

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option CO1 (Do Minimum): Replace the MV <i>Snolda</i> on a like-for-like basis	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	The new vessel would be approximately 25m long and would carry 12 passengers and 6 PCUs. The vessel would run at 9 knots, would be twin-screwed and would be a Class VIII A cargo ship. On life expiry the current linkspans would need to be replaced at both Papa Stour and West Burrafirth.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £3.25m.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £428k per annum
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £415k per annum
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	The island of Papa Stour lies to the north of Shetland West Mainland. The Papa Stour ferry departs from West Burrafirth on Shetland West Mainland and the crossing to the island takes around 40 minutes. The island can also be accessed by an air service from Tingwall airstrip.		
Social Context:	Papa Stour has the smallest population of the islands served by the Council inter-island transport network. The island has a population of 15 spread across nine households. There is a problem for landowners, who own property on the island but rarely live there as a result of poor connectivity and job opportunities. There is no fire cover within the island as well as no ambulance cover. There is one child in the primary school. There is no shop on the island, although there is a Post Office at the pier.		

Economic Context:	The Papa Stour economy is almost wholly dependent on small scale crofting and a handful of public sector jobs. The cost of living is higher on Papa Stour than most other areas of Shetland due to the added expense of delivering materials, fuel, food and supplies. This often has a detrimental impact on the island and adds to the challenges for the local population. Access to services and social events is also highly restricted.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral A like-for-like replacement for the MV <i>Snolda</i> would offer the same capacity as the current vessel - 12 passengers and 6 PCUs.
TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not considered relevant for Papa Stour.
TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would not increase connectivity to the mainland or time in Lerwick. However, the provision of a new vessel would remove the risk of a catastrophic failure of the current vessel as she gets older.
TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the frequency of the service.
TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the timetable.

<p>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>This option would have no impact on strategic connectivity.</p>	
<p>Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:</p>	<p>This option will be taken forward for further consideration as it offers the minimum required like-for-like replacement of the current vessel. The current vessel is generally adequate for Papa Stour. A newer vessel of similar design could presumably be certified for a slightly higher number of passengers which would address the very occasional problems in this respect. A new vessel could potentially be shared with Foula, making more intensive use of the asset.</p>	
<p>Implementability Appraisal</p>		
<p>Technical:</p>	<p>There are no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.</p>	
<p>Operational:</p>	<p>Crew induction training in the new vessel would be required.</p>	
<p>Financial:</p>	<p>The capital cost would be £3.25 million, with annual revenue support estimated at £415k per annum, a reduction of approximately £13k per annum on the current day figure.</p>	
<p>Public:</p>	<p>Initial public consultation suggested that this option would be acceptable to the Papa Stour community, although it is likely that a vessel certified to carry more passengers would be preferred.</p>	
<p>STAG Criteria</p>		
<p>Criterion</p>	<p>Assessment Summary</p>	<p>Supporting Information</p>
<p>Environment:</p>	<p>✓</p>	<p>The replacement of the ageing MV <i>Snolda</i> with a more modern vessel gives rise to a potential reduction in emissions. There would be no other environmental issues associated with this option.</p> <p>Environmental Constraints</p> <p>The environmental constraints at the ports on the Papa Stour route are provided below for information:</p> <p>Papa Stour Constraints</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential properties in proximity to terminal • Core path CPPWS10 passes close to ferry terminal • Harbour within Special Area of Conservation (SAC) and Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) and within 200m of a Special Protection Area (SPA) • Scheduled monument and listed buildings in proximity (200m) • Coastal flooding risk • Good air quality

		<p>West Burrafirth</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> One residential property within 250m of pier Scheduled Monument within 200m north east of harbour Coastal flooding risk Good air quality
Safety:	✓	The current vessel, the MV <i>Snolda</i> , is single screwed. This presents a safety risk if the single propeller were to fail. Any new vessel would be built as a twin-screwed vessel, reducing / minimising this risk.
Economy:	Neutral	This option would not, on the whole, have any notable economic impact as it simply provides continuity of service. The provision of a new vessel would perhaps increase the attractiveness of Papa Stour as a place to live, visit and do business, but any such impact would be marginal and not possible to quantify.
Integration:	Neutral	This option would have no net impact on integration.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	Neutral	This option would have no net impact on accessibility & social inclusion.