

## Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:  (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, <a href="mailto:michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk">michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk</a>  Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO1 – On-request early morning departure from Whalsay.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	This option involves the operation of a 0500 return on-request departure from Symbister to Laxo (Vidlin in inclement weather) Monday to Friday, thus allowing connection with the first morning flights from Sumburgh.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00 million.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.25m (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £2.37m (rounded) per annum.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	<p>The island of Whalsay, the most populous of the isles, lies to east of Shetland mainland. The largest settlement on the island is Symbister, which is also where the main harbour is located. As well as having a vibrant pelagic fishing fleet based in the island, the relatively short ferry crossing to Shetland mainland means that there is considerable commuting between the island and Lerwick &amp; Sullom Voe.</p> <p>The island is connected to Shetland mainland via a ferry service between Symbister and Laxo, a sheltered voe on the east side of Shetland mainland. The Symbister – Laxo crossing is very exposed to south-easterly winds and thus a diversion port is maintained at Vidlin (also the destination for the Skerries ferry) to the north-east of Laxo. The timetable is designed with sufficient contingency to ensure that when the vessel diverts to Vidlin, there is no disruption to the timetable.</p>		

Social Context:	<p>Whalsay has a stable population, although islanders do have concerns that limited ferry capacity and a lack of affordable housing are causing out-migration amongst younger residents.</p> <p>Whalsay has one primary &amp; junior high school and nursery, three shops (one of which incorporates the post office), a police station, care centre, health centre (with dental practice) and leisure centre. The Whalsay Learning Centre, operated by Shetland College, uses the clubroom in the leisure centre to deliver learning opportunities for the community. The island also has access to a weekly mobile banking service. Childcare provision is seen to be very limited and is seen as a constraint in terms of residents taking up jobs and / or further education. A small marina is located within Symbister harbour.</p> <p>Whilst school rolls have generally been in decline since the 1980s, there are promising signs for the island, with a doubling of the number of children in the nursery between 2013 and 2014.</p>
Economic Context:	<p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economy, although it is quite dependent on the fishing industry for its economic wellbeing. The ability to commute off-island does however remain critical, particularly in terms of providing a diversified economy and there are concerns from the community that current capacity issues and fares are undermining this.</p> <p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economic activity rate, although there are a higher proportion of retirees amongst the population than on Shetland as a whole.</p>
<b>Planning Objectives</b>	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b></p> <p>This option would offer additional capacity in the sense that it would provide a sailing at a time when there is currently not a connection. However, it would not address a specific capacity problem and thus the impact in terms of this objective is neutral.</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</i></p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b></p> <p>This option would have no impact on the ability to commute – the first ferry departs Symbister at 0630 every day which already facilitates commuting.</p>
<p><i>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main</i></p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b></p> <p>This option is not considered applicable to Whalsay.</p>

<p>employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</p>			
<p>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b>  An early morning on-request service would extend the length of the operating day by adding an additional morning connection into the timetable. However, the contribution to this objective would be very minor overall.</p>		
<p>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b>  This option would have no positive impact on timetable variation.</p>		
<p>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</p>	<p><b>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive</b>  This option of an early morning request sailing from Whalsay would contribute significantly to this objective. An 0500 departure from Symbister would allow Whalsay residents to catch the first morning flights to Aberdeen, Edinburgh and Inverness. This in turn would allow the residents of Whalsay to make a day return trip to the Scottish mainland, removing the need for an off-island overnight stay.</p>		
<p>Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:</p>	<p>This option will be retained for further consideration. This is a relatively low cost option which could meet a specific requirement for early connections to Sumburgh from the island. The crewing issues surrounding this should be considered further.</p>		
<p><b>Implementability Appraisal</b></p>			
<p>Technical:</p>	<p>There are no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.</p>		
<p>Operational:</p>	<p>There would be no operational issues associated with this option, although crew overtime and additional fuel would be required (see below).</p>		
<p>Financial:</p>	<p>This option would cost increase operating costs to £2.37m per annum, an increase of £120k per annum on the current situation.</p>		
<p>Public:</p>	<p>No opposition to any of the revenue options was expressed during the public consultation.</p>		
<p><b>STAG Criteria</b></p>			
<p><b>Criterion</b></p>	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Assessment Summary</th> <th>Supporting Information</th> </tr> </thead> </table>	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Assessment Summary	Supporting Information		

Environment:	x	There would be a very minor environmental disbenefit associated with the additional sailing hours.
Safety:	x	There would be a small negative safety impact associated with this option. Whilst this option would not necessarily generate additional road kilometres, it may displace trips to the early hours of the morning, which could be an issue in winter if people are travelling in the dark and / or before the roads are treated.
Economy:	✓	<p>The principal economic benefit of this option is that it would allow Whalsay residents to make a day return trip the Scottish mainland. This would potentially give rise to small TEE and wider / EALI benefits for Whalsay, although there would be a small loss for Shetland mainland hoteliers.</p> <p>There would be a direct financial benefit for the NHS. Whalsay patients would be able to make a day return to Aberdeen for hospital appointments, thus eliminating the overnight accommodation costs which the NHS currently has to fund.</p>
Integration:	✓✓	This option would significantly enhance transport integration (see TPO5).
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓	There would be a minor positive in terms of community accessibility, with Whalsay residents able to both access the Scottish mainland relatively early in the morning and make a day return trip.