

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO1a: Increase the frequency of the service to two return crossings seven days per week. Option RO1b: Option RO1a combined with the withdrawal of the Papa Stour air service.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	Option RO1a – The current timetable would be expanded to provide a twice daily return sailing between Shetland mainland and Papa Stour (7 or 8 additional sailings per week). At present, there are two return crossings three days per week and one return crossing on a Sunday. (Saturday pm sailing does not operate in winter) Option RO1b – Option RO1a but with the withdrawal of the air service to Papa Stour (two return flights on a Tuesday)	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £428k per annum
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £709k per annum
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			

Geographic Context:	The island of Papa Stour lies to the north of Shetland West Mainland. The Papa Stour ferry departs from West Burrafirth on Shetland West Mainland and the crossing to the island takes around 40 minutes. The island can also be accessed by an air service from Tingwall airstrip.
Social Context:	Papa Stour has the smallest population of the islands served by the Council inter-island transport network. The island has a population of 15 spread across nine households, There is a problem for landowners, who own property on the island but rarely live there as a result of poor connectivity and job opportunities. There is no fire cover within the island as well as no ambulance cover. There is one child in the primary school. There is no shop on the island, although there is a Post Office at the pier.
Economic Context:	The Papa Stour economy is almost wholly dependent on small scale crofting and a handful of public sector jobs. The cost of living is higher on Papa Stour than most other areas of Shetland due to the added expense of delivering materials, fuel, food and supplies. This often has a detrimental impact on the island and adds to the challenges for the local population. Access to services and social events is also highly restricted.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The operation of a twice daily return between West Burrafirth and Papa Stour would provide wholly additional ferry capacity on a Monday, Tuesday and Thursday, as well as one additional sailing on a Sunday and on a winter Saturday. With the current vessel, this would equate to at least 84 additional passenger spaces and 42 additional PCU spaces over the course of a week. Total one direction ferry capacity over the week would be 168 passenger spaces and 84 car spaces, a significant uplift on the currently available summer capacity (84 passenger spaces and 42 PCUs).</p> <p>Our analysis suggests that capacity is rarely a major issue in Papa Stour, although the 12 person passenger certificate can be an issue during the summer tourist season. This issue is amplified by the low service frequency. Therefore, any option which increases capacity will have a positive impact against this objective.</p> <p>Option RO1b - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive There are two return flights between Papa Stour and Tingwall per week, both on a Tuesday. Whilst the removal of the air service would lead to a loss of up to 16 one-direction passenger seats per week, this would be more than offset by the increase in ferry provision.</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive</i></p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not considered relevant for Papa Stour.</p>

<p>public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</p>	<p>Option RO1b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not considered relevant for Papa Stour.</p>
<p>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive The provision of a twice daily return would significantly enhance the connectivity of Papa Stour – residents would be able to access the mainland daily and the island would be similarly accessible to those travelling from the mainland. A timetable could be designed which would facilitate a half day in Lerwick seven days a week.</p> <p>Option RO1b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The benefits of Option RO1a would still stand, although the loss of the Tuesday air service return would have a negative impact on the island, in that it would remove the connection which facilitates the longest amount of time in Lerwick on any given day (around 5 hours in summer).</p>
<p>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive This option would not significantly change the scheduled time between services on days where there are currently two return sailings (i.e. Wednesday, Friday and Saturday (summer)). However, by adding additional connections into the timetable, it would reduce daily gaps in connectivity experienced on a Sunday and winter Saturday (one return sailing only), Monday, Tuesday (although there is an air service) and Thursday.</p> <p>Option RO1b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive The benefits of Option RO1a would still stand, although the possibility of a combined air / ferry trip on a Tuesday would no longer exist.</p>
<p>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive This option would provide a consistent number of crossings by day and, if desired, timetable across the week.</p> <p>Option RO1b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The benefits of Option RO1a would still stand, although Tuesday connectivity would be reduced.</p>
<p>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</p>	<p>Option RO1a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive This option would:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Remove gaps by day in terms of connectivity, allowing Papa Stour residents same day connections with NorthLink ferry services and air services on Mondays and Thursdays. • Residents would also be able to take a car on a Tuesday, where currently only an air connection is available. • Residents would be able to connect with the Sunday evening NorthLink departure, which is not currently possible without leaving on the Saturday evening (Saturday morning in winter).

	<p>The enhanced ferry services would not, however, allow connections from Papa Stour to the first morning outbound flights or from the last evening inbound flights back to Papa Stour.</p> <p>Option RO1b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The impacts would be as per Option RO1a.</p>
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	<p>Option RO1a This option will be retained for further consideration. The option meets the RSM requirement of a 7-day service but not the Model number of sailings per day. It would also enable substantial time in Lerwick on a daily basis. It should be noted though that previous investment in connections to Papa Stour has not stemmed the recent trend in depopulation.</p> <p>Option RO1b This option will be retained for further consideration. There would be very little rationale for the continuation of the current minimal air service if the ferry service frequency was increased given the relatively short journey times to Lerwick.</p>
Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	<p>There are no technical feasibility issues in relation to Option RO1a.</p> <p>The only technical issue surrounding Option RO1b is the fate of the Papa Stour airstrip, specifically whether this should be maintained in the longer-term.</p>
Operational:	<p>Both Options RO1a and RO1b would require additional ferry crew / crewing hours. The resource / crew availability implications of this option would need to be considered further.</p> <p>Option RO1b remove the Papa Stour rotation from the timetable and potentially free-up aircraft and crew flying hours.</p>
Financial:	<p>Annual revenue support would be in the region of £709k per annum, an increase of £281k per annum.</p> <p>The cost associated with running Papa Stour Airstrip in 2015/16 was budgeted at £4,600 so the savings here would be modest. The saving in flying hours would also be very low given the current timetable and there may be no net saving if the aircraft is deployed elsewhere during the time that it is currently serving Papa Stour.</p>
Public:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial feedback suggests that Option RO1a is acceptable to the Papa Stour population. • Initial feedback suggests that the withdrawal of the air services is not acceptable to the Papa Stour population.

STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	<p>Option RO1a - ✘</p> <p>Option RO1b - ✘</p>	<p>Option RO1a There would be a minor negative environmental impact associated with the increased sailing frequency</p> <p>Option RO1b As per Option RO1a, but with a very marginal reduction in emissions associated with the discontinuation of the air service.</p>
Safety:	<p>Option RO1a - ✘</p> <p>Option RO1b - ✔</p>	<p>Option RO1a Whilst this option would increase the number of sailing hours, we have not identified any major safety impacts. There could however be an increase in vehicle kilometres due to the doubling of the sailing frequency.</p> <p>Option RO1b As per Option RO1a. However, there is a safety benefit in that there would no longer be an air service flying into an unlicensed airfield with no fire cover.</p>
Economy:	<p>Option RO1a - ✔✔✔</p> <p>Option RO1b - ✔✔</p>	<p>Option RO1a There would be minor TEE benefits associated with this option associated with the increased frequency of the service and the addition of connections on days where there are currently no connections.</p> <p>There would be significant wider benefits associated with this option. These would include positive impacts for tourists, residents, shopping and locally traded services (including on Shetland West Mainland).</p> <p>Option RO1b As per Option RO1a, although the withdrawal of the air service would reduce the scale of the benefits by removing two return connections to Shetland Mainland.</p>
Integration:	<p>Option RO1a - ✔✔</p> <p>Option RO1b - ✔</p>	<p>Option RO1a This option would significantly enhance the transport integration of Papa Stour by permitting daily access to onward strategic transport connections (see TPO5 above). It would also support a range of policies aimed promoting the sustainability and economic development of the islands.</p> <p>Option RO1b</p>

		This option would offer the benefits of Option RO1a, although the withdrawal of the air service would reduce the number of connections offered and thus the overall transport integration impact.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	<p>Option RO1a - ✓✓✓</p> <p>Option RO1b - ✓✓</p>	<p>Option RO1a This option would represent a major improvement to the accessibility of Papa Stour residents, as well as for those travelling to the island. At present, a day return can only be made to the island on four days (three in winter), but this option would permit seven days-a-week access.</p> <p>Option RO1b As per Option RO1a, although the accessibility benefits are reduced by the loss of the air service.</p>