

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO2 – Increase the frequency of the air service to three rotations per day, seven days a week in summer and two rotations per day, seven days a week in winter	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	<p>This option would provide nine extra connections per week in summer and four extra connections in winter. The existing three rotations on a Monday would be retained.</p> <p>The Fair Isle airfield resource would need to be increased to accommodate this step change in service levels. In addition, Tingwall airfield is currently closed on a Sunday from May to September and on both Saturday and Sunday from October to April but would have to be opened and staffed appropriately to accommodate this option.</p> <p>Additional weekend fire cover would also be required on Fair Isle.</p>	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> Air service revenue support is not disaggregated by route
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> Air service revenue support is not disaggregated by route
Funding Sought From:	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i>

(if applicable)			Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	Fair Isle lies about 20 miles south-west of the imposing Sumburgh Head. Just five kilometres long and three kilometres wide, it is mostly surrounded by cliffs, rising over 100 metres at Sheep Rock and almost 200 metres on the heavily indented west coast. The National Trust for Scotland took over ownership of the island in 1955 and prospective in-migrants must apply to the Trust for residency. Facilities include a shop & Post Office, the high quality bird observatory with accommodation, museum, pier, airfield and marina.		
Social Context:	<p>Fair Isle's population had shown relatively strong growth between 1981 and 2011, but the cumulative growth was wiped out between the 2011 and 2015, with the population now down to 55. The Fair Isle population is also both ageing and declining. Fostering population growth is a key element of the island's Development Plan</p> <p>Fair Isle is owned by the National Trust for Scotland and anyone who wishes to move there must apply to the Trust. The 2011 Census noted that Fair Isle has 26 households. The Community Profile suggests that housing in Fair Isle is in relatively low demand, although it is believed that consultation is required to identify the island's future housing need.</p> <p>Health indicators for Fair Isle are generally good, although there are concerns over various aspects of health provision consistent with other rural communities.</p> <p>The roll at Fair Isle primary school and nursery has declined in recent years, which is in keeping with the general decline and ageing of the population.</p>		
Economic Context:	<p>The economic & occupational structure of Fair Isle reflects the predominance of self-employment and cottage industries on the island.</p> <p>The Fair Isle Development Plan has set out a number of ambitious projects to secure the future of the island. The aim is to reverse the recent population decline and address the issue of an ageing population and the threat which that poses to the sustainability of services.</p> <p>The plan's proposals for developing the island include attracting up to 10 new people to the island in the next three to five years (growing the population by almost 20%), as well as creating and improving properties in the isle. There are also plans to upgrade and future-proof the island's electricity supply, whilst the islanders are working with Community Broadband Scotland to improve digital connectivity. Fair Isle will also continue to be attractive to tourists, particularly those visiting the high quality bird observatory on the island.</p> <p>Whilst there are a range of ambitious plans for Fair Isle, the Development Plan and numerous consultations over the years have highlighted the current transport connectivity of the island as a key constraint. The capacity limited air service coupled with the long, exposed and relatively uncomfortable ferry crossing is seen to be a deterrent to growing the</p>		

	population and attracting investment into the island. It can be argued that this issue requires to be resolved if the objectives of the development plan are to be delivered.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive The air service is the lifeline mode of transport for Fair Isle, with the majority of personal and business travel made by air. The service is well used throughout the year, with tourism peaks in the summer and around avian migration periods. At present, capacity is a key issue on Fair Isle services and the addition of nine extra connections per week in summer and four in winter would provide a significant enhancement in this respect.
<i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option is not relevant for Fair Isle.
<i>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive This option would make a major positive contribution to this objective. The additional air connections proposed would provide the required half day in Lerwick seven days week. There would also be an opportunity for 'full day' trips in summer.
<i>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive This option would provide a significant increase in frequency on the Fair Isle service - nine extra connections per week in summer and four extra connections in winter.
<i>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</i>	Performance against. Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive This option would provide a consistent week round timetable – 3 connections per day in summer / 2 connections per day in winter.
<i>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive

<p><i>be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</i></p>	<p>This option would generate a moderate positive in terms of its contribution to strategic transport integration. It would allow seven day connections with onward services throughout the year, although reliability issues would continue to mean that some people would travel the day before a connecting flight or ferry.</p>	
<p>Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:</p>	<p>This option is retained for further consideration. A 7-day per week service may have disproportionate costs associated with the all-year weekend opening of Tingwall. However, the principle of increasing the number of weekday flights to Fair Isle should be explored further, particularly in conjunction with any move to a shared ferry service. It should also be noted that a basic requirement of the RSM is the provision of a 7-day service which Fair Isle does not currently have.</p>	
<p>Implementability Appraisal</p>		
<p>Technical:</p>	<p>There are no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.</p>	
<p>Operational:</p>	<p>There are likely to be a range of operational issues with this option in terms of flying hours, aircraft utilisation, reliability and recovery time.</p> <p>In addition, Tingwall airfield would need to be opened and crewed at the weekend, whilst additional weekend fire cover would be required on Fair Isle. Alternatively the weekend service could potentially operate from Sumburgh.</p>	
<p>Financial:</p>	<p>Air service revenue support is not disaggregated by route. This option could however be relatively expensive, as it would require additional fuel and potentially additional pilot hours. It would also require the opening and crewing of Tingwall airfield at the weekend, whilst weekend fire cover would also be required on Fair Isle.</p>	
<p>Public:</p>	<p>Some concerns were expressed regarding the resource implications for those who currently operate the airstrip of a full 7-day service but there is support for more flights in principle.</p>	
<p>STAG Criteria</p>		
<p>Criterion</p>	<p>Assessment Summary</p>	<p>Supporting Information</p>
<p>Environment:</p>	<p>x</p>	<p>There is likely to be a very minor negative impact associated with the increased emissions from operating additional flights.</p>
<p>Safety:</p>	<p>x</p>	<p>There would be a small negative safety impact associated with the additional flights generated under this option. Any impact would however be minimal.</p>
<p>Economy:</p>	<p>✓✓✓</p>	<p>A significant enhancement to the air service would be transformative to the Fair Isle economy, so long</p>

		<p>as the service was reliable and provided sufficient recovery capability during periods of poor weather. The principal benefit of an enhanced air service is that it would assist in tackling the significant capacity constraints associated with the current services, supporting resident and tourism travel. There would be a series of TEE benefits associated with enhanced frequency, whilst EALI benefits would emerge in terms of residents, tourists, locally traded services and manufacturing & processing (e.g. Fair Isle crafts).</p>
Integration:	✓✓	<p>This option would have a highly positive impact on the Fair Isle economy and would also support the Fair Isle Development Plan. It would also be consistent with the RSM defined service levels.</p> <p>This option would also make a moderate contribution to strategic transport integration (see TPO5)</p>
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓✓✓	<p>The enhanced air service would make a significant contribution to improving both community and comparative accessibility. Fair Isle residents would be better able to access key personal services, business opportunities and onward travel connections, whilst travel to the island would become less problematic.</p>