

## Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal:  (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, <a href="mailto:michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk">michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk</a>  Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO4a – Run both vessels for the full operating day, <b>seven</b> days a week.  Option RO4b – Run both vessels for the full operating day, <b>five</b> days a week.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	At present the Whalsay route is operated by a 'day boat' and a 'shift boat' Monday – Friday. This provides 17 (plus 1 request) connections on Tuesday, Thursday & Friday and 16+1 on a Monday and Wednesday due to scheduled maintenance.  Option RO4a would involve running both vessels for the full operating day. This would increase total connections to 21 per day, seven days a week.  Option RO4b is a variation on the above, offering 21 connections per day Monday – Friday (potentially less on a Monday & Wednesday due to maintenance) and the current weekend timetable.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00 million.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.25m (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• RO4a: £2.93m (rounded) per annum.</li> <li>• RO4b: £2.60m (rounded) per annum.</li> </ul>

Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
<b>Background Information</b>			
Geographic Context:	<p>The island of Whalsay, the most populous of the isles, lies to east of Shetland mainland. The largest settlement on the island is Symbister, which is also where the main harbour is located. As well as having a vibrant pelagic fishing fleet based in the island, the relatively short ferry crossing to Shetland mainland means that there is considerable commuting between the island and Lerwick &amp; Sullom Voe.</p> <p>The island is connected to Shetland mainland via a ferry service between Symbister and Laxo, a sheltered voe on the east side of Shetland mainland. The Symbister – Laxo crossing is very exposed to south-easterly winds and thus a diversion port is maintained at Vidlin (also the destination for the Skerries ferry) to the north-east of Laxo. The timetable is designed with sufficient contingency to ensure that when the vessel diverts to Vidlin, there is no disruption to the timetable.</p>		
Social Context:	<p>Whalsay has a stable population, although islanders do have concerns that limited ferry capacity and a lack of affordable housing are causing out-migration amongst younger residents.</p> <p>Whalsay has one primary &amp; junior high school and nursery, three shops (one of which incorporates the post office), a police station, care centre, health centre (with dental practice) and leisure centre. The Whalsay Learning Centre, operated by Shetland College, uses the clubroom in the leisure centre to deliver learning opportunities for the community. The island also has access to a weekly mobile banking service. Childcare provision is seen to be very limited and is seen as a constraint in terms of residents taking up jobs and / or further education. A small marina is located within Symbister harbour.</p> <p>Whilst school rolls have generally been in decline since the 1980s, there are promising signs for the island, with a doubling of the number of children in the nursery between 2013 and 2014.</p>		
Economic Context:	<p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economy, although it is quite dependent on the fishing industry for its economic wellbeing. The ability to commute off-island does however remain critical, particularly in terms of providing a diversified economy and there are concerns from the community that current capacity issues and fares are undermining this.</p> <p>Whalsay has a relatively healthy economic activity rate, although there are a higher proportion of retirees amongst the population than on Shetland as a whole.</p>		
<b>Planning Objectives</b>			
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:		
TPO1: The capacity of the services should	<b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive</b>		

<p>not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</p>	<p>The provision of additional capacity on a weekday may alleviate occasional capacity issues but any such impact would be minor as the majority of the capacity constrained sailings occur when both vessels are operating.</p> <p>This option would significantly enhance the available capacity on the Whalsay route at the weekend. The carryings analysis identified capacity issues on the 0915 and 1115 ex Symbister on a Saturday and Sunday (summer and winter) which this option would alleviate.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> As per paragraph 1 above.</p>
<p>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably facilitate commuting</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> This option would increase AM and PM frequency for weekend commuters and better support shift works on weekday evenings</p> <p><b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> This option would better support shift works on weekday evenings</p>
<p>TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b> This option is not considered applicable to Whalsay.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b> This option is not considered applicable to Whalsay.</p>
<p>TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive</b> The option of running both vessels for the full operating day seven days a week would make a major contribution to this objective by significantly increasing the overall level of service (up to 21 return crossings per day). This compares to the current 16/17(+1) on a typical weekday and 10(+1) on a Saturday and Sunday.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Moderate Positive</b> The option of running both vessels for the full operating day five days a week would make a moderate contribution to this objective by significantly increasing the overall level of service (up to 21 return crossings per day). This compares to the current 16/17(+1) on a typical weekday.</p>
<p>TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive</b> This option would equalise the level of connectivity across every day of the week, providing consistency on Whalsay services.</p>

	<b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</b> This option would not have any impact on this objective.	
<i>TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.</i>	<b>Option RO4a: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> This option would enhance the overall service frequency, facilitating generally better connectivity with strategic transport connections.	
	<b>Option RO4b: Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive</b> This option would enhance the overall service frequency, facilitating generally better connectivity with strategic transport connections.	
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	<p><b>Option RO4a</b> This option will not be retained for further consideration. This option represents the maximum level of service with 2-vessels, with both ferries running a 16-18 hour operating day 7-days per week. This level of service would seem excessive during off-peak periods, particularly if there are larger capacity vessels deployed on the route</p> <p><b>Option RO4b</b> This option will be retained for further consideration. This option would provide a 16-18-hour 2-vessel service on weekdays providing increased capacity and frequency during the evening. The potential demand for this should be explored further.</p>	
<b>Implementability Appraisal</b>		
Technical:	There are no technical feasibility issues with either Option RO4a or RO4b.	
Operational:	There would be no operational issues associated with either Option RO4a or RO4b, although additional crew and fuel would be required (see below), particularly for Option RO4a, which represents a significant step change to the current level of service.	
Financial:	<p>Option RO4a would increase operating costs to £2.93m per annum, an increase of £684k per annum on the current situation.</p> <p>Option RO4b would increase operating costs to £2.60m per annum, an increase of £354k per annum on the current situation.</p>	
Public:	No opposition to any of the revenue options was expressed during the public consultation. The increase in frequency offered by these options is likely to be widely welcomed.	
<b>STAG Criteria</b>		
<b>Criterion</b>	<b>Assessment Summary</b>	<b>Supporting Information</b>

Environment:	<p><b>Option RO4a - xx</b></p> <p><b>Option RO4b - xx</b></p>	<p><b>Option RO4a</b> There would be a moderate environmental disbenefit associated with the additional sailing hours and the likely additional vehicle kilometres generated.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b</b> There would be a moderate environmental disbenefit associated with the additional sailing hours and the likely additional vehicle kilometres generated.</p>
Safety:	<p><b>Option RO4a - x</b></p> <p><b>Option RO4b - x</b></p>	<p><b>Option RO4a</b> The increase in service frequency is likely to generate additional vehicle kilometres, which would have a negative safety impact. However, any impact would be very minor.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b</b> The increase in service frequency is likely to generate additional vehicle kilometres, which would have a negative safety impact. However, any impact would be very minor.</p>
Economy:	<p><b>Option RO4a - ✓✓✓</b></p> <p><b>Option RO4b - ✓✓</b></p>	<p><b>Option RO4a</b> There would be relatively major wider / EALI benefits associated with this option. Whilst the overall length of the operating day would remain the same, the number of connections over the length of that day would increase significantly. This would give rise to significant benefits for residents, tourists and locally traded services.</p> <p>A high frequency 7-day a week, (approximately) 17 hours operating day would also reduce the economic disadvantage of living on an island and could promote population retention and growth.</p> <p>The increased ferry frequency would also give rise to significant TEE benefits through doubling the frequency of the service at times when the 'day boat' does not currently operate.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b</b> The nature of the benefits of this option to the Economy criterion would be the same as for Option RO4a, although of a slightly lesser magnitude given the five day as opposed to seven day nature of this option.</p>
Integration:	<p><b>Option RO4a - ✓✓</b></p> <p><b>Option RO4b - ✓✓</b></p>	<p><b>Option RO4a</b> The increased frequency on weekdays and at the weekend would support improved transport connectivity through offering improved connections throughout the day, in the evening and over the weekend.</p> <p>This option would also support a wide range of policies intended to promote and sustain the island.</p>

		<p><b>Option RO4b</b>  The increased frequency on weekdays would support improved transport connectivity through offering improved connections.</p> <p>This option would also support a wide range of policies intended to promote and sustain the island.</p>
<p>Accessibility and Social Inclusion:</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a -</b>  ✓✓✓</p> <p><b>Option RO4b -</b> ✓✓</p>	<p><b>Option RO4a</b>  The operation of the two vessels for the full operating day, seven days a week, would significantly enhance community accessibility, providing numerous additional connections to Shetland mainland over the week.</p> <p>It would also improve the comparative accessibility of the island, bringing it closer into line with communities on Shetland Mainland.</p> <p><b>Option RO4b</b>  The nature of the benefits of this option to the Accessibility &amp; Social Inclusion criterion would be the same as for Option RO4a, although of a slightly lesser magnitude given the five day as opposed to seven day nature of this option.</p>