

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO2a – Increase the frequency of the service on days where there is a sailing to three return connections per day. Option RO2b – Option RO2a combined with the withdrawal of the Papa Stour air service.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	Option RO2a – The current timetable would be expanded to provide three return crossings on a Wednesday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday, where currently there are one or two. Option RO2b – Option RO2a but with the withdrawal of the air service to Papa Stour (two return flights on a Tuesday).	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £428k per annum
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £501k per annum
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	The island of Papa Stour lies to the north of Shetland West Mainland. The Papa Stour ferry departs from West Burrafirth on Shetland West Mainland and the crossing to the island takes around 40 minutes. The island can also be accessed by an air service from Tingwall airstrip.		

Social Context:	Papa Stour has the smallest population of the islands served by the Council inter-island transport network. The island has a population of 15 spread across nine households, There is a problem for landowners, who own property on the island but rarely live there as a result of poor connectivity and job opportunities. There is no fire cover within the island as well as no ambulance cover. There is one child in the primary school. There is no shop on the island, although there is a Post Office at the pier.
Economic Context:	The Papa Stour economy is almost wholly dependent on small scale crofting and a handful of public sector jobs. The cost of living is higher on Papa Stour than most other areas of Shetland due to the added expense of delivering materials, fuel, food and supplies. This often has a detrimental impact on the island and adds to the challenges for the local population. Access to services and social events is also highly restricted.
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The operation of a thrice daily return between West Burrafirth and Papa Stour on days where there are currently a connection would provide at least an additional one-direction 60 passenger spaces and 30 PCU spaces over the course of the week. Total one direction ferry capacity over the week would be 144 passenger spaces and 72 car spaces, a significant uplift on the currently available summer capacity (84 passenger spaces and 42 PCUs).</p> <p>Our analysis suggests that capacity is rarely a major issue in Papa Stour, although the 12 PC can be an issue during the summer tourist season. This issue is amplified by the low service frequency. Therefore, any option which increases capacity will have a positive impact against this objective. This is particularly the case where the additional capacity is concentrated on days where there is already a connection, therefore providing additional capacity for day-trippers.</p> <p>Option RO2b - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive There are two return flights between Papa Stour and Tingwall per week, both on a Tuesday. Whilst the removal of the air service would lead to a loss of up to 16 one-direction passenger seats per week, this would be somewhat offset by the increase in ferry provision (although that additional capacity is concentrated on different days – see TPO2b below).</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Not Applicable This objective is not considered relevant for Papa Stour.</p> <p>Option RO2b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Not Applicable This objective is not considered relevant for Papa Stour.</p>

facilitate commuting	
<p><i>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral The increase in ferry provision to three return connections four days per week could potentially extend the time available in Lerwick assuming the timetable was reworked to offer a full day or AM / PM half days. However, it would not provide 7-days a week connectivity.</p> <p>Option RO2b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Negative The withdrawal of the air service on a Tuesday would remove Papa Stour's connections on that day. This would reduce the number of days on which effective time could be spent on the mainland from five (under option RO2a) to four, which represents a negative contribution to this objective. There would also be a 'connectivity gap' between a Sunday evening and Wednesday morning.</p>
<p><i>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The addition of a third return sailing on the days where there is a connection would increase the overall frequency on those days and thus minimise the scheduled time between connections.</p> <p>Option RO2b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive As per Option RO2a, although Tuesday connectivity would be lost altogether.</p>
<p><i>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive This option would ensure a consistent timetable on days where there is a sailing, which compares with the current situation where there is only one return sailing on a Sunday and winter Saturday.</p> <p>Option RO2b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Negative The withdrawal of the air service would have a negative impact in that it would remove all of the connections on one day of the week (Tuesday), this increasing the variation within the timetable.</p>
<p><i>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</i></p>	<p>Option RO2a - Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The extension of the timetable to three sailings per day on a Sunday and winter Saturday would allow Papa Stour residents to connect with the Sunday evening NorthLink departure and flights without having to leave on the Saturday evening. A potential reworking of the timetable to extend the operating day may also improve access to strategic transport connections.</p> <p>Option RO2b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Negative As per Option RO2a, although strategic transport connectivity would be lost altogether on a Tuesday, meaning that Papa Stour residents could not travel off of Shetland mainland between Sunday evening and Wednesday morning without the need for an overnight stay.</p>

Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	<p>Option RO2a This option will not be retained for further consideration. This option only provides additional frequency on existing sailing days and there is little evidence that this is a priority issue for Papa Stour.</p> <p>Option RO2b This option will not be retained for further consideration as it is inferior to Option RO2a.</p>	
Implementability Appraisal		
Technical:	<p>There are no technical feasibility issues in relation to Option RO2a.</p> <p>The only technical issue surrounding Option RO2b is the fate of the Papa Stour airstrip, specifically whether this should be maintained in the longer-term.</p>	
Operational:	<p>Both Options RO2a and RO2b would require additional ferry crew / crewing hours. The resource / crew availability implications of this option would need to be considered further.</p> <p>Option RO2b removes the Papa Stour rotation from the timetable and potentially free-up aircraft and crew flying hours.</p>	
Financial:	<p>Annual revenue support would be in the region of £501k per annum, an increase of £73k per annum.</p> <p>The cost associated with running Papa Stour Airstrip in 2015/16 was budgeted at £4,600 so the savings here would be modest. The saving in flying hours would also be very low given the current timetable and there may be no net saving if the aircraft is deployed elsewhere during the time that it is currently serving Papa Stour.</p>	
Public:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Initial feedback suggests that Option RO2a is acceptable to the Papa Stour population. Initial feedback suggests that the withdrawal of the air services is not acceptable to the Papa Stour population. 	
STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	<p>Option RO2a - ✘</p> <p>Option RO2b - ✘</p>	<p>Option RO2a There would be a minor negative environmental impact associated with the increased sailing frequency</p> <p>Option RO2b As per Option R1a, but will a very marginal reduction in emissions associated with the discontinuation of the air service.</p>

Safety:	<p>Option RO2a - ✘</p> <p>Option RO2b - ✔</p>	<p>Option RO2a Whilst this option would increase the number of sailing hours, we have not identified any major safety impacts. There could however be an increase in vehicle kilometres due to the increased sailing frequency, although this would be less than would be the case under Options R1a and R1b.</p> <p>Option RO2b As per Option RO2a. However, there is a safety benefit in that there would no longer be an air service flying into an unlicensed airfield with no fire cover.</p>
Economy:	<p>Option RO2a - ✔✔</p> <p>Option RO2b - ✔</p>	<p>Option RO2a There would be minor TEE benefits associated with this option associated with the increased frequency and capacity of the service.</p> <p>There would be moderate (in the context of Papa Stour) wider benefits associated with this option. These would include positive impacts for tourists, residents, shopping and locally traded services (including on Shetland West Mainland).</p> <p>Option RO2b As per Option RO2a, although the withdrawal of the air service would effectively cut Papa Stour off from a Sunday evening to a Wednesday morning, significantly diluting the benefits of enhancing the ferry service on days where there is currently a connection.</p>
Integration:	<p>Option RO2a - ✔</p> <p>Option RO2b - ✘</p>	<p>Option RO2a The extension of the timetable to three sailings per day on a Sunday and winter Saturday would allow Papa Stour residents to connect with the winter Saturday / Sunday evening NorthLink departure and flights without having to leave on the Friday / Saturday evening. A potential reworking of the timetable to extend the operating day may also improve access to strategic transport connections.</p> <p>Option RO2b As per Option RO2a, although strategic transport connectivity would be lost altogether on a Tuesday, meaning that Papa Stour residents could not travel off of Shetland mainland between Sunday evening and Wednesday morning without the need for an overnight stay.</p>
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	<p>Option RO2a - ✔✔</p> <p>Option RO2b - ✔</p>	<p>Option RO2a This option would represent a moderate improvement to the accessibility of Papa Stour residents, as well as for those travelling to the island on days where there is currently a sailing.</p> <p>Option RO2b As per Option RO2a, although the accessibility benefits are reduced by the loss of the air service.</p>

		In particular, the connectivity gap which would emerge between a Sunday evening and Wednesday morning would be a significant disbenefit for the community.
--	--	--