

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO3 – Operate standard weekday timetable seven days per week.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	<p>At present the Whalsay route is operated by a 'day boat' and a 'shift boat' Monday – Friday. This provides 17 (plus 1 request) connections on Tuesday, Thursday & Friday and 16+1 on a Monday and Wednesday due to scheduled maintenance.</p> <p>The weekend service is only run by the shift vessel, reducing connections to 10 (+1) on a Saturday and Sunday.</p> <p>This proposal would involve running the weekday timetable seven days per week.</p>	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00 million.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.25m (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £2.51m (rounded) per annum.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	The island of Whalsay, the most populous of the isles, lies to east of Shetland mainland. The largest settlement on the island is Symbister, which is also where the main harbour is located. As well as having a vibrant pelagic fishing fleet based in the island, the relatively short ferry crossing to Shetland mainland means that there is considerable commuting between the island and Lerwick & Sullom Voe.		

	<p>The island is connected to Shetland mainland via a ferry service between Symbister and Laxo, a sheltered voe on the east side of Shetland mainland. The Symbister – Laxo crossing is very exposed to south-easterly winds and thus a diversion port is maintained at Vidlin (also the destination for the Skerries ferry) to the north-east of Laxo. The timetable is designed with sufficient contingency to ensure that when the vessel diverts to Vidlin, there is no disruption to the timetable.</p>
Social Context:	<p>Whalsay has a stable population, although islanders do have concerns that limited ferry capacity and a lack of affordable housing are causing out-migration amongst younger residents.</p> <p>Whalsay has one junior high school and nursery, three shops (one of which incorporates the post office), a police station, care centre, health centre (with dental practice) and leisure centre. The Whalsay Learning Centre, operated by Shetland College, uses the clubroom in the leisure centre to deliver learning opportunities for the community. The island also has access to a weekly mobile banking service. Childcare provision is seen to be very limited and is seen to be a constraint in terms of residents taking up jobs and / or further education. A small marina is located within Symbister harbour.</p> <p>Whilst school rolls have generally been in decline since the 1980s, there are promising signs for the island, with a doubling of the number of children in the nursery between 2013 and 2014.</p>
Economic Context:	<p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economy, although it is quite dependent on the fishing industry for its economic wellbeing. The ability to commute off-island does however remain critical, particularly in terms of providing a diversified economy and there are concerns from the community that current capacity issues and fares are undermining this.</p> <p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economic activity rate, although there are a higher proportion of retirees amongst the population than on Shetland as a whole.</p>
Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive</p> <p>This option would significantly enhance the available capacity on the Whalsay route at the weekend. The carryings analysis identified capacity issues on the 0915 and 1115 ex Symbister on a Saturday and Sunday (summer and winter) which this option would alleviate.</p>
<i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably</i>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</p> <p>This option would have no impact on the ability to commute on weekdays, although it would increase the AM and PM peak frequency for weekend commuters.</p>

<i>facilitate commuting</i>	
<i>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This objective is not considered applicable to Whalsay.
<i>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive The option of running the weekday timetable seven days a week would make a moderate contribution to this objective by increasing the weekend service frequency to a level commensurate with weekdays.
<i>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive This option would equalise the level of connectivity across every day of the week, providing consistency on Whalsay services.
<i>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</i>	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive This option would enhance the weekend service frequency, facilitating generally better connectivity with strategic transport connections.
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	This option is retained for further consideration. This option would largely reverse the 2013 service revisions by re-instating the 7-day operation of the second vessel. This option should be considered further in relation to the costs and benefits of this option. Historic carryings data could be used to determine the impact of the service changes and hence the likely increase if these changes were reversed.
Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	There are no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.
Operational:	There would be no operational issues associated with this option, although additional crew and fuel would be required (see below).
Financial:	This option would increase operating costs to £2.51m per annum, an increase of £263k per annum on the current situation.
Public:	No opposition to any of the revenue options was expressed during the public consultation.

STAG Criteria		
Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	xx	There would be a moderate environmental disbenefit associated with the additional sailing hours and the likely additional vehicle kilometres generated.
Safety:	x	The increase in service frequency at weekends is likely to generate additional vehicle kilometres, which would have a negative safety impact. However, any impact would be very minor.
Economy:	✓	<p>There would be relatively minor wider / EALI benefits associated with this option. Whilst the length of the operating day would remain the same, the increased number of connections could have benefits for residents, tourists and locally traded services.</p> <p>A increased weekend operating frequency would also reduce the economic disadvantage of living on an island and could promote population retention and growth.</p>
Integration:	✓	The increased frequency at the weekend would support improved transport connectivity through offering improved connections throughout the day.
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓✓	<p>The operation of the weekday timetable at the weekend would significantly enhance community accessibility, providing seven additional connections to Shetland mainland on each of Saturday and Sunday.</p> <p>It would also improve the comparative accessibility of the island, bringing it closer into line with communities on Shetland Mainland.</p>