

Part 1 Appraisal Summary Tables

Proposal Details			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Mr Michael Craigie, 01595 744 160, michael.craigie@shetland.gov.uk Shetland Islands Council, Development Service, Transport Planning Service, 6 North Ness, Lerwick, Shetland, ZE1 0LZ	
Proposal Name:	Option RO1: Offer an on-request early departure from Yell, Monday to Friday, which would allow connection with the first flights from Sumburgh.	Name of Planner:	Stephen Canning, Peter Brett Associates
Proposal Description:	This option involves the operation of a 0500 request return crossing from Ulsta on Yell, thus allowing connection with the first morning flights from Sumburgh.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	<i>Capital costs/grant</i> £0.00 million.
			<i>Current revenue support</i> £2.27m (rounded) per annum.
			<i>Annual revenue support</i> £2.22m (rounded) per annum, based on new tonnage identified in Option CO1.
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Transport Scotland	Amount of Application:	<i>Present Value of Cost to Govt.</i> Costs in this study are all reported in 2016 prices only. The costs would reflect those set out above.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	<p>The island of Yell is situated between the north of Shetland mainland and the islands of Unst and Fetlar. The island is separated from Shetland Mainland by a narrow strait of water known as Yell Sound. The majority of the settlements on Yell are in the north and east the island.</p> <p>The ferry from the island to Shetland mainland operates from Ulsta (to Toft), a very small settlement on the south-west coast of the island. The larger settlements on Yell, such as Mid Yell and Cullivoe tend to be located in the east and north of the island, meaning that an onward car or public transport connection is typically required from Ulsta.</p>		

<p>Social Context:</p>	<p>Yell is the second most populous of the isles, with a population of around 1,000. The island has a relatively stable population, supported by good access to job opportunities and local services. However, forecasts suggest that the population will decline in the years ahead. In addition, whilst Yell has a stable population, it is also an ageing one, which is reflected in the proportionally lower economic activity rate and higher number of retirees relative to the Shetland Islands generally.</p> <p>Health provision on the island is of a high quality, whilst there are stable rolls at the island nursery, the two primary schools and the Junior High. The island also has a high level of community cohesion, with a very active third sector on the island.</p>
<p>Economic Context:</p>	<p>The Yell economy is relatively healthy, with a number of indigenous businesses in the valuable aquaculture sector, good commuting opportunities and a strong public sector presence (in terms of both direct jobs and as a facilitator of other opportunities).</p> <p>Yell has very high levels of household car ownership and a significant proportion of its residents travel in a car to work. This reflects the importance of commuting to the island, particularly to Sullom Voe and Lerwick. The amount of people working from home has increased in recent years.</p> <p>The availability of housing on Yell and the North Isles generally is seen to constrain the growth of the community.</p> <p>Overall, Yell is in a relatively favourable position overall, with a stable population, reasonable industrial mix and good connectivity. Maintaining and potentially improving this level of connectivity in years to come will be of importance to the island.</p>
<p>Planning Objectives</p>	
<p>Objective:</p>	<p>Performance against planning objective:</p>
<p><i>TPO1: The capacity of the services should not act as a constraint to regular and essential personal, vehicular and freight travel between the island(s) and Shetland Mainland</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>This option would offer additional capacity in the sense that it would provide a sailing a time when there is currently not a connection. However, it would not address a specific capacity problem and thus the impact in terms of this objective is neutral.</p>
<p><i>TPO2a: Where an island has a 'commutable' combined ferry or drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably</i></p>	<p>Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral</p> <p>This option would have no impact on the ability to commute – the first ferry departs Ulsta 0615 on a weekday, which already facilitates commuting.</p>

facilitate commuting	
TPO2b: Where an island does not have a 'commutable' combined ferry or air / drive / public transport / walk time to a main employment centre (e.g. 80 minutes), the connections provided should reliably permit at least a half day (e.g. 4 hours) in Lerwick 7 days a week, all year round.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option is not considered applicable to Yell.
TPO3: The scheduled time between connections should be minimised to increase flexibility for passengers and freight by maximising the number of island connections across the operating day.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Minor Positive An early morning on-request service would extend the length of the operating day by adding an additional morning connection into the timetable. However, the contribution to this objective would be very minor overall.
TPO4: The level of connectivity provided should minimise the variation within and between weekdays, evenings, Saturdays and Sundays.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Neutral This option would have no positive impact on timetable variation.
TPO5: Where practicable, islanders should be provided with links to strategic onward transport connections without the need for an overnight stay on Shetland mainland.	Performance against Transport Planning Objective: Major Positive This option of an early morning request sailing from Yell would contribute significantly to this objective. An 0500 departure from Ulsta would allow Yell residents to catch the first morning flights to Aberdeen, Edinburgh and Inverness. This in turn would allow the residents of Yell to make a day return trip to the Scottish mainland, removing the need for an off-island overnight stay.
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	This option will be retained for further consideration. The benefits of being able to make a day-return trip from Yell to the Scottish mainland would be of significant benefit to Yell residents, particularly when set against the relatively low costs of this option.
Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	There are no technical feasibility issues associated with this option.
Operational:	There would be no operational issues associated with this option, although additional crew hours and fuel would be required.
Financial:	Minor reduction from the present day based on capital Option CO1.
Public:	No opposition to any of the revenue options was expressed during the public consultation.
STAG Criteria	

Criterion	Assessment Summary	Supporting Information
Environment:	x	Whilst there would be additional sailing hours leading to a small increase in emissions, any such impact is likely to be extremely limited in the wider context of the Yell Sound route.
Safety:	x	There would be a small negative safety impact associated with this option. Whilst this option would not necessarily generate additional road kilometres, it may displace trips to the early hours of the morning, which could be an issue in winter if people are travelling in the dark and / or before the roads are treated.
Economy:	✓	<p>The principal economic benefit of this option is that it would allow Yell residents to make a day return trip to the Scottish mainland. This would potentially give rise to small economic benefits for Yell, although there would be a small loss for Shetland mainland hoteliers.</p> <p>There would be a direct financial benefit for the NHS. Yell patients would be able to make a day return to Aberdeen for hospital appointments, thus eliminating the overnight accommodation costs which the NHS currently has to fund (although the length of the day may be an issue for sick / elderly people travelling for hospital appointments).</p>
Integration:	✓✓	This option would significantly enhance transport integration (see TPO5).
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	✓	There would be a minor positive in terms of community accessibility, with Yell residents able to both access the Scottish mainland relatively early in the morning and make a day return trip.