

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option CO2 – Replace MV <i>Hendra</i> and MV <i>Linga</i> with two larger vessels	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	The MV <i>Hendra</i> and MV <i>Linga</i> would be replaced by two 45m TYPE 2 vessels.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £23.20 million.
	There would be a need for major harbour works at Laxo and Vidlin. To scale up to a TYPE 2 vessel, Laxo would require a new piled jetty, breakwater extension, a replacement linkspan and dredging.		<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.25m (rounded) per annum.
	The required works at Vidlin for a TYPE 2 vessel would include the replacement of the berthing structure & linkspan and the provision of a dedicated parking & waiting area.		<i>Annual revenue support</i> £2.32m (rounded) per annum.
	No harbour works would be immediately required at Symbister. However, the TYPE 2 vessels would be at the upper range of what the current Symbister Harbour could currently accommodate in terms of overall dimensions.		

Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	<p>The island of Whalsay, the most populous of the isles, lies to east of Shetland mainland. The largest settlement on the island is Symbister, which is also where the main harbour is located. As well as having a vibrant pelagic fishing fleet based in the island, the relatively short ferry crossing to Shetland mainland means that there is considerable commuting between the island and Lerwick & Sullom Voe.</p> <p>The island is connected to Shetland mainland via a ferry service between Symbister and Laxo, a sheltered voe on the east side of Shetland mainland. The Symbister – Laxo crossing is very exposed to south-easterly winds and thus a diversion port is maintained at Vidlin (also the destination for the Skerries ferry) to the north-east of Laxo. The timetable is designed with sufficient contingency to ensure that when the vessel diverts to Vidlin, there is no disruption to the timetable.</p>		
Social Context:	<p>Whalsay has a stable population, although islanders do have concerns that limited ferry capacity and a lack of affordable housing are causing out-migration amongst younger residents.</p> <p>Whalsay has one primary & junior high school and nursery, three shops (one of which incorporates the post office), a police station, care centre, health centre (with dental practice) and leisure centre. The Whalsay Learning Centre, operated by Shetland College, uses the clubroom in the leisure centre to deliver learning opportunities for the community. The island also has access to a weekly mobile banking service. Childcare provision is seen to be very limited and is seen as a constraint in terms of residents taking up jobs and / or further education. A small marina is located within Symbister harbour.</p> <p>Whilst school rolls have generally been in decline since the 1980s, there are promising signs for the island, with a doubling of the number of children in the nursery between 2013 and 2014.</p>		
Economic Context:	<p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economy, although it is quite dependent on the fishing industry for its economic wellbeing. The ability to commute off-island does however remain critical, particularly in terms of providing a diversified economy and there are concerns from the community that current capacity issues and fares are undermining this.</p> <p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economic activity rate, although there are a higher proportion of retirees amongst the population than on Shetland as a whole.</p>		
Planning Objectives			
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:		
TPO1: The capacity of the services should	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive		

<p>not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</p>	<p>The introduction of two larger vessels would increase capacity on the Whalsay route – each individual sailing could accommodate 4 (MV <i>Linga</i>) to 10 (MV <i>Hendra</i>) additional cars over and above the current vessels. This would alleviate the capacity peaks identified on this crossing (e.g. the 0630 and 0750 ex Symbister and the 1755 ex Laxo).</p>
<p>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive Whilst this option would not improve the ability to commute <i>per se</i>, it would assist in addressing occasions where a lack of capacity acts as a constraint and thus nullifies the benefit of the connection.</p>
<p>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not considered relevant for Whalsay.</p>
<p>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the frequency of the service.</p>
<p>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on the timetable.</p>
<p>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no impact on strategic connectivity.</p>
<p>Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:</p>	<p>This option will be retained for further consideration. Two larger vessels would provide significant additional capacity and this option should be considered further.</p>

Implementability Appraisal		
Technical:	<p>There would be a need for major harbour works at Laxo and Vidlin. To scale up to a TYPE 2 vessel, Laxo would require a new piled jetty, breakwater extension, a replacement linkspan and dredging.</p> <p>The required works at Vidlin for a TYPE 2 vessel would include the replacement of the berthing structure & linkspan and the provision of a dedicated parking & waiting area.</p> <p>No harbour works would be immediately required at Symbister. However, the TYPE 2 vessels would be at the upper range of what the current Symbister Harbour could currently accommodate in terms of overall dimensions.</p>	
Operational:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Higher crew training costs associated with moving to a higher certification vessel. • Crew induction training would be required • The MV <i>Linga</i> could be redeployed. 	
Financial:	The capital cost would be £23.20 million, with annual revenue support estimated at £2.32m, an increase of £700k per annum on the current day figure.	
Public:	Of those who commented on the ferry options, this option was supported. A fixed link is however identified as the preferred option of the community	
STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	✓	<p>The replacement of the ageing MV <i>Hendra</i> and MV <i>Linga</i> with more modern vessels gives rise to a potential reduction in emissions, although this could be offset to some extent by the use of larger vessels. There would be no other environmental constraints associated with this option.</p> <p>Environmental Constraints The environmental constraints for the Whalsay route are provided below for information (note – the constraints at Vidlin are listed in the Skerries ASTs).</p> <p>Symbister Constraints</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential properties in proximity to harbour • Scheduled monument and listed buildings within 200m • Coastal flooding risk • Good air quality <p>Laxo Constraints</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential properties within 150m of the harbour

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Laxo Burn SSSI within 1km of terminal • Coastal flooding risk • Good air quality
Safety:	✓	The MV <i>Hendra</i> has passenger accommodation below the waterline. Regulations require that any new tonnage has passenger accommodation above the waterline, and thus there would be a minor safety benefit associated with this option.
Economy:	✓	<p>The provision of two larger vessels would assist in alleviating the vehicle capacity issues identified on the Whalsay route. This would give rise to minor TEE benefits, where residents can now travel on a ferry they could not previously travel on.</p> <p>The additional capacity would also give rise to minor wider / EALI benefits for residents, locally traded services and tourism. Moreover, two larger and modern vessels would improve the perception of Whalsay as a place to live, work and do business.</p>
Integration:	✓	This option would have a positive impact in terms of policy integration, in that it contributes positively to enhanced disabled access.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓	<p>The provision of two larger ferries would improve community accessibility through reducing the capacity issues identified on the Whalsay route.</p> <p>This option would also support enhanced disabled access to the Whalsay services currently operated by the MV <i>Hendra</i>, helping to tackle the issue of social exclusion experienced by this group.</p>