

Appraisal Summary Table

Date produced: 22 6 22

Contact:

Name of scheme:	Fair Isle Ferry Replacement Project	Name	Lee Coutts
Description of scheme:	Procurement of a new Ro-Ro ferry for the island of Fair Isle, together with supporting ferry terminal infrastructure at both North Haven (Fair Isle) and Grutness (Shetland Mainland)	Organisation	Shetland Islands Council
		Role	Officer

Impacts	Summary of key impacts	Assessment						
		Quantitative			Qualitative	Monetary	Distributional	
		Value of journey time changes(£)			Large beneficial	£(NPV)	7-pt scale/ vulnerable grp	
Economy	Business users & transport providers Businesses - including Shetland Islands Council and utilities providers - will benefit from reduced supply-chain costs; greater supply-chain efficiency; and reduced inventory. Services such as on-island maintenance of the electricity system, house building / refurbishment etc will be easier, less costly and can be delivered more efficiently.	Value of journey time changes(£)		N/A				Large beneficial
		Net journey time changes (£)						
		0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min				
		N/A	N/A	N/A				
	Reliability impact on Business users	Businesses will be able to plan more effectively around the import (e.g. building materials) and export (e.g. livestock going into the UK supply-chain) more reliably. Tourism related businesses will benefit from increased certainty of travel for customers / customer luggage.			Large beneficial	N/A		
	Regeneration	The replacement of the Fair Isle ferry goes beyond regeneration, it is about the future sustainability of Fair Isle as a community. A new ferry may also support the rebuilding of the Fair Isle Bird Observatory (lost to fire in 2019), the main tourist attraction, accommodation provider and scientific institution on the island.			Large beneficial	N/A		
	Wider Impacts	Population retention / growth (the crucial impact of the project); career path / development / progression for future island residents working on the vessel; reduced cost of moving goods to and from the island and maintenance of on-island assets; increased house building / refurbishment; efficiencies in service delivery (e.g. health care provision); increased tourism; and reduction in tourist bed nights lost as a result of transport-related disruption.			Large beneficial	N/A		
Environmental	Noise	Negative short-term noise impacts during the construction period, but mitigated through consenting process. No long-term impact.			Moderate adverse, but short-term associated with construction works	N/A	Neutral	
	Air Quality	Negative short-term air quality impacts during the construction period (e.g. dust), but mitigated through consenting process. No long-term impact.			Slight adverse, but short-term associated with construction works	N/A	Neutral	
	Greenhouse gases	Minor benefit associated with a new 'green' propulsion system replacing the current diesel vessel. However, impact will be minor given the small size and relatively low emissions of MV <i>Good Shepherd IV</i> .		N/A	Slight beneficial	N/A		
	Change in non-traded carbon over 60y (CO2e)		N/A					
	Change in traded carbon over 60y (CO2e)		N/A					
	Landscape	No impact			Neutral	N/A		
	Townscape	No impact			Neutral	N/A		
Historic Environment	No impact			Neutral	N/A			
Biodiversity	Negative short-term biodiversity impacts during the construction period, particularly on bird and marine life - this will however be fully managed through the consenting process. No long-term impact.			Moderate adverse, but short-term associated with construction works	N/A			
Water Environment	Negative short-term water impacts during the construction period, but mitigated through consenting process. No long-term impact.			Moderate adverse, but short-term associated with construction works	N/A			
Social	Commuting and Other users	Value of journey time changes(£)		N/A	Large beneficial	N/A	Large beneficial	
		Net journey time changes (£)						
		0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min				
		N/A	N/A	N/A				
		Reliability impact on Commuting and Other users	Improved reliability through reduced journey times and Ro-Ro operation, which will allow the service to work in tighter weather windows.			Large beneficial	N/A	
		Physical activity	Neutral			Neutral	N/A	
		Journey quality	Major improvement on quality of current vessel in terms of comfort, amenity and journey time.			Large beneficial	N/A	
		Accidents	Major impact - as well as meeting all modern standards, the new vessel would address the risks associated with crane-based operation in terms of vessel stability and the movement of goods from a moving vessel to the quayside. Moreover, the risks associated with passenger access would be addressed through allowing step-free access to the vessel via the linkspan.			Large beneficial	N/A	Large beneficial
		Security	Neutral			Neutral	N/A	Neutral
	Access to services	Almost all services for Fair Isle residents are on mainland - e.g. shops, hospitals, secondary education etc. Improved service would offer significantly improved access to these services. It would also allow children boarding at Anderson High School in Lerwick to return to Fair Isle more frequently - this is again important in promoting population retention.			Large beneficial	N/A	Large beneficial	
	Affordability	Ro-Ro operation would fundamentally change the nature of the island supply-chain, reducing the additional costs to residents and businesses associated with the current crane-based operation and unreliable service.			Large beneficial	N/A	Large beneficial	
	Severance	Major improvement in terms of access to the vessel for groups who currently struggle to use the service, e.g. older people and the disabled. A new and more reliable vessel would also allow the ferry timetable to be more easily delivered and may allow for additional sailings, reducing severance from Shetland mainland (there were 221 days in 2017 where Fair Isle had no transport connection at all).			Large beneficial	N/A	Large beneficial	
	Option and non-use	N/A			Large beneficial	N/A		
Public Account	Cost to Broad Transport Budget	There is no practical do nothing option in this context, so this is largely unavoidable expenditure.			Neutral	£24.8m		
	Indirect Tax Revenues	No impact			Neutral	Negligible		