

## Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

| Proposal Details   |   |  |   |
|--|---|--|---|
| Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:<br><br>(Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal) |   | Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, <a href="mailto:michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk">michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk</a><br><br>Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ |   |
| Proposal Name:   | Option CO6: Construct a new runway on Fair Isle.  | Name of Planner:   | Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates   |
| Proposal Description:  | This option would involve the construction of a replacement runway in Fair Isle with a view to improving the crosswind reliability of the air service (by aligning the runway direction with the Tingwall runway). The district of Rippack has been identified as a potential location, although no detailed surveying has been undertaken, whilst land ownership issues have not been considered.  | Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:   | <i>Capital costs/grant</i><br>Estimated at £400k plus land acquisition, although this is a very high level cost estimate at this stage.         |
|  |   |  | <i>Current revenue support</i><br>Not applicable  |
|  |   |  | <i>Annual revenue support</i><br>Not applicable   |
| Funding Sought From:<br>(if applicable)  | Transport Scotland  | Amount of Application:   | <i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i><br>Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above. |
| Background Information   |   |  |   |
| Geographic Context:  | Fair Isle lies about 20 miles south-west of the imposing Sumburgh Head. Just five kilometres long and three kilometres wide, it is mostly surrounded by cliffs, rising over 100 metres at Sheep Rock and almost 200 metres on the heavily indented west coast. The National Trust for Scotland took over ownership of the island in 1955 and prospective in-migrants must apply to the Trust for residency. Facilities include a shop & Post Office, the high quality bird observatory with accommodation, museum, pier, airfield and marina. |  |   |

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <p>Social Context:</p>   | <p>Fair Isle's population had shown relatively strong growth between 1981 and 2011, but the cumulative growth was wiped out between the 2011 and 2015, with the population now down to 55. The Fair Isle population is also both ageing and declining. Fostering population growth is a key element of the island's Development Plan</p> <p>Fair Isle is owned by the National Trust for Scotland and anyone who wishes to move there must apply to the Trust. The 2011 Census noted that Fair Isle has 26 households. The Community Profile suggests that housing in Fair Isle is in relatively low demand, although it is believed that consultation is required to identify the island's future housing need.</p> <p>Health indicators for Fair Isle are generally good, although there are concerns over various aspects of health provision consistent with other rural communities.</p> <p>The roll at Fair Isle primary school and nursery has declined in recent years, which is in keeping with the general decline and ageing of the population.</p>   |
| <p>Economic Context:</p>   | <p>The economic &amp; occupational structure of Fair Isle reflects the predominance of self-employment and cottage industries on the island.</p> <p>The Fair Isle Development Plan has set out a number of ambitious projects to secure the future of the island. The aim is to reverse the recent population decline and address the issue of an ageing population and the threat which that poses to the sustainability of services.</p> <p>The plan's proposals for developing the island include attracting up to 10 new people to the island in the next three to five years (growing the population by almost 20%), as well as creating and improving properties in the isle. There are also plans to upgrade and future-proof the island's electricity supply, whilst the islanders are working with Community Broadband Scotland to improve digital connectivity. Fair Isle will also continue to be attractive to tourists, particularly those visiting the high quality bird observatory on the island.</p> <p>Whilst there are a range of ambitious plans for Fair Isle, the Development Plan and numerous consultations over the years have highlighted the current transport connectivity of the island as a key constraint. The capacity limited air service coupled with the long, exposed and relatively uncomfortable ferry crossing is seen to be a deterrent to growing the population and attracting investment into the island. It can be argued that this issue requires to be resolved if the objectives of the development plan are to be delivered.</p> |
| <p><b>Planning Objectives</b></p>  |  |
| <p>Objective:</p>  | <p>Performance against planning objective:</p>   |
| <p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight</i></p> | <p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b></p> <p>It is estimated that the provision of a new runway on Fair Isle would reduce cancellations by around 5%.</p>   |

|  |   |
|--|---|
| travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland   | providing a small increment in capacity in terms of the air service.  |
| TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting  | <b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b><br>This objective is not relevant for Fair Isle.   |
| TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round. | <b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b><br>The improvement in reliability offered by this option would enhance time on mainland, at least to the extent that it would permit more of the currently timetabled connections to operate.   |
| TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.   | <b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b><br>This option would have no impact on the frequency of the air service (although it would allow more of the timetabled connections to operate).   |
| TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.   | <b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b><br>This option would have no impact on the timetable.  |
| TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.  | <b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b><br>The proposed new runway could potentially improve the reliability of the air service, potentially enhancing access to strategic transport connections. However, any impact would be minimal.   |
| Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:  | This option will not be retained for further consideration. Whilst this option could potentially assist in reducing cancellations at Fair Isle, the impact is likely to be minimal and is set against the cost of constructing a new runway and fully licensing the airfield. In addition, this option has the potential for significant negative environmental effects because the new runway would be located in an environmentally sensitive area. |
| <b>Implementability Appraisal</b>  |   |
| Technical:   | No detailed surveying has been undertaken, whilst land ownership issues have not been considered.   |

|                                     |   |   |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| Operational:                        | The position in relation to the existing Fair Isle runway would need to be considered.                    |   |
| Financial:                          | Estimated at £400k plus land acquisition, although this is a very high level cost estimate at this stage. |   |
| Public:                             | There was a degree of support for this option expressed through the public consultation.                  |   |
| <b>STAG Criteria</b>                |   |   |
| <b>Criterion</b>                    | <b>Assessment Summary</b>   | <b>Supporting Information</b>   |
| Environment:                        | xx  | The construction of a new runway on Fair Isle would have the potential for significant environmental effects because the new infrastructure would be located in a sensitive area. |
| Safety:                             | ✓   | The provision of a new runway would improve the reliability and potentially the safety of the air service in terms of reducing exposure to crosswinds.                            |
| Economy:                            | ✓   | The new runway would clearly support the economy criterion, but the overall magnitude of the improvement is likely to be relatively limited.                                      |
| Integration:                        | ✓   | This option would support the Fair Isle Development Plan through enhancing the reliability of the air service.  |
| Accessibility and Social Inclusion: | ✓   | The new runway would enhance accessibility and social inclusion through improving the overall reliability of the service. However, any such impact is likely to be very minor.    |