel would deliver a moderate benefit in terms of accessibility & social inclusion through increasing the number of connections across the day, seven days a week.